

FINAL

2000/01

TRANSIT SYSTEMS

MANAGEMENT REPORT

FOR THE FISCAL YEAR 2000-01

**Stanislaus Council of Governments
900 H Street, Suite D
Modesto, California 95354
(209) 558-7830**

October 2002

STANISLAUS COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS

POLICY BOARD

City of Ceres	Andy Constantinou
City of Hughson	Bart Conner
City of Modesto	Tim Fisher
City of Modesto	Carmen Sabatino
City of Modesto	Bruce Frohman
City of Newman	Tom Applegate
City of Oakdale	Phil Rockey
City of Patterson	Kathy Wright
City of Riverbank	Curtis Lineberger
City of Turlock	Bill Wallen
City of Waterford	Charles Turner
Stanislaus County	Nick W. Blom
Stanislaus County	Paul Caruso
Stanislaus County	Raymond C. Simon
Stanislaus County	Tom Mayfield
Stanislaus County	Pat Paul
Caltrans (Ex-Officio)	Dana Cowell District 10

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE

City of Ceres	Tim Kerr
City of Hughson	Bob Wilburn
City of Modesto	Jack R. Crist
City of Newman	W. Cleve Morris
City of Oakdale	Bruce Bannerman
City of Patterson	George Lambert
City of Riverbank	Richard Holmer
City of Turlock	Steven Kyte
City of Waterford	Charles Deschenes
Stanislaus County	Reagan Wilson
Caltrans	Carlos Yamzon

CITIZENS COMMITTEE

Dwight H. Bateman
Mary Anne Boone
Warren Brumley
Greg Dugovic
Barbara Eniti
Jeni Ferrari
Greg Gaudio
Cindy Gipp
Carl Henderson
Sam Jackson
Ed Maring
Garry Rupe
Mary Schatz
Jeni Smith
Andrew VanAllen

SOCIAL SERVICES TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COUNCIL

Disabled	Dwight Bateman
60 + Years	Rusty Boyle
SS Trans. Provider- for Disabled	Charlie Hayes
Member at Large	Toni Hector
SS Trans. Provider- for Persons of Limited Means	Sysvanh Kabkeo
SS Trans. Provider- for Disabled	Claudia Miller

SS= Social Services

StanCOG STAFF

Executive Director	Gary Dickson
Deputy Director	vacant
Senior Regional Planner	Lark Downs
Associate Planner	Vince Angelino
Associate Planner	Chip Sellers
Associate Planner	Toby Shafer
Assistant Planner	vacant
Planning Tech II	Cornelius Harris
Assistant Planner	Joshua Mann
Budget/Grants Administrator	Robin Whitehead
Office Manager	CJ Johnson
Accounting Assistant	Nayka M. Phillips
Admin Assistant	Terri Estes
Admin Assistant	vacant

Public Information Consultant
Wong & Murray – Public Relations
(925) 932 – 6050

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
DESCRIPTIONS OF LOCAL TRANSIT SYSTEMS	
CITY OF CERES TRANSIT SYSTEM.....	1
CITY OF MODESTO TRANSIT SYSTEM	11
RIVERBANK-OAKDALE TRANSIT AUTHORITY TRANSIT SYSTEM	29
STANISLAUS REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM.....	39
CITY OF TURLOCK TRANSIT SYSTEM	65
CITY OF WATERFORD TRANSIT SYSTEM.....	77
PUBLIC TRANSIT IN OTHER CITIES	85
OTHER TRANSIT SERVICES OPERATING IN STANISLAUS COUNTY	87
APPENDIX	
A - REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN GOALS AND OBJECTIVES.....	A

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The 2000-01 Transit Systems Management Report (TSMR) provides a review of the six transit operators which were present in Stanislaus County in the 2000-01 fiscal year. Those six operators were:

- 1) The City of Ceres, operator of Ceres Dial-A-Ride
- 2) The City of Modesto, operator of Modesto Area Express (MAX) and of the Modesto Dial-A-Ride
- 3) The Cities of Riverbank and Oakdale, who together operate the Riverbank-Oakdale Transit Authority (ROTA) Dial-A-Ride
- 4) Stanislaus Regional Transit (StaRT), operator of three Fixed Routes and five dial-a-ride services
- 5) The City of Turlock, operator of the Bus Line Service of Turlock (BLAST) and of the Dial A Ride Turlock (DART) services
- 6) The City of Waterford, operator of Waterford Dial-A-Ride

A chapter is written for each of those operators. The chapters open with general information about the operations, information which could be useful for a potential passenger. That is followed with a summary of the success of the operation in satisfying the Transit Standards in the Regional Transportation Plan. The operators were generally successful in meeting those standards.

In each chapter there is a third section, the Transit Productivity Analysis. This is the one portion of the TSMR which is mandated in law.

Since 1994, StanCOG staff has been asked by the Board to analyze the local operations using two comparative approaches. First, in 1994 we were asked to analyze local operations in comparison to Acomparable≅ operations around the State. In 1998, we were asked to analyze each operation against itself, in a trend analysis. The Transit Productivity Analysis primarily uses the trend analysis, but reviews comparable systems for additional perspective in some cases.

The goal of the Transit Productivity Analysis is to identify means by which transit operators can potentially save money. To evaluate whether the operations are operating cost effectively, StanCOG staff analyzed each operation in light of 21 measurement standards. Some were Aamount≅ oriented, such as Operating Cost, Fare Revenue, Passengers, Hours, and Miles. Most of the remainder involve how these relate to each other, providing levels of efficiency - in most cases cost efficiency.

The recommendations of the Transit Productivity Analysis will be included in the Transit Cost Sharing Process, used to establish the final Transportation Development Act (TDA) Claim for each of the transit operators. Where a specific recommendation is made, the operator must either include that recommendation in their submitted TDA Claim, or satisfactorily document why it should not be included.

After completion of the analysis for each operator, there were no productivity recommendations made for Ceres, for MAX, for StaRT DAR, or for Turlock’s BLAST of DART systems.

The following productivity recommendations were made for the remaining operations:

For Modesto Dial-A-Ride:

1) Pursue means to Control Operating Costs.

As noted in the above analysis, the growth in operating costs are outpacing fare revenue, passengers, hours, and miles. This results in unproductive cost related trends. The analysis sites seven such cost related trends.

2) Pursue means to Improve the Farebox Ratio.

For 2000-01 the farebox ratio was at 10%, the statutory minimum.

3) Pursue means to Increase Passengers/Hour.

This vital statistic has gradually dropped during the past several years.

For ROTA:

1) Continue pursuing Fixed Route service.

Of the 13 efficiency measures reviewed, nine demonstrated increasing inefficiency of the present ROTA system. The inefficiency is characterized by: 1) rapidly increasing operating costs; 2) dropping fare revenue; and, 3) dropping passenger counts. The existing demand responsive service appears to have reached its peak efficiency one or two years ago. StanCOG praises the ROTA Board for its efforts to date to obtain fixed route vehicles. StanCOG recommends that the ROTA Board quickly complete all other preparations for its fixed route service.

For StaRT Fixed Route:

1) Focus on means to increase the fare revenue.

Though the fixed route system had a higher farebox ratio in 2000-01 than in 1993-94, it has dropped significantly since 1998-99.

2) Focus on means to increase passengers.

From 1999-2000 to 2000-01 the passenger count dropped by over 10,000. StaRT has taken two steps to try to reverse this trend; the expansion of Saturday hours during the 2000-01 fiscal year, and the expansion of the Modesto-Turlock service into two routes in 2001-02. The Westside Runabout – though accounted as a demand responsive service – is functionally designed to add more fixed route passengers as well.

For Waterford Dial-A-Ride:

1) Establish a long term Accounting Method for Operating Costs

**DESCRIPTIONS
OF
LOCAL
TRANSIT
SYSTEMS**

C-2-b: Ceres Dial-A-Ride vehicles are in operation during service hours. A backup vehicle is provided as well.

Comfort

D-1: A seat is available for every passenger.

D-2: Bus shelters are available at the transfer points to MAX and to Modesto Dial-A-Ride and to the StaRT Route 15 bus service. A shelter is also available at the transfer point to the StaRT Westside Stage at the Social Service Complex/Public Safety Center at the corner of Crows Landing and Hackett Roads. A shelter is also located at the Howard Training Center, along Stonum Road.

D-3: All vehicles are equipped with heating and air conditioning for the comfort of the passengers.

Performance

E-1: The productivity recommendations in the 1999-2000 Transit Systems Management Report are noted in the Productivity Analysis at the end of this chapter. That Analysis will note how Ceres Dial-A-Ride performed in comparison with its own past performance and with comparable operations statewide.

E-2: During the 2000-01 fiscal year, Ceres Dial-A-Ride maintained a 16.1% fare box ratio. This exceeded the 10% fare box ratio required in the Regional Transportation Plan.

E-3: Not Applicable. Ceres Dial-A-Ride is not a new system. At such time as Ceres initiates their fixed route service this will be applicable.

E-4: Ceres Dial-A-Ride initiated Sunday service after the 2000-01 fiscal year. The language of the RTP standard is intended to reference the end of the first full fiscal year of operation. Ceres records statistics for Sunday operations in their monthly reports for review of performance.

Additional statistical indicators of performance are provided in the Operating Data section of this chapter and in the Productivity Analysis chapter of this report.

Marketing

A brochure detailing Ceres Dial-A-Ride service is available at Ceres City Hall, and at 15 other locations in the Ceres and Modesto area. This brochure has been translated into Spanish.

In addition to this information, newspaper advertising is also used to promote Ceres Dial-A-Ride.

- F-1: The City of Ceres has produced a brochure which explains:
 - a) the service area boundary and fare;
 - b) how to use the service;
 - c) provides the telephone number to call to arrange transportation; and,
 - d) lists transfer options.

- F-2: The City of Ceres has made the brochure available free of charge in City Hall. They have also translated the brochure into Spanish to reach that market segment of the community. The City has also advertised the service in the Ceres Courier newspaper.
- F-3: The City of Ceres has a policy to keep copies of its brochure at the Modesto Greyhound station.
- F-4: The City of Ceres has provided information about its Dial-A-Ride service on the City Web site.

Management

- G-1: Storer reports to the City of Ceres monthly about all six of the required points.
- G-2: The monthly report by Storer includes a summary of the response time and pick-up time deviations based upon four randomly selected days. The report also includes reports about service refusals. Ceres staff indicates that service refusals historically have all been due to passenger misbehavior, and not due to timing problems.
- G-3: Ceres Dial-A-Ride is a demand responsive service. The City has purchased a 1997 minibus with a wheelchair lift. This minibus has been used by Storer Transit Services. Ceres conforms to the standard.
- G-4: The City of Ceres staff periodically surveys the passengers of the Dial-A-Ride service. Most are for internal purposes. City staff took a more complete survey in early 2000.
- G-5: Storer Transit Services has kept a maintenance record of the vehicles and makes it available to the City for review.

SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS

The City of Ceres reviews its transit service on an ongoing basis. In January 2001, the Ceres City Council reviewed various options for improvement of the City of Ceres Transit system. Based upon a survey of several hundred passengers, the Council approved expanding its service to Sundays, effective July of 2001. It also reviewed the option of fixed route service, and approved a one-year experiment to determine whether fixed route service would benefit the city. This fixed route service is proposed to begin in 2003, when a new minibus is expected to come to Ceres.

The City provides transfer arrangements with the Modesto Area Express, Modesto Dial-A-Ride, and with two Stanislaus Regional Transit services. Since 1994, service hours are 6:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m. Monday through Friday. Two vehicles are made available from 6:00 a.m. to 6:30 a.m. and from 6:30 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. City staff indicates that service before 6:30 a.m. and after 6:30 p.m. have ridership rates comparable to daytime hours. In addition, Saturday hours have been extended to 10:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Ceres staff has indicated that ridership on the service is consistent with ridership during the remainder of the week. Sunday hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Portions of the City of Ceres are served by Modesto's MAX and the Stanislaus Regional Transit Route 15. Approximately 3,600 of the 35,300 people of Ceres are in the service area of MAX and approximately 3,250 people in Ceres live within the service area of the Modesto-Turlock Route.

8) Ceres DAR carried 0.50 passengers/mile in 2000-01, up 3.4% from 1999-2000. Overall, the passengers/mile has increased an average of 1.8% annually since 1995-96. Three of five years had increases from the previous year. This is a stable trend. In 1998-99, the average was 0.47 passengers/mile in the large DAR spreadsheet. Because it is easier to understand miles traveled per passenger than percentages of a passenger picked up per mile, staff has also calculated the miles traveled per passenger. Ceres Dial-A-Ride traveled 1.98 miles/passenger in 2000-01. In 1996-97 Ceres DAR traveled 2.33 miles/passenger. The downward trend is good which is good.

9) Employees for Ceres DAR worked an average of 816 hours/employee in 2000-01, the lowest average recorded for Ceres DAR. The hours/employee ranged from 697 to 1,375 in 1998-99, for the eight operators in the comparison. This is not clearly a measure of efficiency, and is stated as required. This is good.

10) Ceres DAR operated with six transit vehicles at the end of the 2000-01 fiscal year.

11) Ceres DAR operated with a farebox ratio of 16.1% in 2000-01. This exceeds the 10% minimum reflected in both the Transportation Development Act and in the Regional Transportation Plan. This is the highest farebox ratio for Ceres DAR since 1993-94, when the service operated with taxis. The farebox ratio has increased an average of 5% since 1995-96. This is a good trend. This indicates the fare revenue is increasing at a faster rate than the operating costs. In 1998-99, the average farebox ratio was 11.0% in the large DAR spreadsheet. Ceres is operating quite efficiently by this standard. (Note, three of the eight operators had farebox ratios below 10%.)

12) Ceres DAR operated at a cost of \$2.74/mile in 2000-01, 6.3% higher than 1999-2000. Much of this was due to the high cost of fuel. This was the highest cost/mile yet recorded, but the increase has averaged only 1.8% annually since 1995-96, a minimal rate of growth. In 1998-99, the average cost/mile was \$3.19 in the large DAR spreadsheet. This speaks well of Ceres.

13) Ceres DAR operated at 14.2 miles/hour in 2000-01. There has been no consistent trend for this statistic. Since 1995-96 it has been 12.8, 15.8, 14.0, 14.6, 14.5, and 14.2. In 1998-99 the average speed was 14.3 miles/hour in the large DAR spreadsheet. There is no standard for dial-a-ride operators for this measure.

14) Ceres DAR collected \$87,021 in fare revenue in 2000-01. This was 22.9% higher than 1999-2000. Overall, the fare revenue has increased an average of 12.1% annually since 1995-96. This is an excellent trend.

15) As noted at the beginning of this chapter, the regular fare for Ceres DAR is \$.75/passenger, which may be paid with cash or with pre-purchased tickets. A \$.25 additional fare is charged if a passenger wishes to transfer to either of Modesto's transit operations, or to the two StaRT fixed routes which serve the Ceres DAR service area. Passengers who transfer from those systems give their tickets to the driver, and pay no cash, because of the established transfer agreement. In addition, up to two children less than seven years of age may ride with an adult for no charge. With this said, Ceres averaged \$.87 fare/passenger in 2000-01. As with some of the other statistics, no clear trend is present for the years since 1995-96. The fares have averaged \$.68, \$.63, \$.69, \$.77, \$.70, and \$.87. Being well above \$.75, this indicates that a significant percentage of the passengers must have purchased transfers, or that many tickets were purchased which were not used.

Fare: Regular: \$0.85
 Student: \$0.65
 Senior/Disabled: \$0.40
 Student field trips per student or accompanying adult:
 \$0.45
 Children under 5, accompanied by a parent or guardian:
 Free

Passes:

Regular Monthly Pass \$33.00 - sold by mail or at MAX outlets
 Student Monthly Pass \$22.00 - sold by mail or at MAX outlets
 Senior/Disabled Monthly \$17.00 - sold by mail or at MAX outlets
 All day pass \$2.10 - sold on board buses only

Commuter Tickets: Book of 50 \$33.00 - valid only at specific times
 Regular Ride Tickets: Book of 50 \$42.50
 Student Ride Tickets: Book of 50 \$32.50
 Senior/Disabled Tickets: Book of 50 \$20.00

BART Express: \$8.00 - one way cash fare
 \$10.00 - round-trip cash fare
 Pass \$98.00 - Full month
 Pass \$75.00 - Beginning 8th of the month
 Pass \$50.00 - Half month (1st - 15th day of each month)
 Pass \$50.00 - Beginning the 15th of the month
 Pass \$26.00 - Beginning the 22nd of the month

ACE Express \$1.00 - one way cash fare

MAX outlets: City of Modesto Finance Dept., MV Office, and 12 other locations around town (listed in the MAX Ride Guide). Further information is available at the www.modestoareaexpress.com/

Purchase by Mail: Modesto Area Express
 P. O. Box 642
 Modesto, CA 95353

Arrangements: Disabled passenger attendants ride free whenever assisting handicapped passengers on and off MAX.

