# Contents

Unmet Transit Needs (UTN) Executive Summary ................................................................. 6
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. 7
Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 8
  Summary of Findings for the FY 2021/22 UTN Assessment .................................................. 8
Public Involvement .................................................................................................................. 9
  Outreach activities .................................................................................................................. 9
  Comments Received .............................................................................................................. 14
UTN Process ........................................................................................................................... 15
  StanCOG’s Adopted UTN Process ....................................................................................... 15
    Definition of Unmet Transit Need ..................................................................................... 17
    Definition of Reasonable to Meet ..................................................................................... 17
    Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) ........................................... 18
Existing Conditions ................................................................................................................. 20
  Size and Location of Groups Likely to be Transit Dependent ............................................. 20
    Population Estimates for Stanislaus County .................................................................. 21
    Assessing Transit Dependency by Age (Population over 65) ......................................... 22
    Assessing Transit Dependency by Disability (Disabled Population) ............................. 23
    Assessing Transit Dependency by Income (Persons of Limited Means) ....................... 24
  Transit Dependent Census Tracts ....................................................................................... 25
Analysis of Transportation Services in Stanislaus County ...................................................... 26
  Modesto Area Express (MAX) ........................................................................................... 26
  Stanislaus Regional Transit System (StaRT) ....................................................................... 36
  Turlock Transit .................................................................................................................... 42
  Amtrak – San Joaquins ....................................................................................................... 47
  MOVE Stanislaus ............................................................................................................... 47
  Adequacy of Existing Services ......................................................................................... 49
  Farmworker Vanpool Program Analysis ......................................................................... 49
Resources Used in the UTN Assessment Process .................................................................... 50
Collection and Analysis of UTNs .......................................................................................... 52
  Public Outreach .................................................................................................................. 52
Analysis of Comments ......................................................................................................... 53
  UTN Findings ..................................................................................................................... 60
Tables and Figures

Table 1: Stanislaus County Population ........................................................................................................ 21
Table 2: Population over 65 .......................................................................................................................... 22
Table 3: Disabled Population ....................................................................................................................... 23
Table 4: Persons of Limited Means ............................................................................................................. 24
Table 5: MAX/MADAR Services ................................................................................................................... 28
Table 6: MAX/MADAR Fares ....................................................................................................................... 33
Table 7: StaRT Services ............................................................................................................................... 37
Table 8: StaRT Fares .................................................................................................................................... 39
Table 9: Turlock Transit Services ................................................................................................................ 43
Table 10: Turlock Transit Fares ................................................................................................................... 44
Table 11: Resources ..................................................................................................................................... 50
Table 12: Analysis of Comments Received during the FY 2021/22 Assessment ........................................ 53
Figure 1: StanCOG UTN Virtual Townhall Meetings- English Flyer ......................................................... 10
Figure 2: StanCOG UTN Virtual Townhall Meetings- Spanish Flyer ....................................................... 10
Figure 3: StanCOG UTN Flyer .................................................................................................................... 12
Figure 4: StanCOG UTN Flyer .................................................................................................................... 13
Figure 5: Stanislaus County Population ..................................................................................................... 21
Figure 6: Population over 65 ....................................................................................................................... 22
Figure 7: Disabled Population ..................................................................................................................... 23
Figure 8: Persons of Limited Means .......................................................................................................... 24
Figure 9: Transit Dependent Census Tracts (MAP) ................................................................................... 25
Figure 10: MAX Bus ................................................................................................................................. 26
Figure 11: CAT Merge with MAX via Route 44 ......................................................................................... 27
Figure 12: MAX Fixed Routes ................................................................................................................... 34
Figure 13: MADAR Service Area ................................................................................................................ 35
Figure 14: StaRT Bus ............................................................................................................................... 36
Figure 15: StaRT Fixed Route ................................................................................................................... 41
Figure 16: Turlock Transit bus at the Roger K Falls Transit Center ............................................................ 42
Figure 17: Turlock Transit Fixed Route ...................................................................................................... 45
Figure 18: Turlock Transit Dial-A-Ride Service Area ............................................................................... 46
Figure 19: Modesto Amtrak Station .......................................................................................................... 47
Figure 20: MOVE Stanislaus ..................................................................................................................... 47
Figure 21: Population Density by Census Tract ......................................................................................... 64
Figure 22: Population Over 65 by Census Tract ....................................................................................... 65
Figure 23: Persons Living with a Disability ............................................................................................... 66
Figure 24: Persons of Limited Means ....................................................................................................... 67
Unmet Transit Needs (UTN) Executive Summary