Telephone Number: (209) 521-1274

Complaints: (209) 521-1274

MODESTO DIAL-A-RIDE SERVICE CHARACTERISTICS

SERVICE STANDARDS

The following measures the performance of Modesto's transit system against the transit service standards in the Regional Transportation Plan.

Accessibility

MAX utilizes a City-owned active fleet, consisting of 33 thirty-five foot standard transit buses, three 40-foot standard transit buses, one 40' suburban bus, three 40- foot low-floor buses, one MCI Commuter Coach, and two twenty-nine foot El Dorado National Compressed-Natural-Gas buses. Monday through Friday, 28 buses operate from 6:15 a.m. to 7:30 p.m. in scheduled service, plus five scheduled "trippers". On Saturdays MAX uses 19 buses from approximately 8:15 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. MAX operates ten routes on Sundays, from 8:45 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. MAX does not run on New Year's Day, Presidents' Day, the Fourth of July, Memorial Day, Labor Day, Thanksgiving Day, and Christmas Day.

The system operates on 17 routes. Routes and schedules were most recently amended November 1, 1999, after a significant reworking effective July 1, 1999. Fifteen of the routes operate in pulse fashion, meeting simultaneously every 30 or 60 minutes at the Downtown Transportation Center. The City attempts to include sufficient recovery time in its schedules to allow time for comfortable transfers between bus routes at this location. One route, Route 28, does not go to the Downtown Transportation Center. It begins and ends at the Vintage Faire Mall transfer site, serving the northwest part of Modesto (every 30 minutes), and Salida (hourly). It meets four other routes which do go downtown. The Empire route is counted as a 17th route, but operates only five times daily, not following the same time schedule as the rest of the MAX routes.

During 1999, Modesto added extra buses during peak runs on routes 21 and 29. Those routes were experiencing standing-room-only crowds; some people could not be picked-up. Even with those additional buses, route 21 continues to be the busiest route, as measured by passengers-per-vehicle-service-hour.

The fixed routes cover approximately 232 miles (one-way routes), not counting the BART or ACE routes.

In fiscal year 1997-98, the City contracted with Storer Transit Services, a local private transportation company, for the provision of door-to-door paratransit service for the elderly and handicapped. The City pays Storer a flat hourly fee for each vehicle service hour actually operated. Storer operates up to eleven vans and all personnel necessary for the service. The Dial-A-Ride operates seven days a week. It operates between the hours of 4:45 a.m. and 11:00 p.m. on Monday through Friday, between 8:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. on Saturdays and between 8:00 a.m. and 6:00 p.m. on Sundays. The Dial-A-Ride is available to the general public on Monday through Friday from 6:00 p.m. to 11:00 p.m. and all day on Sunday.

The City prepared its Americans with Disabilities Act Paratransit Plan which addresses all aspects of the demand-responsive services.

A-1: Approximately 86% of the population of the City of Modesto was within ¼ mile of a MAX route, based upon data from the 2000 Census. Since that time there has been significant construction in the Village One area and in the northern portion of Modesto, neither of which is within ¼ mile of

any MAX routes. Staff estimates a 2002 service area percentage of between 82% and 83% of the City population. However, this more than satisfies the 70% standard stated in the RTP.

- A-2: The Regional Transportation Plan requires service to all "major activity centers". While this term is not defined, It appears that most "major activity centers" in the city limits are served by MAX. The MAX routes are designed to serve all of the High Schools and most of the Junior High Schools within the City. Most other "major activity centers" are within 1/4 mile of a MAX route. Fixed route transit is available to the Modesto Airport Passenger Terminal on Route 37, by requesting the driver to deviate. (In the past there was hourly service to the Airport, but ridership to and from the Airport was too low to justify continuation of the service above the current arrangement.) There is service within 1/4 mile of the General Aviation portion of the Airport along Route 38.
- A-3: The 2002-03 Unmet Transit Needs Report includes the formula used to identify Census Tracts with concentrations of Transit Dependent Persons. It included a tentative list of those Tracts with the highest concentration of transit dependent persons. The 2003-04 Unmet Transit Needs Report will finalize the locations of those populations. Within those Tracts found to be "most transit dependent" not less than 90% of the dwelling units are to be within 1/4 mile of a MAX route. All residents of Modesto who are over 65 years of age or who are considered disabled according to the Americans with Disabilities Act are served with door to door demand responsive service, which satisfies the second half of the standard. Based upon the list of most needy Tracts generated for the Unmet Needs Report, seven of the ten Tracts with the greatest needs within the County are in the MAX service area. There are 89 Census Tracts Countywide.
- A-4: All MAX buses and all Modesto Dial-A-Ride buses are equipped with wheelchair lifts or ramps.
- A-5: Both MAX and Modesto Dial-A-Ride receive Transportation Development Act and Federal funds. The City of Modesto has completed the requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act and made the documentation of this available to StanCOG.
- A-6 Door-to-door demand responsive transit is provided in all of Modesto for all ADA certified persons on Modesto Dial-A-Ride.

Convenience

Dial-A-Ride services transport passengers to any requested destination within the service area. Fixed-route services are two-directional and provide service to major activity centers along the routes, as described above.

- B-1-a: During the 2000-01 fiscal year, MAX buses maintained an average speed of 13.6 miles per hour.
- B-1-b: NA
- B-2: The City of Modesto reviews routes and schedules for minor to major revisions every six months, with a goal of serving the maximum number of passengers as efficiently as possible.
- B-3: According to City staff, during June of 2001, 17% of the MAX riders used transfers to continue their trips. This is well below the 30% standard in the Regional Transportation Plan.

B-4: All of the fixed routes include timed transfer points.

B-5-a: On Monday through Friday, 11 routes are considered high demand and operate with 30 minute headways (one route is consistently busy enough that a Atripper≡ bus consistently follows the regular bus during the week at peak hours). On Saturday, six routes operate with 30-minute headways. On Sunday, one route operates with a 30-minute headway (Route 21).

B-5-b: Monday through Friday there are five routes which operate with 60 minute headways. On Saturday, 10 routes operate with 60 minute headways. On Sundays, ten routes operate, nine with 60-minute headways. The Empire Route operates five times per day, Monday through Friday, much less often than hourly.

B-6-a-i: NA

B-6-a-ii: NA

B-6-b-i: The average deviation time between the estimated and actual pick-up time for Modesto Dial-A-Ride is ten minutes, based on discussions with city staff.

B-6-b-ii: Modesto Dial-A-Ride requires a minimum advance reservation of two hours for general public trips.

B-6-b-iii: NA

B-6-b-iv: Modesto Dial-A-Ride requires a minimum advance reservation of two hours for elderly/disabled trips.

B-7: Bus stop signs have been placed at all locations where MAX buses stop. Many stops used by large numbers of passengers daily also have bus benches, and bus shelters are at some busy stops, as well. MAX currently has 50 bus shelters in operation.

B-8: NA

Reliability

Fixed-route buses arrive within five minutes of the scheduled arrival times. Demand-responsive vehicles arrive on time for passengers who have made previous arrangements.

C-1: MAX carefully tries to avoid both early buses and buses more than five minutes behind schedule.

C-2-a: MAX keeps buses on all of the routes on a routine basis. In addition they maintain several spare buses in their fleet to cover when a bus does break-down. In Spring, 2000, the City of Modesto adopted a policy to operate two “rover” buses, which are on call at all times to cover for a bus not able to complete its route on schedule, for whatever reason; the “rover” bus makes the next scheduled run in the place of the late bus. MAX records indicate that since the initiation of this policy, on-time performance has increased by over 90%.

C-2-b: The contract between the City of Modesto and Storer Transit Systems requires eight dial-a-ride vehicles on the road daily and eleven available. The two spare vehicles have been adequate to insure that eight vehicles are in service daily.

Comfort

All vehicles are equipped with heating and air conditioning. The Transportation Center has an indoor waiting room. 50 bus shelters are available at other locations throughout the City.

D-1: A seat is typically available for every passenger on both the MAX and Dial-A-Ride services. During peak periods MAX experiences standing-room-only crowds on some routes. As noted above, an additional Atripper bus was added to both Routes #21 and #29 schedules in 1999 - operating immediately behind the regular bus - when demand exceeded the capacity of the buses. Route #21 is still the busiest in the system after the addition of the bus.

D-2: Bus shelters are located at all transfer locations. Modesto Transit routinely places shelters in locations where many riders board or exit. The Transportation Center includes two large covered shelter areas for the MAX and StaRT bus passengers and a third shelter wing for the Greyhound bus passengers, and an indoor waiting room for the greyhound passengers.

D-3: All MAX and Dial-A-Ride vehicles are equipped with both heating and air conditioning for year-round comfort.

Performance

E-1: This Transit Standard says, "Attempt to meet the productivity recommendations included in the annual Transit Productivity Analysis." These standards will be dealt with specifically later in this chapter.

E-2: During the 2000-01 fiscal year MAX maintained a 35.65% fare box ratio. During the 2000-01 fiscal year Dial-A-Ride maintained a 10.00% fare box ratio.

E-3: MAX has two new services in operation, the BART service and the ACE service. City of Modesto records indicate that for the 12-month period ending May 2002 the BART service operated with a 63.8% fare revenue ratio. For that same month Modesto records indicate the ACE Bus operated at a 21.9% fare revenue ratio for the 12 previous months.

E-4: MAX has not had any expansions of service since 1999.

Marketing

The City of Modesto provides information on all services. A detailed pamphlet on services is available at the joint offices of Modesto Transit and SmaRT - at 1010 Tenth Street, the Stanislaus County Free Library, on board MAX buses, at Modesto Junior College and other locations. Customer information is available in Spanish. Spanish information is also available by telephone Monday through Friday between 9 a.m. and 6 p.m.

- F-1: Modesto Transit has produced a booklet listing all of the MAX routes and timetables, the fares, explanation of how to use the system and telephone numbers to receive more information. The booklet also provides the same information for the Dial-A-Ride system.
- F-2: Information regarding Modesto Dial-A-Ride is contained in the MAX route and schedule guide, as well as on the Website. The transit staff includes one member assigned to train the elderly to use the MAX system. The Modesto Area Dial-A-Ride Guide and brochure contain information available in hard copy.
- F-3: The MAX booklet is available at the Greyhound bus depot in Modesto, which is located at the downtown Modesto Transportation Center, the central transfer point for most MAX routes. This has made information available on a wider scale.
- F-4: The Modesto Area Express Website includes detailed information regarding routes, schedules, fares, and other useful information at www.modestoareaexpress.com. The Website also includes data regarding Modesto Dial-A-Ride.

Management

The City of Modesto's Transit Manager maintains statistical information on the transit systems on a monthly basis.

- G-1: All of the listed information is kept monthly.
- G-2-a: Staff periodically checks all routes. Those known to have schedule problems are checked more frequently.
- G-2-b: The response time is similar to the wait time. See standard B-6-a-i.
- G-2-c: Pick-up time deviation is addressed in B-6-b-i.
- G-2-d: Modesto DAR, through its contractor, tracks service refusals.
- G-3: Modesto meets or exceeds all of those standards.
- G-4: Staff took A customer satisfaction survey in early 2000.
- G-5: A maintenance plan is kept by the City for the MAX vehicles and by Storer Transportation for the Dial-A-Ride vehicles. Both are available for review.

MAX Operation to the Modesto Amtrak Station

In November, 1999, the Modesto Amtrak Station opened for operation along the Burlington Northern-Santa Fe Tracks, just north of Parker Road. The station is served by MAX route 34. Presently there are twelve trains to the station daily. The City of Modesto has placed literature at the station to inform passengers arriving in Modesto of the available transit services. There are MAX buses scheduled within 30 minutes of ten of the scheduled trains. The remaining two trains arrive after the end of MAX service. The literature notifies interested passengers of Modesto Dial-A-Ride services, which are available to the

general public in the later evenings, and of the phone numbers of the three taxicab services operating in Modesto.

PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENTS

In response to Public Utilities Code Section 99244, StanCOG is required to annually identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements which could lower the operating costs of those transit services which operate at least 50 percent of their vehicle service miles within its jurisdiction. The recommendations related to productivity are made in the performance audit conducted pursuant to Public Utilities Code Section 99246.

The Performance Audit for the three years ending June 30, 2000 was completed in 2001. The one recommendation for Modesto was as follows:

“Maintenance costs and mechanical breakdowns have risen in the period we audited. Fifty percent of the vehicles in use were put in service in 1990 or earlier. The City of Modesto Transit System is in the process addressing this issue. We recommend that the management continue its efforts to rebuild and replace the fleet in a planned, systematic manner.”

The City has been reconstructing its older buses. This is less than half as expensive as purchasing a new bus, but the result is a vehicle with a significantly extended life span. StanCOG staff is satisfied that Modesto is working to satisfy this recommendation, as even the auditor stated.

SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS

The City of Modesto regularly reviews its routes, schedules, and facilities in an attempt to improve the system. This decade there have been several major improvements and numerous fine tunings. In 1990 the fixed route was renamed AMAX. In 1993 there was a major restructuring of the routes, most of which began to leave from the new downtown intermodal station, also completed that year (see below). Routes were designed to circulate through most of Modesto, some starting and ending at the downtown station, others ending at a second transfer station at the Vintage Faire Mall. The current route structure reflects the philosophy developed at that time; the City has reviewed and changed the routes and schedules as needed, averaging about once annually since that time to improve services throughout its service area.

In 1993 MAX and Stanislaus County Transit (now Stanislaus Regional Transit) cooperated to provide fixed route service to the Town of Empire, five times daily. In February 1999, MAX assumed full responsibility for operations of that route.

In 1995 MAX initiated service to the downtown portion of the Town of Salida. That service operates hourly, Monday through Saturday.

In 1996 MAX initiated 30 minute headway service to the County Social Services Center at Crows Landing and Hackett Roads. This service change was especially innovative, merging two routes in the South Modesto area and eliminating a transfer requirement to reach parts of South Modesto, by creating a 90 minute loop route, rather than a 30 or 60 minute route, as is standard for most of the MAX system.

In 1996 MAX initiated Sunday services.

1993-94. This is a controlled trend, indicating that the fare revenue increases have been close to the increases in operating costs.

19) MAX operated with a subsidy/passenger of \$1.05 in 2000-01. This was lower than three years since 1993-94. The annual increase since 1993-94 of subsidy/passenger has been 0.6%. This is a controlled rate.

20) MAX operated with a subsidy/hour of \$35.25 in 2000-01. The average annual increase since 1993-94 has been 1.1%. This, again, is a controlled rate.

21) MAX operated with a subsidy/mile of \$2.59 in 2000-01. This was 4.8% lower than the record, set in 1999-2000. The average annual increase since 1993-94 has been 1.5%. This, again, is a controlled rate.

In summary, MAX has shown an upward trend in efficiency since 1993-94 in six areas, stability in three areas, and a downward trend in three areas, as shown in the list, below:

- 1) Fare/mile has increased an average of 11.4% annually. This is excellent.
- 2) Fare/hour has increased an average of 10.9% annually. This is excellent.
- 3) Fare/passenger has increased an average of 10.4% annually. This is excellent.
- 4) Farebox ratio has increased an average of 6.9% annually. This is very good.
- 5) Passengers/mile have increased an average of 0.9% annually. This is steady.*
- 6) Passengers/hour have increased an average of 0.5% annually. This is steady.*
- 7) Miles/hour have decreased an average of 0.4% annually. This is steady.**
- 8) Subsidy/passenger has increased an average of 0.6% annually. This is controlled.
- 9) Subsidy/hour has increased an average of 1.1% annually. This is controlled.
- 10) Subsidy/mile has increased an average of 1.5% annually. This is controlled.
- 11) Cost/passenger has increased an average of 3.3% annually. This is controlled.
- 12) Cost/hour has increased an average of 3.8% annually. This is controlled.
- 13) Cost/mile has increased an average of 4.3% annually. This is controlled.