Each year, in accordance with the California Transportation Development Act (TDA), the Stanislaus Council of Governments (StanCOG), as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency (RTPA) and Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) for the Stanislaus Region, is required to identify any UTNs that may exist in the region. Should any UTNs be identified, a further determination must be made to establish whether or not those needs are reasonable to meet. In accordance with state law, TDA funds must be allocated to any UTNs found to be Reasonable to Meet before any remaining funds can be allocated to local jurisdictions for non-transit purposes. At a minimum, the annual UTN process requires StanCOG to do the following:

1. Maintain a Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) to participate in the identification of any UTNs and whether those identified needs are Reasonable to Meet. The composition of the SSTAC is set forth in statute and consists of representatives of potential transit users of the following members:
   - One representative who is 60 years of age or older.
   - One representative who is physically disabled.
   - Two representatives of local social service providers for seniors, including a transportation provider if one exists.
   - Two representatives of local social service providers for the physically disabled, including transportation provider, if one exists.
   - One representative of a local social service provider for persons of limited means.
   - Two representatives from the local Consolidated Transportation Services Agency (CTSA), designated pursuant to subdivision (a) of Section 15975 of the Government Code, if one exists, including one representative from a transit operator, if one exists.

2. Coordinate with the SSTAC and the StanCOG Policy Board to determine definitions for both UTN and Reasonable to Meet. These definitions must be revised every 5 years, or as needed.

3. Identify transit needs which have been considered as part of the transportation planning process.

4. Hold at least one public hearing to receive public comments regarding UTNs.

5. Meet with SSTAC members to identify potential UTNs and analyze those transit needs using the Policy Board’s adopted definitions of UTNs and Reasonable to Meet. As part of the Reasonable to Meet determination, StanCOG staff and the SSTAC must consider whether or not a transit operator can reasonably accommodate an unmet need and still maintain the required fare box recovery ratio established under the TDA.

6. Adopt, by resolution, a finding regarding transit needs that may be reasonable to meet. The Policy Board makes one of the following three possible findings:
   - There are no UTNs; or
   - There are no UTNs that are Reasonable to Meet; or
   - There are UTNs that are Reasonable to Meet.

If it is found that there are UTNs that are Reasonable to Meet, then those transit needs must be met before any TDA funds can be allocated for non-transit purposes.
Acknowledgements

StanCOG staff would like to acknowledge the hard work and support provided by the following members of the SSTAC, who participated in the development and adoption of the findings contained in this report:

Stacie Morales, Chairperson  
Adam Barth, Vice-Chair  
Lillian Castigliano  
Carla Strong  
Mohammed Rashid  
George Sharp

Staff would also like to acknowledge the coordination, outreach assistance, and information provided by the following individuals:

Adam Barth, City of Modesto  
Letti Ortiz, Stanislaus County  
Wayne York, City of Turlock  
Hayley Vieyra, MOVE Stanislaus
Introduction

The Fiscal Year (FY) 2021/22 UTN Identification and Analysis Report has been prepared for the StanCOG Policy Board’s consideration. This report will also be reviewed by the SSTAC, the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC), and the Management and Finance Committee (MFC) in order to provide additional comments to the Policy Board prior to the document’s adoption.

The following report outlines the annual UTN assessment process and provides StanCOG’s analysis of potential UTNs that were identified during this year’s assessment.

Summary of Findings for the FY 2021/22 UTN Assessment

On April 21, 2021, the StanCOG Policy Board adopted by Resolution 20-39, approving this report with a finding, that for FY 2021/2022:

There are no UTNs that are Reasonable to Meet.
Public Involvement

Due to the (Coronavirus Disease 2019) COVID-19 public health crisis, public outreach and activities were adjusted to account for social distancing guidelines and restrictions on public gatherings. The following section summarizes the public outreach activities that were conducted for the FY 2021/22 UTN Identification and Analysis Report.

Outreach activities

StanCOG conducted three Virtual Townhall meetings that allowed for live interactions and discussions between staff, the transit providers, and the public. The Virtual Townhall meetings for FY 2021/22 were scheduled as follows:

- Thursday March 4, 2021, 11:30AM – 1:00PM
- Thursday March 4, 2021, 4:30PM – 6:00PM
- Thursday March 11, 2021, 9:00AM – 10:30AM

Two flyers, in English and Spanish, announcing the Virtual Townhall meetings are shown on the following page.
Figure 1: StanCOG UTN Virtual Townhall Meetings- English Flyer

Stanislaus Council of Governments (StanCOG)
UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS (UTN) VIRTUAL MEETINGS

WHO DECIDES PUBLIC TRANSIT?
YOU DO!!
Participate in any of our Virtual Meetings and let us
know how public transit is meeting your needs.

StanCOG invites you to the following
UTN Virtual Town Hall Meetings

THURSDAY
MARCH 4, 2021
11:30AM – 1:00PM
THURSDAY
MARCH 4, 2021
4:30PM – 6:00PM
THURSDAY
MARCH 11, 2021
9:00AM – 10:30AM

by visiting the following link:
https://global.gotomeeting.com/join/491338717
Or by calling +1 (786) 535-3211 and using the following screen code: 491-338-717

Public Hearing

WEDNESDAY
MARCH 17, 2021
6:00PM – 7:30PM

by visiting the following link:
https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/4531910268649331983
Or by calling +1 (512) 653-0002 and using the following screen code: 786-938-832

Source: StanCOG, 2021

Figure 2: StanCOG UTN Virtual Townhall Meetings- Spanish Flyer

Consejo de Gobiernos de Stanislaus (StanCOG)
CARENCIAS DE TRANSPORTE PÚBLICO SIN ATENDER FOROS VIRTUALES

¿QUÉ DECIDE SOBRE TRANSPORTE PÚBLICO? ¡USTED!!
Partícipe en cualquiera de nuestros Foros Virtuales
y háganlo saber si el transporte público satisface sus necesidades.

StanCOG le invita a las siguientes Foros
Ciudadanos Virtuales sobre Carencias de
Transporte Público Sin Atender

JUEVES
4 DE MARZO, 2021
11:30AM – 1:00PM
JUEVES
4 DE MARZO, 2021
4:30PM – 6:00PM
JUEVES
11 DE MARZO, 2021
9:00AM – 10:30AM

visitando el siguiente enlace:
https://global.gotomeeting.com/join/491338717
O llamando al +1 (786) 535-3211 y usando el código de acceso: 491-338-717

Audencia Pública

MIÉRCOLES
17 DE MARZO, 2021
6:00PM – 7:30PM

visitando el siguiente enlace:
https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/4531910268649331983
O llamando al: +1 (415) 653-0052 y usando el código de acceso: 786-938-835

Source: StanCOG, 2021
The virtual flyers shown above were distributed to:

- StanCOG standing committees,
- local transit operators to display on fixed route buses and dial-a-ride vehicles,
- partner agencies, and
- community-based organizations.

Public Survey (English and Spanish):

- A web-based SurveyMonkey was made available from November 1, 2020, through March 18, 2021, on StanCOG’s website and FaceBook page, shared with the transit operators, community based-organizations, and the StanCOG standing committees.
- A Quick Response (QR) code was shared with the StanCOG standing committees, Policy Board, StanCOG’s FaceBook page, and with the transit agencies in the region to permit access to the survey via smartphone in English and Spanish.

Public Comment Form:

- A comment form that is accessible year-round through the StanCOG website was shared with the StanCOG standing committees, Policy Board, partner agencies, transit agencies in the region, and posted on StanCOG FaceBook page.

Outreach through Social Media:

- Staff published all the outreach dates, times, and call-in/log-in information for the Virtual Townhall meetings on StanCOG’s website and Facebook page; outreach information was with the local transit operators and partner agencies for further distribution.

Presentations to StanCOG’s standing committees from November 2020 through February 2021.

The flyers presented on the following 2 pages were also circulated through:

- StanCOG standing committees,
- local transit operators to display on fixed route buses and dial-a-ride vehicles,
- partner agencies, and
- community-based organizations.
Figure 3: StanCOG UTN Flyer

WANT TO SHAPE THE WAY PUBLIC TRANSIT LOOKS IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD?

IS PUBLIC TRANSIT MEETING YOUR NEEDS?

StanCOG is looking for your input on how existing transit services are meeting your needs.

Let us know!

IT’S EASY!
Give us a call:
209.525.4891

Email your comments to:
Unmettransitneeds@stancog.org
Or,

Snap a code and take our survey:

Want more information?
Visit the StanCOG Unmet Transit Needs web page.

Source: StanCOG, 2021
¿QUIERE PARTICIPAR EN LA DECISIÓN DE CÓMO DEBIERA OPERAR LA MOVILIZACIÓN PÚBLICA EN SU VECINDARIO?

El transporte público ¿Cubre sus necesidades?