Note, Federal data sources indicate the nationwide inflation rate from 1994 through 2001 averaged 2.58%. Based upon this, the only three cost related statistics growing above the overall inflation rate are the last three.

*Note comments in text regarding significantly higher growth rate in past four years.

**Note comment in text regarding 2000-01 significant reversal of overall trend.

Measures #1, #7, #8, #9, and #10 show the fare increases of 1997 were accepted by the passengers.

Measure #10 also shows that annual fare revenue increases nearly equal operating cost increases.

* Measures #5, and #6 show that passenger counts are rising comparably to hours and mileage.

* Measures #2, #3, and #4 show that operating costs are rising faster than passenger, hour, and mileage counts. Though the single largest operating cost relates to purchased costs of operating MAX (i.e., the contract with Laidlaw Transit, which is calculated primarily on a cost per hour basis), there are additional costs for operation of MAX which do not relate to hours or to miles, and therefore this increase should not be viewed with great concern.

In the review of the twenty-one points listed above, StanCOG staff does not see any negative efficiency trends which have extended over a long period of time. In reviewing the seven years since the present system was developed, MAX compares well to its recent past performances. In comparison to similar sized operators (most of which are metropolitan area or "college town" operators, with very different demographics) in 1998-99, MAX performed well above average. StanCOG staff praises the City of Modesto for its recent creation of service to the ACE Train Station in Manteca and to the BART Station in Dublin.

StanCOG staff is required to make recommendations for a productivity improvement in Section 99244 of the Transportation Development Act. Staff has reviewed the points for analysis included in the Transportation Development Act, as well as additional points designed to provide potentially useful information about the MAX service. MAX as a system is regularly seeking ways to better its system, and to provide better service to its clients, the people of the Modesto area.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT

None.

MODESTO DIAL-A-RIDE

StanCOG offers the following analysis of the Modesto Dial-A-Ride operation in light of the same criteria (note, while there was not a significant service change in 1993-94, trends are measured from that time to parallel the MAX measurements):

1) Modesto DAR had an operating cost of \$1,451,407 in 2000-01. This was the highest operating cost to date. The growth in operating costs has averaged 4.8% per year since 1993-94. This in itself is not a concern, but it will be seen to be a concern as it relates to other measures of the Modesto DAR operations.

2) Modesto DAR carried 101,720 passengers in 2000-01. This was higher than any year since 1994-95, but passengers have decreased since 1993-94 at about 1.6% annually. Many of these passengers are choosing to ride MAX. This trend poses both benefits and disadvantages for the Modesto Transit system. The reduction also impacts overall operating efficiencies for Modesto DAR. The trend is acceptable. Perhaps of greater significance is the increase seen since 1997-98. The growth to 2000-01 averaged 2.3% annually. Preliminary 2001-02 passenger counts show 107,879, for an annual growth rate of 3.2% since 1997-98. This is very high.

3) Modesto DAR operated for 34,807 hours in 2000-01. Modesto DAR hours have remained fairly steady since 1993-94, increasing an average of 1.4% annually. This trend is controlled.

4) Modesto DAR operated 506,667 miles in 2000-01. Modesto DAR miles have decreased an average of 0.7% per year since 1993-94. This corresponds to the drop in passengers during this time period. This trend is acceptable. Preliminary numbers for 2001-02 indicate that mileage was only 491,003, a drop of 3.1% from 2000-01. This is the largest single year reduction, by either absolute or percentage measures, since the initiation of the current spreadsheet. This is very significant.

5) Modesto DAR operated at a cost of \$14.27/passenger in 2000-01. This was a new record cost/passenger. The cost/passenger has increased an average of 6.5% annually since 1993-94. This is

THE RIVERBANK-OAKDALE TRANSIT AUTHORITY SYSTEM

OVERVIEW

In June of 1995 the Riverbank-Oakdale Transit Authority (ROTA) began operation. ROTA is a joint powers authority, with a Board of Directors made up of two City Council members from both Oakdale and Riverbank and the City Manager of Riverbank and City Administrator of Oakdale. The City Manager and City Administrator manage the finances for the Board of Directors.

This service began with the goal of providing less expensive regional transit service to the Riverbank and Oakdale areas, as well as to the unincorporated areas between and adjacent to these cities; the service area is about 25 square miles. The service is operated through a contract with MV Transit Services, which operates under the ROTA Board of Directors. ROTA owns eight vans, using one as a back-up vehicle. All of the vehicles are equipped with wheelchair lifts.

In 1997 the ROTA service area expanded east to include the East Oakdale area, including as far east as the Orange Blossom Bridge and part of the Lancaster Road area, north of Highway 108/120. Service to this area is Monday through Friday.

ROTA is a demand responsive service which operates from 6:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m., Monday through Friday, and from 8:00 a.m. to 5:30 p.m. on Saturdays. The basic fare is \$1.00; \$.75 for the elderly and disabled; children three years and under ride free. Transit to the nearest Modesto Area Express (MAX) stop is available for \$3.00 (regular); \$2.75 for the elderly and disabled. Discount ticket books are available. The fare for the residents east of Wamble Road and Orange Blossom Road to Oakdale or Riverbank is also \$3.00 (regular); \$2.75 for the elderly and disabled.

In late 1999 the Amtrak station for the Modesto area moved from Riverbank to Modesto. As a result, the ROTA Board of Directors chose to offer rides to residents of the ROTA service area who wished to go to the new Amtrak station. The fare is \$3.00 (regular); \$2.75 for the elderly and disabled.

Effective May, 2000, Stanislaus Regional Transit provides a service to the elderly and disabled in most of the ROTA service area, called the Eastside Runabout. The service is a deviated fixed route, designed to transport these individuals living in the ROTA service area to work or school in the Modesto area. This service was developed to satisfy an unmet transit need found to be reasonable to meet by the StanCOG Policy Board in February, 1998.

SERVICE CHARACTERISTICS

Service Area: Approximately 25 square miles.

Service Area Population: About 35,000

Transfer Points: There are no formal transfer points, but, Stanislaus Regional Transit's Modesto-Riverbank-Oakdale Route does have seven timed stops in Oakdale and eight in Riverbank. In addition, people in the ROTA service area who wish to be taken to Modesto, are taken to a MAX stop at Oakdale Road and Sylvan Avenue in Modesto, where MAX route 32 passes every 30 minutes.

- A-4: ROTA Dial-A-Ride vehicles are all equipped with wheelchair lifts.
- A-5: ROTA Dial-A-Ride Received Federal and State operating funds. Wheelchair lift equipped vehicles bring the system within the Americans with Disabilities Act requirements.
- A-6: ROTA provides door-to-door demand responsive service to all elderly and disabled persons in their service area. ROTA meets this standard.

Convenience

ROTA transports passengers to a given destination within the service area. Response time varies depending upon the number of calls for service.

- B-1: NA - ROTA does not operate fixed route service. ROTA has indicated that they are in the process of implementing fixed route service in 2003. As ROTA is divided into an “urbanized” area (Riverbank) and an “urban but non-urbanized” area (Oakdale), the in-city service will probably be scheduled to meet the “urbanized” standard of 13 miles per hour – it is unlikely that a schedule meeting an 18 mile per hour criteria could work in Oakdale. Staff believes this satisfies the intent of the Regional Transportation Plan.
- B-2: While part of ROTA is designated as an urbanized area, the standard appears to address fixed route service. ROTA is currently developing its proposed route with this goal in mind.
- B-3: NA - ROTA does not operate fixed route service. A goal of the proposed fixed route service is to minimize transfers.
- B-4: NA - ROTA does not operate fixed route service. Timed Transfers both within the system and to the StaRT Modesto-Riverbank-Oakdale Route are planned.
- B-5: NA - ROTA does not operate fixed route service. The standard for the planned system would be 60 minute headways.
- B-6-a-i: The ROTA Dial-A-Ride monthly report for May, 2002 indicates the average wait time on a sampled weekday was 18.2 minutes.
- B-6-a-ii: The ROTA Dial-A-Ride monthly report for May, 2002 indicates that 91% of the pick-ups were within the standard window expected for service.
- B-6-b: The ROTA Dial-A-Ride encourages passengers to reserve rides as much as seven days in advance.
- B-7: ROTA does not presently operate fixed route transit. When that service is initiated, and it is found that stops in Riverbank serve more than 50 passengers daily, this standard will apply.
- B-8: ROTA is presently reviewing optional route designs.

Reliability

Dial-A-Ride system. ROTA Dial-A-Ride brochures are available at the Amtrak station in Modesto.

F-4 ROTA has an Internet website. The website address is <http://www.riverbank.org/cityservices/rota.html>

Management

- G-1: ROTA Dial-A-Ride produces a monthly report which is made available to both cities and StanCOG staff, which includes a detailed analysis from one randomly selected weekday of operation performed by supervisory staff from MV Transportation Services.
- G-2: The ROTA Dial-A-Ride May 2002 report indicates the average wait time was 4.4 minutes. This is based upon an analysis of 184 such trips made on Tuesday, May 14, 2002. See standard B-6 a-l.
- G-3: ROTA Dial-A-Ride operates eight 12 passenger vans. They were purchased between 1999 and 2001. Replacement will be considered according to standards set by the Federal Transit Administration. Seventeen percent of the vehicles are for back-up purposes.
- G-4: ROTA Dial-A-Ride conducted a passenger survey for the first time during Spring of 2000. Copies of the responses are available at the ROTA office.
- G-5: The newer ROTA Dial-A-Ride vehicles are under factory warranty. Maintenance is completed by MV Transportation Services.

SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS

The primary service improvements in time have been the initiation of Saturday service in Riverbank and service to areas of East Oakdale and to the Modesto Amtrak Station.

The ROTA Board has approved the establishment of fixed route transit service. The goal is to improve overall efficiency. They are presently in the process of reviewing potential route configurations. ROTA anticipates they will begin fixed route service by early 2003.

The Triennial Performance Audit for July 1, 1997 through June 30, 2000 made the following recommendations for ROTA:

- 1) The Riverbank-Oakdale Transit Authority should develop a set of goals and objectives for the future of its transit system. With the projected countywide population growth and expected increases in ridership, the Riverbank-Oakdale Transit Authority should establish a set of goals and objectives to achieve as a community transit provider. This can guide the system to further define its role in public transit in relation to the other transportation providers in the County.
- 2) The Riverbank-Oakdale Transit Authority should formally track both customer complaints and compliments on a monthly and annual basis. This is a repeat recommendation from the prior performance audit. Complaints and compliments received by the contract operator should be

period, but the reduction of mileage is greater than that of passengers, which is good. Since 1995-96 the miles have increased 8.0% annually. This is a good trend.

5) ROTA DAR operated at a cost of \$8.85/passenger in 2000-01. This was a 12.7% increase over 1999-2000. Though the cost/passenger has dropped an average 7.4% annually since 1995-96, since 1997-98 it has increased an average of 11% annually. This is an alarming trend.

6) ROTA DAR operated at a cost of \$39.74/hour in 2000-01. This was 17.6% higher than 1999-2000. Cost-per-hour is typically the most significant factor in contracts negotiated between transit operators and contractors. Though cost/hour has dropped an average of 2.6% annually since 1995-96, since 1997-98 it has increased an average of 12.6% annually. This is an alarming trend. It must also be noted that the average cost/hour among the 17 operators in the peer review spreadsheet for 1998-99 was \$53.35, and in 1999-2000 ROTA operated 36.7% more cost efficiently in this measure. ROTA is performing well by this standard.

7) ROTA DAR carried 4.49 passengers/hour in 2000-01. This was 4.4% higher than 1999-2000, but 7.26% lower than 1998-99. Since 1995-96 the passengers/hour have increased 5.2% annually. While this is growth, it is significantly less than the 11.6% annual growth to 1998-99. Some of this is the result of a natural decrease of growth rates as the service advances in years. But a significant part is due to the drop in passengers over the past two years. This is a concerning trend. Passengers/hour is another key indicator of transit efficiency. For Dial-A-Ride services it can reflect on dispatch and driver efficiency. With that said, however, it should be noted that ROTA DAR carried significantly fewer passengers/hour than most mid-sized (i.e., those carrying between 25,000 and 70,000 passengers/year), local, general public dial-a-ride services in the state in 1998-99, as charted from the State Controller=s Report. This is an observation more than a concern. The average of the 17 operators in that spreadsheet was 7.78 passengers/hour. Only one of those operators carried fewer than the 1999-2000 ROTA total of 3.40 passengers/hour. The primary reason for this appears to be the geography of the service, which operates in two, separated cities. Because many ROTA trips are between cities, this causes this indicator to drop. The fact that passengers/hour has increased for ROTA since 1995-96 indicates, 1) increased efficiency of dispatching, 2) a larger percentage of trips staying in one city, or 3) a combination of the two.

8) ROTA DAR carried 0.29 passengers/mile in 2000-01, a new record. Since 1995-96 the passengers/mile has increased 8.1% annually. This is an excellent trend. This statistic has increased in all but one year since the beginning of ROTA. This trend suggests that a growing number of trips are remaining in one city, as opposed to traveling between cities. This is good. In 1999-2000 ROTA carried fewer passengers/mile than the comparable operators charted in 1998-99, and for the same reasons noted above. Though ROTA is clearly improving internally, the 1999-2000 measure was 45.9% of the average of the 17 listed operators. This is an observation more than a concern. Because it is often harder to picture a fraction of a passenger per mile, staff has inverted this measure to make it easier to interpret. In 2000-01 ROTA DAR traveled 3.5 miles/passenger, as compared to 5.2 miles/passenger in 1995-96. The 1998-99 average miles/passenger for the 17 operators in that spreadsheet was 1.99. The greater distance appears, as with passengers/hour, to relate to the geography of the service area.

9) Employees for ROTA DAR worked an average of 802 hours/employee in 2000-01. The hours/employee has ranged from 762 to 1,039 during the years it has been measured. This is not clearly a measure of efficiency, and is stated as an observation.

10) ROTA DAR operated with eight transit vehicles and one spare at the end of the 2000-01 fiscal year.

11) ROTA DAR operated with a farebox ratio of 10.7% in 2000-01. This exceeds the 10% minimum reflected in both the Transportation Development Act and in the Regional Transportation Plan. This statistic dropped from 16.7% in 1997-98, which was the highest year recorded to date. A 6% drop in three years is a disturbing trend. ROTA should review steps to reverse this trend.

12) ROTA DAR operated at a cost of \$2.53/mile in 2000-01. This was 18.0% higher than 1999-2000. Since 1995-96 the cost/mile has increased an average of 0.1% annually, but since 1997-98 it has increased an average of 17.1% annually, or a total of \$.95/mile. This is an alarming trend. With this stated, ROTA was lower than all but one operator in the 1998-99 comparison spreadsheet, and far lower than the average of \$4.10/mile. This is excellent.

13) ROTA DAR operated at 15.71 miles/hour in 2000-01. This is the lowest speed recorded to date. There is no Regional Transportation Plan standard for dial-a-ride operators for this measure. ROTA has averaged between 15.76 and 19.98 miles/hour in prior years. The reduction suggests that more time was spent in the cities than in past years, as was suggested by the passengers/mile. The average comparable 1998-99 system operated at 13.6 miles/hour. Again they functioned primarily within cities.

14) ROTA DAR collected \$54,539 in fare revenue in 2000-01. This was 22.8% lower than 1999-2000. The fares collected in 2000-01 were the lowest since 1996-97. Passenger totals were also the worst since 1996-97, so this is partially to be expected. There has been a strong correlation between revenue and passenger trends. This is still an expected trend.

15) As noted at the beginning of this chapter, the regular fare for ROTA DAR is \$1.00/passenger, with some additional fares charged for service to outlying areas, and some discounts. The average fare/passenger in 2000-01 was \$0.95. During the six years of operation this has ranged from \$.82 to \$1.09, with an overall average of \$.99. This indicates that a significant percentage of the passengers start and end their trips on ROTA DAR, and that children and multi-zone trips represent only a small percentage of the passengers on the system. This is an acceptable trend.

16) ROTA DAR collected \$4.25/hour in fares during 2000-01. This was 6.7% lower than the prior year. Since 1996-97 the fare/hour has increased 2.2% annually, but the rate is \$.40/hour less than in 1997-98. This reduction is a concerning trend. In addition, it was significantly lower than the average in the 1998-99 comparison spreadsheet, \$6.55/hour. This again is probably the result of the geography of the service area.

17) ROTA DAR collected \$.27/mile in fares during 2000-01. This was 6.4% lower than 1999-2000. This is reflective of the fact that total fares decreased than mileage. Since 1995-96 the fare/mile has increased 5.0% annually. When graphed, the increase is a consistent. This is a good trend. The 1999-2000 figure was 43.6% lower than the 1998-99 average fare/mile among the 17 comparable operators in the spreadsheet, \$.51. This is an observation rather than a concern. This is again probably due to the geography of the service area.

18) ROTA DAR had a net operating cost, or subsidy of \$455,171 during 2000-01. Since 1995-96 the average annual increase has been 7.6%. Since 1997-98 the increase has averaged 10.8% annually. This is a concerning trend.

19) ROTA DAR had a subsidy/passenger of \$7.90 in 2000-01. Since 1995-96 this has dropped an average of 7.9% annually, but since 1997-98 it has increased an average of 13.6% annually. This is a concerning trend.

20) ROTA DAR had a subsidy/hour of \$35.49 in 2000-01. Since 1995-96 this has dropped an average of 3.1% annually, but since 1997-98 it has increased an average of 15.2% annually. This is a concerning trend.

21) ROTA DAR had a subsidy/mile of \$2.26 in 2000-01. Since 1995-96 this has dropped an average of 0.4% annually, but since 1997-98 it has increased an average of 19.8% annually. This is a concerning trend.

In summary, the efficiency trends for ROTA DAR can generally be divided into those showing improvement or constancy since 1995-96 and those which have changed direction since 1997-98. Those generally improving since 1995-95 include the following:

- 1) Passengers/Mile are up an average of 8.1% annually. This is excellent.
- 2) Fare/Mile are up an average of 5.0% annually. This is good.
- 3) Miles/Hour are down an average of 2.7% annually. This is acceptable.
- 5) Fare/Passenger are down an average of 2.8% annually. This is acceptable.

Those showing changes since 1997-98 are as follows:

- 6) Fare/Hour is down an average of 2.9% annually. This is a concern.
- 5) Passengers/Hour are down an average of 3.7% annually.* This is a concern.
- 2) Cost/Passenger are up an average of 11.0% annually. This is a concern.
- 3) Cost/Hour are up an average of 12.6% annually. This is a concern.
- 7) Subsidy/Passenger is up an average of 13.6% annually. This is a concern.
- 1) Farebox Ratios are down an average of 13.8% annually. This is a concern.
- 8) Subsidy/Hour is up an average of 15.2% annually. This is a concern.
- 4) Cost/Mile are up an average of 17.1% annually. This is a concern.
- 9) Subsidy/Mile is up an average of 19.8% annually. This is a concern.

* The trend reversed in 1998-99.

ROTA has committed itself to converting to a fixed route service during the 2002-03 fiscal year. The ROTA Board is reviewing various options of fixed route service, including questions of headway, route configuration, the number of buses, whether buses should travel in the same or opposite directions, and whether each City should have its own route.

A goal of fixed route service is to serve an equal or greater number of passengers through use of fewer buses operating for approximately the same number of hours. The initial cost/hour of operation for the service will certainly exceed the current cost/hour for ROTA DAR, which was \$39.74/hour in 2000-01. As a comparison, the City of Turlock uses small fixed route buses, comparable in size to those ROTA is purchasing. During its first year of operation, 1998-99 its service cost \$64.34/hour to operate. By 2000-01 this had dropped to \$46.31/hour. During 1998-99 Turlock fixed route service carried 7.98 passengers/hour, as compared to 4.84 passengers/hour in ROTA's highest year. By 2000-01 Turlock

was up to 12.03 passengers/hour (preliminary StanCOG records show 2001-02 was 13.83 passengers/hour). Turlock cost \$3.85/passenger in 2000-01 compared with \$8.85/passenger for ROTA. The Turlock subsidy/passenger in 2000-01 was \$3.18, compared with \$7.90 for ROTA.

Fixed route service will require ROTA to establish some form of ADA service within 1/4 mile of the fixed route, for those who are eligible. Furthermore, general public dial-a-ride service would continue for the remainder of the service area more than 1/4 mile from fixed route service.

It is standard to drop the Transit Productivity Analysis during the first two complete fiscal years after the initiation of a new transit service. There will be a notation of the 2001-02 statistics for ROTA in the next Transit Systems Management Report, but as the fixed route service should be in operation at that time, there should not be any recommended improvements.

There are those who question the wisdom of converting to a fixed route operation. An excellent example of the change in service volume and efficiency when a fixed route service (BLAST) is introduced is the City of Turlock (others could be used, but it is both local and very recent). The following statistics for Turlock are designed to show the systemwide benefits of introducing fixed route service.

	1997-8 DAR	2000-1 BLAST	2000-1 DAR	2000-1 Combined
Passengers	78,995	123,209	23,675	146,884
Passengers/Hour	6.19	12.03	4.18	9.24
Cost/Passenger	\$7.38	\$3.85	\$18.06	\$6.14
Farebox Ratio	17.5%	17.3%	9.5%	13.6%
Average Fare	\$1.29	\$0.67	\$1.71	\$0.83

RECOMMENDATION FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT

1) Continue pursuing Fixed Route service. Of the 13 efficiency measures reviewed, nine demonstrated increasing inefficiency of the present ROTA system. The inefficiency is characterized by: 1) rapidly increasing operating costs; 2) dropping fare revenue; and, 3) dropping passenger counts. The existing demand responsive service appears to have reached its peak efficiency one or two years ago. StanCOG praises the ROTA Board for its efforts to date to obtain fixed route vehicles. StanCOG recommends that the ROTA Board quickly complete all other preparations for its fixed route service.

STANISLAUS REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM

OVERVIEW

Stanislaus Regional Transit, operating as StaRT, is a division of the Stanislaus County Department of Public Works. During 2000-01 it provided nine public transit services. Eight of these services were operated under contract with Storer Transit Systems.

As a nonurban transit operator, StaRT provides three varieties of transit services. The most visible is the Intercity Fixed Route service, operating primarily from Modesto=s Downtown Transportation Center outward in three directions, toward Turlock, Oakdale, and the West Side of the County. These routes serve ten communities in Stanislaus County and one in Merced County. The one exception is part of a new service known as the Westside Runabout - to be further described later in the text - which operates between Newman and Turlock as a fixed route.

The other service is demand responsive. StaRT offers six different demand responsive services. In 1999-2000 the staff at StaRT did a thorough review of the conditions, abilities, goals, and potential improvements for the demand responsive services operated by StaRT at that time. The result was the development of a new form of demand responsive service, known as the "Runabout". The Runabout was designed as a "deviated-fixed-route" service. What this means is that within the "service area" there were certain scheduled stops, as is true of a fixed route. But within the service area of each Runabout a passenger could call for a ride, as with a standard dial-a-ride service. After a year of operation it became clear that some of the scheduled stops were not being used. StaRT management has modified two of the Runabouts to operate with only one timed stop, in Downtown Modesto. The following four Runabout services are operated by StaRT:

- 1) The **Eastside Runabout** was created to satisfy an Unmet Transit Need in the Riverbank and Oakdale Areas. It was found that the disabled living in the ROTA service area could not obtain transit to Modesto for any purpose other than a doctor's appointment. StaRT volunteered to establish this service to meet the identified need of the disabled who desired to go to work, school, or other destinations in Modesto. The service operates between Oakdale and the Downtown Modesto Transit Center three times daily, Monday through Friday. This service has a timed it is scheduled to operate in the Oakdale and Riverbank areas, but the only timed stop is in downtown Modesto.
- 2) The **Turlock Runabout** is one of two services created to replace the former Central Dial-A-Ride. Central Dial-A-Ride was very inefficient. The inefficiency of that service dragged down the efficiency of the entire system. The Turlock Runabout was originally designed with scheduled stops in Turlock, Keyes, Ceres and at the County Facilities at Hackett and Crows Landing Roads. In the first few months of service there were no passengers board at the scheduled stops other than Turlock and the Downtown Modesto Transit Center, so the middle three were eliminated. Later on even the Turlock timed stop was eliminated, though the schedule identifies a time when the service will be in the Turlock area. The service area includes Keyes, Ceres, the community of Denair, as well as the Monterrey Park Tract, the Cowan Tract, and the Riverdale Park area. All of Turlock and Modesto are also in the service area. When the Turlock Runabout was established, the StaRT administration chose to eliminate those areas of agricultural lands within approximately five miles of the San Joaquin River. When Central Dial-A-Ride served this area there were few passengers who used the service, and when they did call it created a great hardship for the system.
- 3) The **Waterford Runabout** is the other service created to replace Central Dial-A-Ride. This has been a very popular service. The Runabout includes scheduled stops in Waterford (a second scheduled stop was created in late 2001), Hughson, Empire, and at the Downtown Modesto Transit Center. The

service includes the community of Hickman and the large Mobile Home Park on Jantzen, east of Geer Road, as well as most of Modesto. All of Waterford, Hughson, and Empire are also served. The service area extends north to the Eastside Runabout service area (Claribel Road west of Claus, Patterson Road between Claus and Albers), and south to the Turlock Runabout service area (Grayson Road, between Pioneer and Hickman Roads). The service operates three times daily, Monday through Saturday (Saturday service was established in late 2001, based upon the rapid increase in passengers). All of the original timed stops have been maintained.

The former Central Dial-A-Ride service has been primarily replaced by the Turlock and Waterford Runabout services. During the last year of Central Dial-A-Ride the service averaged 1.17 passengers/hour. During its first year of operation the Turlock Runabout averaged 1.62 passengers/hour and the Waterford Runabout averaged 1.64 passengers/hour. For 2001-02 the Turlock Runabout averaged 1.84 passengers/hour, and the Waterford Runabout carried 2.88 passengers/hour. This is considered a major success.

4) The **Westside Runabout** operates differently from the above three services. During three periods of the day the service operates as a traditional dial-a-ride service, offering service to all of the west part of Stanislaus County between the San Joaquin River and Interstate 5. Between those time periods, however, the Runabout operates as a fixed route service. The route begins in Newman, with stops in Crows Landing, Patterson, and seven stops in Turlock, then returns by the same route to Newman. This is designed to satisfy requests from some Patterson and Newman residents to be able to get to Turlock, primarily for College and Doctor's appointments.

5) StaRT began to operate the **Patterson Dial-A-Ride** service in January of 2000. The service operates with one van, within the city limits. The service has been very successful. The service hours have been increased due to the level of demand by the residents of Patterson. In its last complete fiscal year in operation by the City of Patterson - 1998-99 - the service carried 3,833 passengers, with an average of 2.22 passengers/hour. During the first complete fiscal year of operation by StaRT, 2000-01, the service carried 9,825 passengers, with an average of 4.82 passengers/hour. During 2001-02 this went up to 13,467 passengers, with 4.6 passengers/hour. StaRT has focused on various additional services to meet the needs of the residents of Patterson.

6) **MediVan** offers transportation for non-emergency hospital patients going to Bay Area hospitals. The service operates from the Downtown Modesto Transit Center at 6:30 a.m. It is available for anyone in the County. The MediVan operates Monday through Thursdays, except Holidays. Passengers are requested to schedule and pay for their rides in advance.

StaRT installed bike-racks on its vehicles (except MediVan) in 1997. StaRT was the first service in Stanislaus County to install these racks. This service has been especially popular on the fixed routes. Each rack holds up to two bikes. The service has been popular enough that the City of Turlock installed bike-racks on the BLAST buses, and the City of Modesto installed racks on its MAX buses in the 1999-2000 fiscal year.

StaRT completed a Short-Range and a Long-Range Transit Plan in 2001. The Runabout services were the biggest changes resulting from the Plan.

FIXED ROUTE SERVICES

The following fixed route services all radiate from the Modesto Transportation Center in downtown Modesto. Transfers between any of these routes and MAX routes or Modesto Dial-A-Ride are available from that point. Starting in 2000-2001, StaRT fixed routes will only pick-up passengers at designated stops within towns - a change from past policies permitting passengers to Aflag-down the bus

anywhere along the system. Between towns, a passenger may flag-down a bus between the last stop of the prior town and the first stop of the next town, so long as the location is safe for a bus to stop. In addition, effective July 10, 2000, all three of the fixed routes to Modesto include stops at Modesto Junior College.

In July 2001 StaRT initiated additional service between Modesto and Turlock. Route 10, operating on Highway 99 between Downtown Modesto and Turlock’s Central Park, operates as an “Express” route. Route 15 operates on the frontage roads along the east side of Highway 99, through Ceres and Keyes. It includes seven stops in Ceres and three stops in Keyes. Route 10 has 12 stops in Turlock, and Route 15 has 13 stops in Turlock.

MODESTO-TURLOCK ROUTE

In 2000-01 the Modesto-Turlock route was a fixed route operating ten round trips daily, Monday through Friday, and four Saturday round trips. The route began at the Downtown Modesto Transportation Center, with one timed stop in downtown Ceres, two timed stops in Keyes, and ten timed stops in Turlock, ending at Central Park, on Golden State Blvd (a timed stop for two BLAST routes and the one Stanislaus County stop for the Merced Area Regional Transit bus). The route through Turlock was (and still is) approximately reversed in the afternoon, for increased efficiency. The return trip included a stop at Modesto Junior College for five of the daily runs (currently Route 10 stops there six times daily, and Route 15 four times daily). The service included one morning and one evening express run (no stops in Ceres or Keyes) from Modesto to Turlock, and two morning and one evening express runs from Turlock to Modesto and three trips on Saturdays. The Modesto-Turlock route operated from 5:20 a.m. (presently 5:15) to 8:40 p.m. (currently 9:06), Monday through Friday, and from 6:20 a.m. through 7:45 p.m. on Saturdays (this was continued, using Route 15 alone). The Saturday bus travels between Turlock and Oakdale, operating as the Modesto-Turlock Bus then as the Modesto-Riverbank-Oakdale Bus. The route includes five stops at the Vintage Faire Mall. This is the busiest StaRT route, both in total passengers and in passengers-per-hour. The service is fully accessible to persons with disabilities.

MODESTO-RIVERBANK-OAKDALE SERVICE

The Modesto-Riverbank-Oakdale service is a fixed-route which operates Monday through Friday, 6:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m., and on Saturdays from 7:45 a.m. to 6:11 p.m. In 2000 the route through Modesto was modified; the bus now travels north on College Avenue to Briggsmore Avenue, then east to McHenry Avenue (Hwy 108). This avoids the need of a transfer for the Oakdale and Riverbank area passengers going to Modesto Junior College, and avoids the congestion on McHenry south of Briggsmore Avenue. There are eight timed stops in Modesto, eight timed stops in Riverbank, and seven timed stops in Oakdale. The service is accessible to persons with disabilities. Transfers to ROTA and MAX service are available. Monday through Friday service stops twice daily at the Hershey Plant. The Saturday service stops at the Vintage Faire Mall on the way between downtown Modesto and Riverbank. On weekdays there are seven daily runs. On Saturdays, the bus is shared with the Modesto-Turlock route, and operates four times to Riverbank and Oakdale. This is the second busiest StaRT route, both in total passengers and in passengers-per-hour.

WESTSIDE STAGE

The Westside Stage began full service on May 15, 1991. The Stage operates four round trips daily between Modesto and Gustine, serving Grayson, Westley, Patterson, Crows Landing, and Newman. It

also stops at the County Center at Crows Landing and Hackett Roads. The service was expanded from three to four buses per day in February, 1999. Operation hours are between 6:05 a.m. and 8:15 p.m., Monday through Friday, and on Saturday, between 7:45 a.m. and 7:55 p.m. Service begins in the morning in Gustine, and ends in Modesto in the evenings. This wheelchair-accessible bus holds 40 passengers, and is operated through a contract with Storer Transit Systems. This route is the third busiest of the StaRT routes. The first two runs include stops at Modesto Junior College.

FARES

Stanislaus Regional Transit fixed route services operate with the following fares:

One Way	
Regular and Student	\$.75
Senior (65 & over) and Disabled	\$.50
Transfers to MAX, Ceres, ROTA, BLAST	\$.25
Children under 5 ride free - limit 1 free child per paying adult.	
Ticket Books	
Regular	\$12.75 (20 tickets)
Senior (age 65 and over)	\$10.00 (20 tickets)
Disabled	\$10.00 (20 tickets)
20 Ride Student Bus Card	\$11.00

Complaints

Complaints for the Stanislaus Regional Transit services may be received for fixed route, Runabouts, and Dial-A-Rides at (800) 262-1516, for Medi-Van at (888) 558-7383. An additional Customer Comment Line is (800) 668-1884; Customer Comment forms are on all StaRT buses, and complaints may be written to the StaRT web site, at www.srt.org. TDD service is available at (209) 527-3546.

SERVICE STANDARDS

The following measures the performance of Stanislaus Regional Transit against the transit service standards in the Regional Transportation Plan.

Accessibility

Stanislaus Regional Transit services operate throughout most of the County, including part or all of all nine cities in the County, and also most of the unincorporated communities.

Transfers are available between all StaRT services, and to all other transit services in the County. All service is accessible to persons with disabilities.

- A-1: In 2000-01 unincorporated Stanislaus County had several areas which meet the Federal criteria of "urbanized":
 - 1) The developed unincorporated areas around the cities of Modesto and Ceres
 - 2) The community of Salida
 - 3) The community of Keyes

In May of 2002 the Census Bureau identified the urbanized areas of the nation, based on the 2000 Census. The Modesto urbanized area was expanded to include the cities of Riverbank and Hughson. The Modesto urbanized area now also includes the communities of Empire and Del Rio, as well as the developed unincorporated areas around Riverbank. A new urbanized area, Turlock, includes the community of Denair and some developed unincorporated areas around Turlock.

Based upon the standards present during the 2000-01 fiscal year, StaRT was meeting the standards in areas #1 and #3 mentioned above. Less than 70% of Salida is served by fixed route service, and less than 100% is served by general public dial-a-ride service.

- A-2: Stanislaus Regional Transit provides most of the bus routes between the cities of the County, where most of the "major activity centers" of the county are located, as well as servicing most of the towns in the County. Some regional recreational sites and a few semi-industrial sites are located outside of the service area, but no demand for service to those sites has been recorded.
- A-3: The urbanized areas of unincorporated Stanislaus County include some concentrations of transportation disadvantaged persons. These are mostly served by the Waterford/Modesto Runabout, the Turlock/Modesto Runabout, the Modesto-Turlock Bus and portions by either Modesto Dial-A-Ride, Ceres Dial-A-Ride, MAX, BLAST, or DART.
- A-4: All Stanislaus Regional Transit buses are equipped with wheelchair lifts.
- A-5: Stanislaus Regional Transit receives both Federal and Transportation Development Act funds for transit operation. Stanislaus Regional Transit vehicles are ADA accessible. Stanislaus Regional Transit conforms to all laws and regulations for service to persons with disabilities required for a Federal Transit Administration designated commuter service.
- A-6: NA – StaRT is not designed as an urban service.

Convenience

All fixed-route services are two-directional. Service is provided to major activity centers along each route. Demand-responsive services transport a passenger to any destination within the service area.

B-1: In 2000-01 Stanislaus Regional Transit operated four fixed routes which passed through urbanized areas. The County records evaluate the average operating speed for each fixed route based upon the total length of the route, rather than differentiating between urbanized and non-urbanized portions of the route. Calculations include total revenue hours, including layovers, so calculated speeds are less than operating speeds. (Note, all average speed calculations are made by StanCOG staff.)

Modesto-Turlock	24.45 miles/hour
Modesto-Riverbank-Oakdale	19.31 miles/hour
Westside Stage	30.05 miles/hour
Westside Runabout	22.48 miles/hour

B-2: Though StaRT routes are not urban, they are designed as loop routes.

- B-3: Fewer than 5% of the Stanislaus Regional Transit riders transfer between County fixed routes. A much larger percentage transfer between Regional routes and MAX routes. A small number also transfer from the Modesto-Turlock and Westside Runabout to BLAST routes.
- B-4: The schedules for each fixed route identify the times the bus reaches the identified transfer points.
- B-5: Stanislaus Regional Transit fixed routes connect nonurbanized and urbanized areas of the County to downtown Modesto, and the standard is not applicable to those routes.
- B-6-a: NA – StaRT does not operate any immediate response services.
- B-6-b-i: The policy of Stanislaus Regional Transit is to maintain an average deviation time between estimated and actual pick-up time to 15 minutes or less for the Runabout and Dial-A-Ride systems. Computerized systems were placed in each bus in 1994, making the exact location of each bus known during service hours. The system began to document exact and estimated pick-up times for all pick-ups starting in early 1995. This continues to apply in the Runabout scheme.
- B-6-b-ii: Passengers of Patterson Dial-A-Ride may reserve rides up to two hours before the ride.
- B-6-b-iii: Passengers may reserve rides up to seven days before their ride on the Runabouts.
- B-6-b-iv: NA – StaRT does not operate any local demand responsive service for the elderly or disabled.
- B-7: StaRT fixed routes have designated stops in each community, each of which have signs. Stops with large numbers of daily boarding or departing passengers also have benches. In Modesto, Turlock and Ceres there are bus shelters also.
- B-8: StaRT routes are designed to operate with local services, and to serve the local communities efficiently.

Reliability

Fixed-route buses arrive within five minutes of scheduled arrival times. Demand-responsive vehicles will arrive on time for passengers who have made previous arrangements. All available demand-responsive vehicles are kept operational.

- C-1: Drivers are instructed not to depart from scheduled stops before the published times for the route.
- C-2-a: The contract between Stanislaus Regional Transit and Storer Transit Systems requires Storer to insure that the contracted number of vehicles necessary to operate the fixed routes on schedule will be provided. Storer maintains spare vehicles in its fleet.
- C-2-b: The contract between Stanislaus Regional Transit and Storer Transit Systems requires Storer to insure that the contracted number of vehicles are provided on a daily basis. Storer maintains spare vehicles in its fleet.

Comfort

Benches or shelters are provided at major stops along fixed routes and at all transfer points. All Stanislaus Regional Transit services are provided with vehicles equipped with heating and air conditioning.

- D-1: A seat is available for all passengers on most routes. During peak hours on the Modesto-Turlock route passengers are often required to stand due to a lack of seats. In March, 1998, the 7:10 route from Turlock began to have too many passengers, even for standing room, for the bus. A solution was developed; prior to going into service in the morning, one of the Central Dial-A-Ride buses was used as a Atripper for that run of the Modesto-Turlock route, carrying the over-flow passengers from Turlock to Modesto immediately following the regular bus, on the same schedule. In March of 1999 the Modesto-Turlock route peaked at 9,725 passengers, and gradually slid. StaRT staff concluded that passengers were not satisfied with the crowding during the rush hour periods. The conclusion resulted in the creation of two routes between Modesto and Turlock. There does not appear to be any overcrowding presently, though the combined ridership has not exceeded 9,350 since the creation of the new route structure. Overcrowding is not present on any of the other routes.
D-2: There are only two stops where over 75 passengers board or exit per day, Turlock Central Park and the Modesto Transportation Center, both of which have adequate shelters.
D-3: All vehicles include both air conditioning and heating for year round comfort.

Performance

- E-1: The 2000-01 productivity for both the fixed and demand responsive services are included in the transit productivity analysis section, at the end of the chapter.
E-2: During the 2000-01 fiscal year Stanislaus Regional Transit fixed routes had a 15.4% fare box ratio, its Dial-A-Ride had a 7.6% fare box ratio, and the system as a whole had an 12.2% fare box ratio. The Transportation Development Act calls for the system as a whole to operate at a minimum 10% fare box ratio. The Regional Transportation Plan has established a minimum 10% standard for both the fixed route and demand responsive services.
E-3: This did not apply to the fixed route service in 2000-01, except for the addition of the fixed route portion of the Westside Runabout (which is accounted as a demand responsive service). However, due to the significant changes to the demand responsive services, this does apply there.
E-4: Because the farebox ratio for the demand responsive service was 7.6%, which is more than 10%, this standard has been met.

Marketing

Pamphlets on Stanislaus Regional Transit services are available to the public from the transit operators. The brochure is also available in Spanish. In addition, Stanislaus Regional Transit advertises in local English and Spanish newspapers and radio stations and on its web site, www.srt.org. The branches of

the public library system make the brochure available and regularly notify the transit personnel when more copies are needed. In addition, pamphlets are made available at various locations throughout the County, including: Healthy Start, in Newman; the Patterson City Hall; the Oakdale Welcome Center; and, the Turlock Chamber of Commerce offices.

- F-1: Stanislaus Regional Transit produced a new ARide Guide in the May of 1997, which includes the required information, and a smaller APocket Guide including the schedules, in July 2001. The Pocket Guide is updated approximately every six months. StaRT information is also available 24 hours/day through its 1-800-262-1516 telephone number and its web site, www.srt.org.
 - F-2: Stanislaus Regional Transit has marketed this information to the Hispanic community through translation of much of the brochure into Spanish, and has co-sponsored Hispanic Community events. In addition it has purchased a telephone translation service which makes translations of the materials in the brochure available to people who speak any of 140 different languages.
- The Regional Transportation Plan specifically notes marketing the transit service to persons with disabilities and to the elderly. Stanislaus Regional Transit currently transports many persons with disabilities who are served by the Valley Mountain Regional Center; that agency purchases many tickets for its clients on a monthly basis. Stanislaus Regional Transit markets specifically to the elderly population through radio and newspaper advertising.
- F-3: Stanislaus Regional Transit makes copies of its Transit Guide available at the Greyhound Bus depots in Modesto and Turlock. Copies are also available at the Amtrak station in Modesto.
 - F-4: Stanislaus Regional Transit has a website, www.srt.org, with very thorough information regarding the system.

Management

Stanislaus Regional Transit is operated under the Stanislaus County Public Works Department. Operating data is compiled on a monthly basis. Annual reports are prepared by Stanislaus Regional Transit staff.

- G-1: Stanislaus Regional Transit maintains in their office all of the required information except for, "In-service vehicle breakdowns", which is kept in the offices of Storer Transit Systems. The contract between Stanislaus Regional Transit and Storer Transit Systems requires Storer to cover routes with additional vehicles from their fleet when one of the vehicles breaks down.
- G-2: Stanislaus Regional Transit keeps records of both schedule adherence and response times. In 1994, Stanislaus Regional Transit installed a computer monitoring system in all of their buses which keeps record of the exact location of every vehicle in the fleet at all times. StaRT uses the Paratransit Automated Scheduling Software (APASS) and Mobile Data Terminals (AMDTs) to monitor the system's on-time performance. StaRT has a Performance Incentive Program that monitors the contractor's operations.
- G-3: The contract with Storer Transit Systems makes them responsible for the replacement of all vehicles in their fleet. The one vehicle owned by the County is the bus serving the Medi-van

service. Because the Stanislaus Regional Transit fleet is owned by Storer Transit Systems, which also owns many charter vehicles, Stanislaus Regional Transit is not subject to standard G-3-c. StaRT has purchased a second bus, for the Eastside Runabout service. StaRT owns the Patterson Dial-A-Ride bus.

G-4: StaRT, through the use of an intern, has surveyed its passengers during 1998/99. StaRT also conducted passenger surveys as a part of its Long-Range Transit Plan. The computer noted above keeps records concerning all of the riders on the Dial-A-Ride service and also many of the fixed-route riders. Stanislaus Regional Transit cooperated with StanCOG in a January 1994 on-board survey of all transit systems in the County. Stanislaus Regional Transit initiated a Short Range Transit Plan and a Long Range Transit Plan in 1999. A passenger survey was included in the research for those projects. Since that time, StaRT has surveyed its passengers twice in 2001-02.

G-5: Storer Transit Systems is responsible for the maintenance and maintenance records for all of the Stanislaus Regional Transit vehicles which they own. Those records are available to the Stanislaus Regional Transit management.

In summary, StaRT is satisfying the Regional Transportation Plan Transit Standards in most matters. Specific concerns relate to the following matter:

A-1: The communities of Salida and Del Rio may not be adequately served with general public transit.

PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENTS

Section 99244 of the Public Utilities Code requires StanCOG to identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements each year which could lower the operating costs of those who operate at least 50 percent of their vehicle service miles within its jurisdiction. Recommendations related to productivity are also made in the Triennial Performance Audit, required in Section 99246 of the Public Utilities Code. The most recent Triennial Performance Audit for StanCOG was prepared in 2001, and contained recommendations based on the fiscal years 1997-98 through 1999-2000. That Audit contained two recommendations for Stanislaus Regional Transit. They were as follows:

- "1) Stanislaus Regional Transit has attempted to resolve the productivity and efficiency deficiencies of the Dial-A-Ride system by implementing a flex-type system named "Runabout". We believe this is an improvement to the system. We recommend this service be monitored closely to measure the effect on farebox recovery and other performance measures required under the Transportation Development Act.
- "2) The system of compiling, categorizing, and reporting complaints/comments to the management of the Stanislaus Regional Transit System needs strengthening. Currently, management records complaints/comments that are directly received from passengers through the website or other direct correspondence. The contract operator, Storer Transit Systems, communicates significant complaints/comments it receives to management. However, the documentation of the complaints/comments appears weak. We recommend that complaints/comments received by the contract operator should be compiled, categorized, and forwarded to Stanislaus Regional Transit's management. Management should have the opportunity to evaluate the nature and extent of all complaints/comments received in the system. We recommend that County Staff and the contractor work together to develop a system to compile, categorize, and report complaints/comments received by the contractor."

The auditor followed these recommendations with this statement:

“Overall, our audit indicates Stanislaus Regional Transit is functioning well. One of the most important goals of any public transit agency is to attain increased public utilization of the system. THE data we obtained and analyzed indicates this goal is being realized.”

SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS

Stanislaus Regional Transit reviews its transit services on a monthly basis. As noted above, it initiated a Short Range Transit Plan and a Long Range Transit Plan in 1999. Those Plans have evaluated many opportunities to improve both service and efficiency for the entire Stanislaus Regional Transit system. Furthermore, through the Transit Cost Sharing process, the ten jurisdictions within Stanislaus County annually review the transit operations countywide, as a whole, in comparison to the established transit needs, to determine how the Local Transportation Funds available countywide should best be spent to meet those needs. Finally, StanCOG expects to initiate a Regional Transit Plan in the 2000-2001 fiscal year. A goal of that Plan will be a determination of how to best serve the transit needs of the entire County over the next 20 years.

TRANSIT PRODUCTIVITY ANALYSIS

The Transportation Development Act (TDA) requires StanCOG to annually analyze each public transit operation in light of the following performance indicators: 1) Operating Cost; 2) Passengers; 3) Revenue Hours; 4) Revenue Miles; 5) Cost/Passenger; 6) Cost/Hour; 7) Passenger/Hour; 8) Passenger/Mile; 9) Hours/Employee; 10) Vehicle Count; and, 11) Farebox Ratio.

Transit Cost Sharing is a process in TDA Law specific to Stanislaus County. It was created in 1998, and is used to review the costs of transit proposals in claims for the upcoming fiscal year. It reviews the Net Operating Cost, i.e., the Operating Cost less the Fare Revenue. This is also known as the Subsidy, below.

The StanCOG Regional Transportation Plan requires us to review the, 1) Cost/Mile and, 2) Miles/Hour. Additional information needed to review these indicators are the number of employees and the fare revenue.

While not required, staff has tracked several additional statistics. Some of them do little more than better communicate data tracked above. Others address issues staff consider crucial. The additional data are: 1) Minutes/Passenger (another way to picture Passengers/Hour, used only for Dial-A-Rides); 2) Miles/Passenger (another way to picture Passengers/Mile, used primarily for Dial-A-Rides, to avoid “percentages of persons” per mile); 3) Average Fare/Passenger; 4) Average Fare/Hour; 5) Average Fare/Mile; 6) Daily Peak Vehicles; 7) Subsidy/Passenger (equals Cost/Passenger minus Fare/Passenger); 8) Subsidy/Hour (equals Cost/Hour minus Fare/Hour); and, 9) Subsidy/Mile (equals Cost/Mile minus Fare/Mile).

Because the Stanislaus Regional Transit operations are divided between fixed route and Demand Responsive, each of which is accounted separately, this analysis will review each operation point by point, beginning with the fixed route service, with any proposed recommendations at the end of each analysis. The StaRT Fixed Route service significantly increased its hours in 1993-94, so trend analysis is from that year. StaRT Demand Responsive service made major changes in 2000-01, so there is no ability to make any legitimate trend analysis, except to note how efficient the new service is compared with the prior.

Fixed Route Analysis

- 1) StaRT fixed route services had an operating cost of \$787,676 in 2000-01. This was 10.2% higher than 1999-2000. This increase is not in itself a concern. The concern will be seen in efficiency measures related to operating cost. Operating costs have grown an average of 5.2% annually since 1993-94.
2) StaRT fixed route services carried 170,363 passengers in 2000-01. This was 5.9% lower than 1999-2000, which was a record year. Ridership has grown an average of 4.4% per year since 1993-94. This is a good trend. Due to the significant drop in increase in ridership from 1998-99 to 1999-2000, and again to 2000-01, StaRT initiated the two bus system between Modesto and Turlock in July of 2001. This is hoped to reverse the present trend.
3) StaRT fixed route services operated for 11,248 hours in 2000-01. This was 9.4% higher than 1999-2000. Vehicle service hours had remained between 10,114 and 10,284 hours since 1993-94. Prior to that the service hours were significantly lower. The increase is due to additional service to Modesto Junior College and additional service on the Saturday Modesto Turlock Route. Hours have increased an average of 1.5% annually since 1993-94.
4) StaRT fixed route services operated 277,652 miles in 2000-01. This was 7.4% higher than 1999-2000. Vehicle service miles had remained between 242,857 and 258,644 since 1993-94. The largest increase is due to increased service to Modesto Junior College by all three routes, as well as the above noted Saturday expansion of the Modesto-Turlock Route. Mileage has increased an average of 1.7% annually since 1993-94.
5) StaRT fixed route services operated at a cost of \$4.62/passenger in 2000-01. This was 17.1% higher than the prior year, but only \$.05/passenger higher than 1993-94. This is a good trend. Cost/passenger is one of the most significant measures of transit efficiency. This shows that the increase in passengers is almost as great as the increase in operating costs.
6) StaRT fixed route services operated at a cost of \$70.03/hour in 2000-01. This was 0.7% higher than 1999-2000. Cost/hour has grown at an average of only 3.0% annually since 1993-94, a controlled rate. In 1996-97 and 1997-98 this figure was higher.
7) StaRT fixed route services carried 15.2 passengers/hour in 2000-01. This was lower than the prior three years. Growth here indicates that the growth rate in passengers is greater than the growth rate in hours operated. Passengers/hour has increased an average of 2.9% per year since 1993-94. This is a good overall trend.
8) StaRT fixed route services carried 0.61 passengers/mile in 2000-01. This was lower than the prior three years. Growth here indicates that the growth rate in passengers is greater than the growth rate in miles operated. Passengers/mile has increased at 2.7% annually since 1993-94. This is a good overall trend.
9) Employees for StaRT fixed route services worked an average of 865 hours/employee in 2000-01. This is reported as required.

10) StaRT fixed route services operated with 3 transit vehicles at the end of the 2000-01 fiscal year. The maximum number of vehicles operated at any one time, when counting the Atripper≅ bus used at peak hours for the Modesto-Turlock route, was four; the contractor committed to have replacement vehicles available at any time any of the regular vehicles was unavailable.

11) StaRT fixed route services operated with a farebox ratio of 15.4% in 2000-01. This exceeds the 10% minimum reflected in both the Transportation Development Act and in the Regional Transportation Plan. This ratio was lower than the prior three years. The farebox ratio has been on a general upward trend since 1993-94, at about 2.3% annually. This is a good overall trend. It indicates that the rate of fare revenue increases has exceeded the rate of operating cost increases during that period.

12) StaRT fixed route services operated at a cost of \$2.84/mile in 2000-01. This was 2.6% higher than 1999-2000. The cost/mile has increased an average of 2.9% per year since 1993-94. This corresponds closely with the cost/hour statistics, above. It reflects a cost increase which is greater than the mileage increase, but also reflects control over cost increases.

13) StaRT fixed route services operated at 24.7 miles/hour in 2000-01. The Regional Transportation Plan indicates that fixed route transit services in rural areas of Stanislaus County should operate at 18 miles/hour or more. StaRT met the adopted minimum in 2000-01. Since 1993-94, the operating speed has been in a range of 23.7 to 25.2 miles/hour.

14) StaRT fixed route services collected \$121,503 in fare revenue in 2000-01. That was 9.1% lower than 1998-99. It was also lower than 1999-2000. Fare revenues have increased an average of 7.0% annually since 1993-94. This is a good trend.

15) As noted at the beginning of this chapter, the regular fare for StaRT fixed route services was \$.50 to \$.75/passenger, with a \$.25 fee to transfer to Modesto, Ceres, BLAST, or ROTA transit services. With this said, the average fare/passenger in 2000-01 was \$.71. It was lower than 1997-98 and 1998-99. StaRT is being used more as a commuter service. This is a good trend. It means the total fare revenue is increasing at a faster rate than the ridership.

16) StaRT fixed route services collected \$10.80/hour in fares during 2000-01. This was lower than the three prior years. The average has increased 5.4% annually since 1993-94. This is still a good trend. This means fare revenue is increasing at a faster rate than operating hours.

17) StaRT fixed route services collected \$.44/mile in fares during 2000-01. This was lower than the three prior years. The average has increased 5.2% annually since 1993-94. This is still a good trend. This means fare revenue is increasing at a faster rate than operating miles.

18) StaRT fixed routes had a net operating cost – Subsidy - of \$666,173 during 2000-01. This was the highest recorded. This has increased an average of 4.2% annually since 1993-94. It is notable that this value has dropped in three of those seven years. This is good.

19) StaRT fixed routes had a subsidy/passenger of \$3.91 in 2000-01. There have been three years since 1993-94 when this measure has been higher, the highest being \$4.44 in 1996-97. The average has decreased 0.2% annually since 1993-94. This is good. This means the rate of passenger increase has been marginally greater than the rate of subsidy increase.

20) StaRT fixed routes had a subsidy/hour of \$59.23 in 2000-01. This was the second highest recorded. The average increase since 1993-94 has been 2.7%. This is a controlled rate.

21) StaRT fixed routes had a subsidy/mile of \$2.40 in 2000-01. Two past years have been higher. The average increase since 1993-94 has been 2.5%. This is a controlled rate.

In summary, StaRT fixed route services operated less efficiently in 2000-01 than in two previous years, specifically 1998-99 and 1999-2000. Statistics related to operating costs, passengers and fare revenue are still good for 2000-01, and demonstrate generally good trends through the years.

StanCOG staff is required to make recommendations for a productivity improvement in Section 99244 of the Transportation Development Act. Staff has reviewed the points for analysis included in the Transportation Development Act, as well as additional points designed to provide potentially useful information about the StaRT fixed route services.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT

1) **Focus on means to increase the fare revenue.** Though the fixed route system had a higher farebox ratio in 2000-01 than in 1993-94, it has dropped significantly since 1998-99.

2) **Focus on means to increase passengers.** From 1999-2000 to 2000-01 the passenger count dropped by over 10,000. 1998-99 was also higher. StaRT has taken two steps to try to reverse this trend; the expansion of Saturday hours during the 2000-01 fiscal year, and the expansion of the Modesto-Turlock service into two routes in 2001-02. The Westside Runabout – though accounted as a demand responsive service – is functionally designed to add more fixed route passengers as well.

StanCOG offers the following analysis of the StaRT Dial-A-Ride operation in light of the same criteria. As 2000-01 was the start of a completely changed Demand Responsive service style, including four newly created Runabouts and the first full year of Patterson Dial-A-Ride operation, the only comparison will be with 1999-2000, the last year of the former dial-a-ride service.

StaRT Demand Responsive Analysis

- 1) StaRT DAR services had an operating cost of \$558,533 in 2000-01. This was 23.7% higher than 1999-2000.
- 2) StaRT DAR services carried 30,063 passengers in 2000-01. This was 43.9% higher than 1999-2000.
- 3) StaRT DAR services operated for 14,844 hours in 2000-01. This was 37.8% higher than 1999-2000.
- 4) StaRT DAR services operated 276,080 miles in 2000-01. This was 34.0% higher than 1999-2000.
- 5) StaRT DAR services operated at a cost of \$18.58/passenger in 2000-01. This was 14.0% lower than 1999-2000.
- 6) StaRT DAR services operated at a cost of \$37.63/hour in 2000-01. This was 10.3% lower than 1999-2000.

- 7) StaRT DAR services carried 2.03 passengers/hour in 2000-01. This was 4.4% higher than 1999-2000.
- 8) StaRT DAR services carried 0.109 passengers/mile in 2000-01. This was 7.4% higher than 1999-2000. This works out to 9.18 miles/passenger, down 6.9% from 1999-2000.
- 9) Employees for StaRT DAR services worked an average of 742 hours/employee in 2000-01. This is reported as required.
- 10) StaRT DAR services operated with 6 transit vehicles at the end of the 2000-01 fiscal year. This is the same as in 1999-2000.
- 11) StaRT DAR services operated with a farebox ratio of 7.6% in 2000-01. Though below the 10% minimum reflected in the Regional Transportation Plan, the Transportation Development Act allows for calculation of the system as a whole, which was 12.2%, and exceeds the 10% required in that Act. The 2000-01 farebox ratio exceeded 1999-2000 by 29.1%.
- 12) StaRT DAR services operated at a cost of \$2.02/mile in 2000-01. This was 7.7% lower than 1999-2000.
- 13) StaRT DAR services operated at 18.6 miles/hour in 2000-01. There is no standard for dial-a-ride operating speed. This was 2.8% lower than 1999-2000.
- 14) StaRT DAR services collected \$42,287 in fare revenue in 2000-01. This was 59.7% higher than 1999-2000.
- 15) StaRT DAR services averaged \$1.41/passenger in fares in 2000-01. This was 11.0% higher than 1999-2000.
- 16) StaRT DAR services collected \$2.85/hour in fares during 2000-01. This was 15.9% higher than 1999-2000.
- 17) StaRT DAR services collected \$.153/mile in fares during 2000-01. This was 19.2% higher than 1999-2000.
- 18) StaRT DAR services had a net operating cost - subsidy - of \$516,246 in 2000-01. This was 21.5% higher than 1999-2000.
- 19) StaRT DAR services had a subsidy/passenger of \$17.17 in 2000-01. This was 15.6% lower than 1999-2000.
- 20) StaRT DAR services had a subsidy/hour of \$34.78 in 2000-01. This was 11.9% lower than 1999-2000.
- 21) StaRT DAR services had a subsidy/mile of \$1.87 in 2000-01. This was 9.3% lower than 1999-2000.

StanCOG staff is required to make recommendations for a productivity improvement in Section 99244 of the Transportation Development Act. Staff has reviewed the points for analysis included in the

Transportation Development Act, as well as additional points designed to provide potentially useful information about the StaRT DAR services.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT

As a result of the significant changes made to the StaRT Demand Responsive service, StanCOG staff makes no recommendations for productivity improvements for 2002-03.

CITY OF TURLOCK TRANSIT SYSTEM

OVERVIEW

On November 16, 1998, the City of Turlock initiated a new fixed route service, known as the Bus Line Service of Turlock, or the ABLAST. The service was initiated with two loop routes, each with 50-minute headways. In May, 1999, a third route was created. The routes operate between 7:00 a.m. and 6:25 p.m. The routes originate from the Wal-Mart Shopping Center, on Fulkerth Road, near Hwy. 99., where they are timed to meet. The routes are all designed and scheduled to meet at Turlock High School, in the east side of Turlock. Each route also serves Emanuel Hospital, and Osborne and Dutcher Elementary Schools. Central Park (a stop on four of Stanislaus Regional Transits routes, and on Merced County Transit System=s North County Route) is served by two BLAST routes. About 90% of the city is within 1/4 mile of a BLAST route. Saturday service is on the same routes, with operations between 9:00 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. There is no service on Sunday or on ten designated holidays.

The City has continued to operate its demand responsive service, which it calls Dial-A-Ride-Turlock, or ADART, for short. Effective November 16, the DART service functioned in two manners. First of all, it was a general public service for the Turlock Transit areas, including the Town of Denair, more than 1/4 mile away from a BLAST route. Secondly, it functioned as the required Americans with Disability Act transit service, offering door to door transit to those residents of the Turlock Transit service area who live within the 1/4 mile service area of the BLAST, but who have disabilities making them incapable of using the BLAST service. (Note, the City of Turlock has also approved provision of transit to Kindergarten through Sixth grade students of the Turlock school district. This is because that district does not offer school busing to students unless they live over one mile from the school. The policy was made at the request of many parents who desired their students to ride the DART service rather than the BLAST service.) The DART operates in the same hours as the BLAST, except in Denair, where service begins at 9:00 a.m.

The BLAST service operates with two large transit buses, purchased when the BLAST service was established in 1998, and uses a former dial-a-ride bus for the third route. The city plans to redesign its transit routes in August of 2002, with a five-route system. Service has operated with 60-minute headways in the present route structure. The new system is expected to serve some areas with 120-minute service.

The City of Turlock renewed its contract with Laidlaw Transit, Inc. in 1998. The contract included the purchase of the two fixed route vehicles by Laidlaw, to be operated on the BLAST service. The DART service continued to be operated with the City owned vehicles which had been used for the dial-a-ride service since before the initiation of the BLAST service.

For two years the City of Turlock had considered a transition from its exclusively demand responsive operation. This has been the result of one primary motivation, the Turlock service area was approaching the limits of what a demand responsive transit service could most efficiently serve. The population was approximately 57,000, and the transit industry generally considers 50,000 to be the population threshold where the transition from demand responsive to fixed route should occur. The city hired a consultant to research the transit needs for Turlock, and the city made a finding that a gradual transition from demand responsive to fixed route service would be the most efficient use of city resources.

In 2002 the Census Bureau designated the Turlock area as “Urbanized”, meaning there are over 50,000 people in and near the city. This makes Turlock eligible for additional Federal transit funding.

SERVICE CHARACTERISTICS

Service Area: Approximately 21 square miles

Service Area Population: approximately 66,000

Transfer Points: The BLAST is a fixed route service operating, effective May 1999, on three loop routes with 60-minute headways. The routes begin, end, and meet at the Wal-Mart Shopping Center on Fulkerth Road, at Hwy 99. The routes are designed to meet at the mid-point at Turlock High School. All three of the routes also serve Emanuel Hospital and Osborne and Dutcher Elementary Schools, though not simultaneously. Passengers may transfer to any of three StaRT fixed routes at the Wal-Mart Shopping Center, or to the Merced County North County Route from the BLAST AYellow or the ABlue routes at Central Park. No official transfer agreement has been developed between BLAST and Merced County Transit at this time. The Merced County bus also services Livingston, Delhi and Hilmar.

Turlock Dial-A-Ride, the DART, is a general public demand-responsive service which provides door-to-door service for those residents of the Turlock Transit service more than 1/4 mile away from BLAST service. It also provides service to those residents in the BLAST service area who are disabled and meet Americans with Disabilities Act criteria. General public passengers may also transfer to the StaRT and Merced County services. DART general public passengers may meet the Merced County bus at Central Park.

Fare (one way): **BLAST**

- Regular \$.75
- Children 3 and under ride free when accompanied by fare-paying passenger.
- Senior (61 older) and Persons with disabilities \$.35

Ticket books can be purchased:
 Regular - 20 rides for \$15.00
 Senior - 20 rides for \$7.00

DART

- Regular \$1.70
- Children 3 and under ride free when accompanied by fare-paying passenger.
- Senior (61 older) and Handicapped \$1.15

Ticket books can be purchased:
 Regular - 10 rides for \$17.00
 Senior - 10 rides for \$11.50

Arrangements: The BLAST has several scheduled stops on each route. Riders are expected to be at those stops prior to those scheduled times. The scheduled times are considered as departure times from those stops. Passengers are expected to have exact change or tickets upon boarding the bus.

DART riders should call one hour before closing for final reservation. Buses will usually arrive within forty-five minutes. A passenger may also call 15 minutes in advance, and an estimated time of arrival will be given by the dispatch service. Call two hours in advance if service is required for an appointment. The DART bus waits 60 seconds then leaves so as not to delay other users. Subscription service is available.

Telephone Number: (209) 668-5600 for DART reservations.

Complaints: (209) 668-5599 ext. 429

USER/TRIP CHARACTERISTICS

Annual DART and BLAST Passenger Breakdown for fiscal year 2000-01:

<u>TOTAL RIDERS</u>	<u>BLAST</u>	<u>DART</u>
146,884	123,209	23,675

VEHICLE INVENTORY LIST

All vehicles are handicapped accessible. Turlock Transit operates two 30-passenger vehicles for its BLAST service, which it leases from Laidlaw Transit, Inc., and one 18-passenger vehicle, owned by the City, converted from Dial-A-Ride service for the BLAST service. It operates seven DART vehicles, owned by the City, ranging in size from ten to 18 passengers. Turlock is in the process of purchasing three 30 passengers for it's BLAST service.

SERVICE STANDARDS

The following measures the performance of the Turlock transit system against the transit service standards in the Regional Transportation Plan.

Accessibility

Turlock's Dial-A-Ride provides door-to-door demand-responsive transit service.

Laidlaw Transit Services gives the City a monthly performance report for both the BLAST and the DART and forwards a copy to StanCOG, Stanislaus County, and Caltrans. Within the report is a selected day analysis where all trip tickets on the DART are pulled and used to get a picture of passengers and wait-ride times. The day is selected by the head office and is unknown to local operators. The system of monitoring is extensive. A year-end report is also prepared which provides extensive transit-related information and performance data.

- E-1: The Transit Productivity Analysis is a portion of this document. That analysis follows later in this Chapter.
- E-2: The State Controllers Report indicates the BLAST service a 17.3% Farebox Ratio, and the DART maintained a 9.5% fare box ratio in 2000-01. The Transportation Development Act (TDA) does not require the BLAST service to meet any specific farebox ratio until after the second complete fiscal year of operation. 2000-01 was the second complete fiscal year of operation for BLAST. With that said, the TDA minimum farebox ratio for the BLAST service is 15%.
- E-3: NA – See above note.
- E-4: The BLAST expanded from two to three routes in May of 1999. The 1999-2000 fiscal year operated with an 11.5% farebox ratio, which exceeds 1/3 of the required 15% farebox ratio.

Marketing

When fixed route service was established, the names BLAST and DART were created, and a slogan was written for the BLAST service. Multicolored brochures were designed for each service, containing all of the needed information to use the services. The brochures are available at several locations, including Turlock City Hall, doctor's offices, and senior housing complexes. A large print flyer to assist the visually impaired passenger was also developed.

- F-1: Turlock Transit produces brochures for both the BLAST and the DART. A multicolor brochure including both a system map and a schedule was created when the third route was established; the updated map is scheduled for August 2002.
- F-2: The brochures are made available in doctor's offices, senior-housing complexes and is printed in large print for the visually impaired.
- F-3: The brochure is available at the Greyhound Bus depot in Turlock.
- F-4: Turlock describes its services on its website.

Management

Laidlaw Transit provides an extensive detailed monthly report to the City, Caltrans and to StanCOG. The reports include monthly totals for passenger revenue, number of passengers, operating cost, vehicle miles traveled, vehicle hours in operation, and other related-transit information. A year-end summary is also provided.

The transition in November, 1998 from demand responsive to fixed route and demand responsive transit, and the subsequent expansion to three fixed routes in May, 1999, are the most significant service improvements in the City of Turlock in many years. At the time, it was not clear how successful the new service would be, as Turlock had attempted a fixed route service once in the past as well - which failed. The combination of significantly lower fares, and the (general) refusal to provide dial-a-ride service to any residents (other than the ADA qualified) within 1/4 mile of a fixed route, has proved to be attractive to many more riders than originally anticipated. The City choice to expand its service by 50% - to three routes - after only four months of operations testifies to the local level of satisfaction with the service improvements to date.

In early 1999 City staff requested StanCOG staff to develop a spreadsheet listing other small, local fixed route services in California, as well as listing the performances of those operations in several key areas of efficiency. The spreadsheet is a useful tool for two reasons; 1) it provides a list of operators who can be contacted by the Turlock City staff for ideas concerning its new service, and, 2) it provides ranges and average levels of efficiency and productivity which Turlock staff can use as standards in measuring its own progress.

In August of 2002 the City plans to expand its services again to operate a five-route system. The proposed expansion is due to the exceptional growth of the system, much beyond what was expected in 1999. Preliminary numbers indicate that BLAST carried 13.8 passengers/hour in 2001-02. This is an average annual increase of 20.1% since the first year.

TRANSIT PRODUCTIVITY ANALYSIS

Statute exempts StanCOG from making the required analysis of a transit operation prior to its second complete fiscal year of operation. BLAST and the redesigned DART completed their second full fiscal years of operation on June 30, 2001. The following is the analysis of BLAST and then of DART. Note, for TDA purposes the two submit claims as one entity, but they are listed separately in the StanCOG Regional Transportation Plan Transit Standards.

The Transportation Development Act (TDA) requires StanCOG to annually analyze each public transit operation in light of the following performance indicators: 1) Operating Cost; 2) Passengers; 3) Revenue Hours; 4) Revenue Miles; 5) Cost/Passenger; 6) Cost/Hour; 7) Passenger/Hour; 8) Passenger/Mile; 9) Hours/Employee; 10) Vehicle Count; and, 11) Farebox Ratio.

Transit Cost Sharing is a process in TDA Law specific to Stanislaus County. It was created in 1998, and is used to review the costs of transit proposals in claims for the upcoming fiscal year. It reviews the Net Operating Cost, i.e., the Operating Cost less the Fare Revenue. This is also known as the Subsidy, below.

The StanCOG Regional Transportation Plan requires us to review the, 1) Cost/Mile and, 2) Miles/Hour. Additional information needed to review these indicators are the number of employees and the fare revenue.

While not required, staff has tracked several additional statistics. Some of them do little more than better communicate data tracked above. Others address issues staff consider crucial. The additional data are: 1) Minutes/Passenger (another way to picture Passengers/Hour, used only for Dial-A-Rides); 2) Miles/Passenger (another way to picture Passengers/Mile, used primarily for Dial-A-Rides, to avoid

11) DART operated with a farebox ratio of 9.5% in 2000-01. This was 34.8% lower than 1999-2000. This decrease should be reviewed, especially as it is below the StanCOG RTP standard of a 10% farebox ratio.

12) DART operated at a cost of \$5.61/mile in 2000-01. This was 19.5% higher than 1999-2000. This increase should be reviewed.

13) DART operated at 13.5 miles/hour in 2000-01. This was 18.2% higher than 1999-2000.

14) DART collected \$40,446 in fare revenue in 2000-01. This was 19.7% lower than 1999-2000.

15) DART collected an average of \$1.71/passenger in 2000-01. This was 5.4% lower than 1999-2000.

16) DART collected \$7.14/hour in fares during 2000-01. This was 7.9% lower than 1999-2000.

17) DART collected \$.53/mile in fares during 2000-01. This was 22.1% lower than 1999-2000.

18) DART had a Net Operating Cost/Subsidy of \$387,115 in 2000-01. This was 30.3% higher than 1999-2000.

19) DART had a subsidy/passenger of \$16.35 in 2000-01. This was 53.5% higher than 1999-2000. This increase should be reviewed.

20) DART had a subsidy/hour of \$68.37 in 2000-01. This was 49.5% higher than 1999-2000. This increase should be reviewed.

21) DART had a subsidy/mile of \$5.08 in 2000-01. This was 26.5% higher than 1999-2000. This increase should be reviewed.

StanCOG staff is required to make recommendations for a productivity improvement in Section 99244 of the Transportation Development Act. Staff has reviewed the points for analysis included in the Transportation Development Act, as well as additional points designed to provide potentially useful information about the BLAST and DART systems.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT

The BLAST service is showing excellent improvement in efficiency from almost all perspectives. The city's announced plan to initiate expanded service in August of 2002 to include service to Denair is a satisfaction of a proposal included in the 2000 Transit Systems Management Report.

As stated above, the initiation of fixed route service to Denair should result in some improvement in the efficiency of the DART service. As noted for most of the DART efficiency measures, there are not enough complete years of ADA service to argue for the presence of a serious trend – though one year of significantly decreased efficiency is expensive. When the cost data is available for 2001-02 it will be clear whether the perceived inefficiencies are genuine patterns.

CITY OF WATERFORD TRANSIT SYSTEM

OVERVIEW

The City of Waterford operates a general public, demand-responsive Dial-A-Ride service within the City's general proximity, which includes the residents of Hickman. The service operates from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m., Monday through Friday, and is handicapped accessible. These hours were initiated during the 1996-97 fiscal year.

Waterford Dial-A-Ride can be reached by telephone at 874-2873. This number is for Dial-A-Ride information. Arrangements for pickup should be made using this number at least 15 minutes in advance.

The City of Waterford manages its own operations, and owns a single vehicle which serves an area of 26 square miles.

Stanislaus Regional Transit has created a new service between Waterford and the City of Modesto. Effective July 10, 2000, the Waterford/Modesto Runabout operates between Waterford and Modesto, with timed stops in Hughson and Empire on the way. This is a replacement of the former Central Dial-A-Ride service.

In 1998 Waterford Dial-A-Ride initiated service to Empire as a result of an Unmet Transit Needs finding. When StaRT initiated the Waterford Runabout service the Policy Board approved a request by the City of Waterford that they no longer be responsible to meet the identified unmet transit need, because StaRT was providing a replacement service, operating several times daily with superior service.

SERVICE CHARACTERISTICS

Service Area: 26 square miles

Service Area Population: About 9,000

Transfer Points: The StaRT Waterford Runabout service has two timed stops in Waterford; 1) at City Hall, at Main and E Streets, and 2) at the Valley IGA Market along Yosemite Blvd.

Fare: **Waterford Service Area**

Regular	\$0.75	
Children (5-12)	\$0.50	
Senior/Handicapped	\$0.50	
*Four years and under	Free	(each additional child under 4 - \$0.25) *1 free child fare is allowed for each general paid fare.
17 ride tickets	\$12.00	

Arrangements: Please call at least 15 minutes in advance for Dial-A-Ride.

Marketing

The City of Waterford promotes and markets its Dial-A-Ride service. The telephone number is available at Waterford City Hall and in the telephone directory. This publication provides information on handicapped accessibility, fares, hours of operation, necessary arrangements for service, and the service telephone number.

- F-1: The City of Waterford has printed a brochure with information about the hours, fares, how to use the system and what telephone numbers to call.
- F-2: The Waterford Dial-A-Ride brochure is available at City Hall and the Waterford Community Center. Visibility of the bus is the biggest marketing tool used by the city.
- F-3: The City has not placed any brochures at the Greyhound depots (either Modesto or Turlock). Information regarding Waterford Dial-A-Ride is included in the Stanislaus Regional Transit brochure, and is expected to be included in the 1999 MAX brochure, which are available at the depots.
- F-4: Waterford Dial-a-Ride is referenced, with a telephone number, in the internet s

Management

- G-1: Waterford Dial-A-Ride maintains records monthly regarding all of the appropriate listed information.
- G-2: See standard B-6-a-i.
- G-3: The City of Waterford considers replacement of its bus when the maintenance cost becomes excessive. The previous vehicle was operated for 7 years.
- G-4: Waterford Dial-A-Ride participated in the January 1994 on-board survey taken by StanCOG. The results of that survey are included in the 1994 StanCOG Transit Survey Study, compiled by the firm of Nelson/Nygaard. A survey of passengers is anticipated when StanCOG completes a Regional Transit Plan in 2000.
- G-5: A vehicle maintenance record is kept on a regular basis.

PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENTS

In response to Public Utilities Code 99244, each transportation planning agency (StanCOG in this county) is required to annually identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements which could lower the operating costs of those who operate at least 50 percent of their vehicle service miles within its jurisdiction. The recommendations related to productivity are made in the performance audit conducted pursuant to Public Utilities Code Section 99246.

The Performance Audit for the three years ending June 30, 2000 was completed in 2001. The following two recommendations were included in the audit, each of which are being pursued by the City staff. Copies of the audit are available in the StanCOG office.

- 1) The City of Waterford should continue to work towards improving the timeliness of submission of its fiscal and compliance audits to the Stanislaus Council of Governments (the RTPE) and the State Controller's Office.
- 2) The City of Waterford should institute procedures for reconciling all fare tickets sold to fares collected and deposited on a weekly basis.

The City of Waterford reviews its transit service on a monthly basis. In 1994, Waterford stopped using the Cellular Phone for dispatching which it had used for two years, in order to reduce costs (communication with the driver is now through the City of Waterford Public Works Department radio system). The City shortened the operating hours in September 1995, in order to reduce the amount of in service time when the van was parked.

SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS

Transit operations in Waterford are approximately as they have been for many years. As noted above, service to Empire was initiated, and then transferred to StaRT. With the StaRT service to Waterford there has been an increase of passenger transfers. The two services have enhanced transit to the east part of the County.

TRANSIT PRODUCTIVITY ANALYSIS

The Transportation Development Act (TDA) requires StanCOG to annually analyze each public transit operation in light of the following performance indicators: 1) Operating Cost; 2) Passengers; 3) Revenue Hours; 4) Revenue Miles; 5) Cost/Passenger; 6) Cost/Hour; 7) Passenger/Hour; 8) Passenger/Mile; 9) Hours/Employee; 10) Vehicle Count; and, 11) Farebox Ratio.

Transit Cost Sharing is a process in TDA Law specific to Stanislaus County. It was created in 1998, and is used to review the costs of transit proposals in claims for the upcoming fiscal year. It reviews the Net Operating Cost, i.e., the Operating Cost less the Fare Revenue. This is also known as the Subsidy, below.

The StanCOG Regional Transportation Plan requires us to review the, 1) Cost/Mile and, 2) Miles/Hour. Additional information needed to review these indicators are the number of employees and the fare revenue.

While not required, staff has tracked several additional statistics. Some of them do little more than better communicate data tracked above. Others address issues staff consider crucial. The additional data are: 1) Minutes/Passenger (another way to picture Passengers/Hour, used only for Dial-A-Rides); 2) Miles/Passenger (another way to picture Passengers/Mile, used primarily for Dial-A-Rides, to avoid "percentages of persons" per mile); 3) Average Fare/Passenger; 4) Average Fare/Hour; 5) Average Fare/Mile; 6) Daily Peak Vehicles; 7) Subsidy/Passenger (equals Cost/Passenger minus Fare/Passenger); 8) Subsidy/Hour (equals Cost/Hour minus Fare/Hour); and, 9) Subsidy/Mile (equals Cost/Mile minus Fare/Mile).

Because the operating hours significantly changed for the 1995-96 fiscal year (the last major change for the system), trends will be measured from that year.

20) Waterford DAR had a subsidy/mile of \$2.24 in 2000-01. This was again the highest ever recorded, for the same reason as above.

In summary, due to the changes in accounting for the operating costs, the overall efficiency of Waterford DAR cannot reasonably be compared with prior years. However, in those measures not related to financial accounting, the service performed well. Specifically, the service did well in the following areas:

- 1) Passengers/Hour
- 2) Collected Fare Revenue
- 3) Average Fare/Passenger
- 4) Fare/Hour
- 5) Fare/Mile

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT

1) Establish a long term Accounting Method for Operating Costs Staff recommends the City of Waterford standardize its accounting method for the operating cost of the Dial-A-Ride service. When this occurs, it will be possible to re-analyze trends relative to each of the eight efficiency measures dependent upon that statistic.

PUBLIC TRANSIT IN OTHER CITIES

CITY OF HUGHSON

The City of Hughson is served by the StaRT Waterford/Modesto Runabout. This is a deviated fixed route service, with a timed stop in Hughson. The service operates between Waterford and Modesto, Monday through Saturday, with three scheduled daily inbound and three scheduled daily outbound stops. The bus stops at the Resource Center on Third Street. One goal of this service is to determine whether there may be some need for fixed route service to Hughson and elsewhere in the east part of the County in future years. Because the service is a deviated fixed route, passengers elsewhere in Hughson may board the bus at their driveway. Passengers boarding at the Resource Center are charged \$.75. Those desiring to board at their driveways pay a \$1.50 fare.

In past years there have been proposals that fixed route service to Hughson from Ceres should be considered an unmet transit need. The analysis of that proposal did not find that it was reasonable to meet. StanCOG staff proposes that the new service meets most of the intent of that proposal, and will provide documentation of whether additional transit to Hughson should be provided.

CITY OF NEWMAN

The City of Newman is currently served by the Westside Runabout and by the Westside Stage, both of which are operated by Stanislaus Regional Transit. Newman has no current plans to establish its own transit service. Approximately 2,400 of the 6,025 people in Newman are within the service area of the Westside Stage. The Westside Stage added a fourth run in February 1999. Prior to that time there were three daily round-trips beginning in Modesto and going to Gustine.

The Westside Runabout is a replacement of the Westside Dial-A-Ride service. In practice, most of the requests for transit on the Westside Dial-A-Ride service had been in the Newman and Gustine areas. The new Westside Runabout service will reduce the hours of local transit available to Newman, but it will make transit to Turlock available from Newman, Crows Landing and Patterson. The Westside Runabout operates as a dial-a-ride service during part of the day, between the fixed route runs to Turlock. As a dial-a-ride it officially serves all of the territory between the San Joaquin River and Interstate – 5, between Merced County and San Joaquin County, as well as the City of Gustine in Merced County. Functionally, however, the dial-a-ride service is rarely asked to function north of the town of Crows landing.

Merced County Transit offers a dial-a-ride service for the Gustine area, which also serves the City of Newman.

No proposals of any unmet transit needs have been made for the City of Newman.

CITY OF PATTERSON

The City of Patterson operated its own transit service until January 1, 2000, when it transferred the management of the service to Stanislaus Regional Transit. The present dial-a-ride service is operated entirely within the city limits. In 2000 StaRT obtained a bus for the service, which had been operated in

a sedan in prior years. Patterson is also served by the StaRT Westside Stage, which makes seven stops in Patterson on its route between Gustine and Modesto. Patterson is finally served by the StaRT Westside Runabout, which serves it as a dial-a-ride service during part of the day, and makes one stop in Patterson on each run of its fixed route between Newman and Turlock.

No proposals of unmet transit needs have been made for Patterson.

OTHER TRANSIT SERVICES OPERATING IN STANISLAUS COUNTY

MERCED AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT

Merced Area Regional Transit provides transit services which are available to Stanislaus County residents:

- 1) The "North County Shuttle", a fixed-route service, has stops in Livingston, Delhi, Hilmar and Turlock (the only stop in Stanislaus County). The service stops in Turlock at Central Park at 7:30, 9:30, and 10:15am, and at 1:15, 2:45 and 5:05pm, Monday through Saturday. Additional information concerning this route can be obtained by phoning (800) 345-3111.
- 2) The West County Dial-A-Ride serves Gustine, Santa Nella, Los Banos, and Newman. This service can also be scheduled at (800) 345-3111.

AMTRAK

The San Joaquin route of Amtrak runs twelve passenger trains along the Santa Fe Railroad tracks through Stanislaus County daily (six in each direction), with stops in Modesto and Denair. The stop in Modesto was created fall of 1999, and is served by the Modesto Area Express Route 34, and by Modesto Dial-A-Ride. In addition, the Riverbank-Oakdale Transit Authority (ROTA) provides transit for residents of their service area to the Modesto Amtrak Station. Finally, it is served by the StaRT Waterford Runabout and Eastside Runabout. The Denair stop is served by the Turlock/Modesto Runabout and Dial-A-Ride Turlock (DART). Effective August 19, 2002, the station is served by the BLAST Route D, which goes to the Denair Station six times daily.

GREYHOUND

Greyhound is a private, cross-country passenger bus service. It has depots in Modesto and Turlock. The depot in Modesto is located at the downtown Modesto Transportation Center. The depot in Turlock is located near Central park.

LIDLAW TRANSIT

Laidlaw Transit is a private, passenger bus service, which has contracted with several of the public transit operators throughout Stanislaus County, and with school districts. It presently contracts with the City of Turlock.

STORER TRANSPORTATION SERVICES

Storer Transportation Services is a private, passenger bus service, which contracts with several of the public transit operators throughout Stanislaus County, with school districts, with several social service providers, and with the Stanislaus County Office of Education. Storer also offers tours on specific cross-country routes. Storer Transportation Services is based in Modesto.

MV TRANSPORTATION SERVICES

MV Transportation Services is a private, passenger bus service, which contracts with two of the public transit operators in Stanislaus County.

A TOUCH OF CLASS LIMOUSINE AND TAXICAB SERVICE

The taxi operation of this company operates in Modesto. It has served the area since 1991. They operate three cabs. Rides are available by calling 575-0690.

MODESTO CAB COMPANY

Modesto Cab Company operates in Modesto. It has operated since 1976. Rides are available by calling 521-7320.

RED TOP TAXI

Red Top Taxi operates in Modesto. It has operated since the early 1970s. In Modesto it operates as a private taxi operation and is under contract to the City of Modesto to provide backup transportation when Modesto Dial-A-Ride has excessive demand. Rides are available by calling 524-4741.

OAKDALE TAXI

Oakdale Taxi operates in the Oakdale area. It began operating in 1995. Rides are available by calling 869-5552. Oakdale Taxi also operates in Riverbank.

SUPERIOR TRANSPORTATION

Superior Transportation also operates in the Oakdale area. It began operating in 1995. Rides are available by calling 848-5555.

YELLOW CAB OF TURLOCK

Yellow Cab operates in the Turlock area. It began operation in 1996. They operate two cabs. Rides are available by calling 669-3911.

WY=S GUIDES

In 1998 Wy=s Guides purchased the routes of Reliable Airport Shuttle Service. They operate three daily round trip buses between the Modesto Holiday Inn and the Oakland and San Francisco Airports. The company is based in Sonora, and includes stops in Oakdale and Riverbank once per day, with stops at the Amtrak Station by request. The service includes stops in Manteca, Tracy and Livermore, and is available for commute service. Information about the services are available at 533-2721. A Modesto office is expected to open in 1999.

LIMOUSINE SERVICES

There are many limousine services which operate in Stanislaus County. This report includes no inventory of them.

PUBLIC SCHOOL BUSING

The following is a list of the elementary and high school districts in Stanislaus County. Most of the districts operate their own bus services. No busing is offered in three districts. Two districts offer busing through contracts with Laidlaw Transportation Services. Two districts offer busing through contracts with Storer Transportation Services. One district, Hickman, owns its buses but contracts with Waterford Unified to operate the buses. One district, Stanislaus Union, contracts with Modesto City Schools to operate its busing. Many of the districts have adopted general policies regarding busing in the proximity of their schools. Those policies and operators are described for each district in the following text (note, AK≡ = Kindergarten; AM≡ = Mile; AH≡ = High School, in the AProximity≡ column):

<u>District</u>	<u>Proximity Polices</u>	<u>Bus Operators</u>
Ceres Unified	K-6, 1.5M; 7-12, 2M	School District
Chatom Union	K-3, .75M; 4-8, 1M	School District
Denair Unified	K-6, 1M; 7-8, 1.5M; H, 2M	School District
Empire Union	K-3, .75M; 4-8, 1M	School District
Gratton	No Busing	No Busing
Hart-Ransom Union	No minimum	School District
Hickman	1 Mile	Hickman owns, Waterford operated
Hughson Unified	No in town; K-3, .5M; 4-8, .75M; H, 1M	School District
Keyes Union	K-8, 1M in town; all rural students get rides	School District
Knights Ferry	No Busing	No Busing
La Grange	No busing	No Busing
Modesto City	K-6, 1M	School District
Modesto Junior High	7-8, 1.5M	School District
Modesto City High	3M	School District
Newman-Crows Landing Unified	No minimum.	Laidlaw Transport
Oakdale Joint Unified	K-12, 1.5M	School District
Paradise	No minimum.	Storer Transport.
Patterson Joint Unified	K-6, no minimum*; 7-8, 1.5M; H, 3M	Laidlaw Transport**
Riverbank Unified	K, .5M; 1-8, 1M; H, 1.5M	School District
Roberts Ferry Union	1 Mile	School District
Salida Union	K-3, .75M; 4-8, 1M	School District
Shiloh	No minimum.	Storer Transport.
Stanislaus Union	K-6, 1M; 7-8, 1.5M	Modesto City Schools
Sylvan Union	K, 1M; 1-5, 1.5M; 6-8, 2M	School District
Turlock Joint Union	K-6, 1M; 7-8, 2M	School District
Turlock Joint Union High	3 Miles	School District
Valley Home Joint	1 Mile	School District
Waterford Unified	K-8, .75M	School District

* Patterson Joint Unified has a 1.5M minimum for 4-6 at Las Palmas School.
 ** Patterson Joint Unified operates bus service for students in the Harney School attendance area, located in Santa Clara County.

SOCIAL SERVICE TRANSPORTATION PROVIDERS

In 1997, StanCOG adopted a Social Service Transportation Provider Inventory, in compliance with Senate Bill 826. Transportation providers included in that inventory provided services ranging from transit in buses

or vans owned and operated by the social service agency to the purchase of transit tickets for the clients of the social service agency. In 1999 StanCOG is scheduled to adopt a Social Service Transportation Provider Action Plan, proposing methods to better coordinate and/or consolidate many of the operations of the providers listed in the inventory. This inventory does not include for-profit organizations which provide transportation, such as retirement facilities. State law also exempts school busing from this inventory.

The following providers, except for the Stanislaus County Office of Education, are included in the 1997 StanCOG Social Service Transportation Provider Inventory. The following also lists the type of transportation services they offer:

Transportation Provider	Service Offered
1. Assn. of Retarded Citizens of Stan. Cnty.	Bus Passes & operate 10 owned buses/vans
2. Bethany Christian Services	Bus Tickets & operate 1 owned van
3. Cal Learn	Bus Tickets
4. Catholic Charities	Operate 1 owned van
5. Center For Human Services/Hutton House	Operate 1 owned van
6. Center for Senior Employment	Pay mileage of caseworkers
7. Community Hospice Inc.	Provides rides in counselors vehicles
8. Community Housing & Shelter Service	Bus Passes
9. Community Transitional Resources, Inc.	Bus Passes, Operate 6 Vans & 11 other cars
10. Employment Development Department	Bus Passes
11. Excell Center	Operate 8 owned vans
12. Family Service Agency/First Step	Bus Tickets
13. Hanshaw Healthy Start	Bus Passes
14. Haven Women=s Center of Stanislaus	Bus Passes
15. Miller=s Place - Doctors Medical Center Foundation	Bus Passes & operate 1 owned van
16. Modesto Counseling Center	Bus Passes
17. Private Industry Council	Bus Passes
18. Stanislaus County AIDS Project	Bus Passes
19. Stanislaus County Department of Social Services	Bus Passes & Storer Transportation
20. Stanislaus County D.A. Victim Services Program	Operate 1 owned vehicle
21. Stanislaus County Office of Education	Storer Transportation
22. United Cerebral Palsy Association of Stan. Cnty.	Bus Passes & operate 1 owned mini-bus
23. Valley Mountain Regional Center	Bus Passes & Storer Transportation

In December, 1999, StanCOG adopted the Social Services Transportation Providers Action Plan.

Appendix A

REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN TRANSIT PERFORMANCE STANDARDS

TRANSIT STANDARDS

OPERATIONS

The following Transit standards are used as measures of progress toward meeting the transit objectives identified in the Policy Element.

Countywide Standards

A. Accessibility

1. In urbanized areas, at least 70% of the population of each city and/or Census Designated Place should be within $\frac{1}{4}$ mile or a five minute walking distance from a fixed transit route, or 100% of the populations should be served by a general public Dial-A-Ride service.
2. Transit services should be provided between major activity centers.
3. In urbanized areas in Census Tracts, where there is a concentration of transit dependant persons¹, 90% of dwelling units should be with $\frac{1}{4}$ mile of fixed transit routes or be fully served by door-to-door demand responsive transit for the elderly and disabled.
4. Vehicles equipped with wheelchair lifts or ramps shall be available to disabled persons wherever transit service is provided.
5. Transit operators which use State or Federal funds shall operate in conformity to all appropriate laws requiring transit services to the disabled (required documents showing such conformity shall be available to StanCOG).
6. Door-to-door demand responsive transit is provided in urban areas for all elderly or disabled persons.

B. Convenience

1. Maintain average operating speeds for fixed route services as follows:
Urbanized area: 13 miles per hour
Non-urbanized areas: 18 miles per hour
2. In urbanized areas, design routes and schedules to efficiently serve a maximum number of persons.
3. No more than 30% of passengers should be required to transfer in fixed-route systems. Where transfer rates between lines within the same transit system exceed 30%, potential for providing direct routing should be investigated.

4. Provide timed transfers at all transfer points on fixed route systems in urbanized areas.

1 The 2002-03 Unmet Transit Needs Report includes the formula used to identify concentrations of Transit Dependent Persons. The 2003-04 Unmet Transit Needs Report will finalize the locations of those populations.

5. Maximum headway for fixed-route service in urbanized areas should be as follows:

On high demand routes and time periods: 30 minutes

In other cases: 60 minutes

6. Demand-responsive transit should provide the following level-of-service:

(a) Immediate response systems:

i. Average wait time for immediate response passengers – 30 minutes.

ii. Average deviation between estimated and actual pick-up time – 10 minutes.

(b) Advance reservation system:

i. Average deviation between estimated and actual pick-up time – 15 minutes.

ii. Advance reservation requirements for local general public systems – 2 hours ahead of trip time.

iii. Advance reservation requirements for intercity service – 7 days ahead of trip time.

iv. Advance reservation requirements for local elderly/disabled systems – two hours ahead of trip time.

7. Designate bus stops at all major activity centers in urbanized areas and/or where boarding passengers exceed 50 per day.

8. Other fixed route service should maximize the efficiency of one-directional service.

C. Reliability

1. Schedule adherence.

Buses should not depart earlier than time indicated on fixed schedule. Arrivals more than five minutes late should be minimized.

2. Programmed trips and/or vehicles.

a) 100% of scheduled trips should be provided on fixed-route systems. Where temporary vehicle shortages exist, preference should be given to routes serving transit-dependent areas.

b) 100% of programmed vehicles should be provided on an average daily basis in demand-responsive systems.

D. Comfort

1. A seat should be available for every passenger except during peak hours.

2. Provide passenger shelters at designated bus stops in urbanized areas where boarding passengers total more than 75 per day or where exposure to weather conditions is particularly severe.

3. Equip all vehicles with air-conditioning to provide an acceptable level of comfort during summer months, and heating during winter months.

E. Performance

1. Attempt to meet the productivity recommendations included in the annual Transit Productivity Analysis.

2. Achieve and maintain appropriate fare box ratios. (Shown on the Table titled Performance Standards)

3. New systems should meet the above performance standards after the second full fiscal year of operation.

4. Expansions of existing transit services should meet one-half the above performance standards during the first year of operation.

F. Marketing

1. The following information should be made available to transit users of each transit service operating in the county:

- Route or service area, and timetable information, including fare schedules.
- A user guide explaining the system or service and how to use it.
- Telephone information service.

2. Special efforts should be made to promote and/or publicize the transit service to the market segment at which the service is directed (e.g., elderly and handicapped) or to market segments with ridership potential.

3. Each transit service operated within the County should make efforts to make information regarding its service available to users of private intercity transit services (e.g., Greyhound) and their operators.

4. Each transit operator should establish an Internet site describing their services.

G. Management

1. The following basic information is essential for transit system management and should be collected on a monthly basis:

- Total passengers carried, by route.
- Revenue passengers carried, by route.
- Vehicle hours of service provided, by route.
- Vehicle miles of service operated, by route.
- In-service vehicle breakdowns.
- Passenger complaints.

2. The following information should be assembled at least semi-annually and in response to passenger complaints and/or driver reports of operational problems:

- Schedule adherence, by route (fixed routes).
- Response times (Dial-A-Ride).
- Pick-up time deviation (Dial-A-Ride).
- Service Refusals (Dial-A-Ride).

3. Buses should be considered for replacement according to schedule included in the Federal Transit Administration Circular 9030.1a.

- The number of spare buses (i.e., those not normally used during peak hour operation) should not exceed 20% of the total fleet size.

4. Information on user characteristics and attitudes should be updated every 3-5 years by the use of on-board surveys.

5. Maintenance, which is an important element of management, should be documented in a maintenance plan.

PERFORMANCE STANDARDS

PASSENGER REVENUE/OPERATING COST
Ratio % *

Fixed-Route Transit

Urban
(Modesto) 20

Rural Fixed-Routes (Stanislaus Regional Transit) 10

Newly Urbanized Area
(until 2005) (Turlock) 10

Dial-A-Ride

Urban Van-Based, General Public
(Ceres) 10

Urban Van-Based, Paratransit
(Modesto & Turlock) 10

Rural Van-Based, General Public (Riverbank-Oakdale
Transit Authority, Stanislaus Region Transit,
Waterford) 10

* Based upon TDA provisions for urban and rural service.