StanCOG solicita su opinión sobre cómo los actuales servicios de transporte público satisfacen sus necesidades de movilización

¡Háganos Saber!

¿ES MUY FÁCIL!
Dénos una llamada: 209.525.4891

Envíenos sus comentarios por correo electrónico a:
Unmettransitneeds@stancog.org

O,
Escanee el Código abajo y llene nuestra encuesta:

Edith Robles
209.525.4891
unmettransitneeds@stancog.org

¿Más información?
Visite la página virtual de Carencias de Transporte Público Sin Atender
http://www.stancog.org/unmet-transit-needs.shtml

Source: StanCOG, 2021
Public Notice and Comment Period:

- The public comment period began February 17, 2021, and concluded Monday, March 22, 2021, at 4:00 PM.
- A Public Notice was published in the local newspapers the week of February 10, 2021. The local newspapers include:
  - Ceres Courier
  - Huston Chronicle
  - Modesto Bee
  - Oakdale Leader
  - Patterson Irrigator
  - Riverbank News
  - Turlock Journal
  - Waterford News
  - West Side Index

Public Hearing:

- Due to the COVID-19 stay at home order, the public hearing was held via video and audio conference call on March 17, 2021, during the StanCOG Policy Board’s regularly scheduled meeting scheduled from 6:00PM – 7:30 PM.

Comments Received

The public comment period for the FY 2021/22 UTN process ended on March 22, 2021, at 4:00 PM; staff analyzed a total of 17 comments provided during this assessment period. There were no comments deemed as unmet transit needs reasonable to meet. Many of the comments were related to issues that were operational in nature (requesting changes to the routes and schedules) or in other cases, commenters were unaware of existing transit services that are available in the region to meet their transit needs.

An analysis of all the comments received during the FY 2021/22 UTN assessment period can be found on Table 12.
UTN Process

The UTN process became an annual focus for transportation planning agencies in 1978, when the TDA was amended to require a specific finding that there are no UTNs that are Reasonable to Meet prior to local TDA funds being allocated for any non-transit purposes. In response to this requirement, StanCOG has conducted public outreach to identify transit needs and to determine reasonableness of funding any new or alternative services every year. As required by TDA, the definitions for a UTN and Reasonable to Meet were last amended by the Policy Board on October 23, 2019, through Resolution 19-14.

StanCOG’s Adopted UTN Process

In accordance with the California Public Utilities Code Section (PUC) 99401.5, and as part of the transportation planning process, StanCOG must annually identify the transit needs of the jurisdictions within Stanislaus County, including:

- An assessment of the size and location of identifiable groups likely to be transit dependent or transit disadvantaged, including but not limited to, the elderly, those with disabilities (including individuals eligible for paratransit and other special transportation services pursuant to Section 12143 of Title 42 of the United States Code (U.S.C) (the federal Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, as amended (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12101, et seq.)), and persons of limited means, including, but not limited to, recipients under the CalWORKs program.
- An analysis of the adequacy of existing public transportation services and specialized transportation services, including privately and publicly provided services necessary to meet the plan prepared pursuant to Section 12143(c)(7) of Title 42 of the United States Code, in meeting the transit demand identified above.
- An analysis of the potential alternative public transportation services, specialized transportation services, and service improvements that would meet all or part of the transit demand.
- An analysis of the need to acquire or lease vans and related equipment for a farmworker vanpool program pursuant to subdivision (f) of Section 99400 of the PUC. This analysis is only required, however, upon receipt by the transportation planning agency of an interested party identifying a potential need.

As part of the ongoing planning process, StanCOG will continue to consult with and consider the recommendations from the SSTAC satisfying a requirement of PUC 99238.5. All counties eligible for other purpose funding under TDA Article 8 are required to have a process of citizen participation utilizing SSTAC to hear the transit needs of transit dependent or disadvantaged persons. PUC Section 99238.5(a) requires this process provide for at least one public hearing annually whether or not any Article 8 claims are actually filed. StanCOG staff will continue to provide support and technical assistance to the SSTAC in their evaluations of all comments received and SSTAC recommendations will be reflected in the report to the Policy Board. In addition, the CAC and the TAC are encouraged to submit comments and recommendations to the StanCOG Policy Board regarding how identified needs can be met, whether it is reasonable to do so, and what steps are already being taken. At their own discretion, the CAC, TAC, and MFC may comment on the UTN Analysis report or may make separate recommendations to the StanCOG Policy Board.
As part of this process, the StanCOG Policy Board shall hold at least one public hearing to receive testimony regarding potential UTNs in each annual report cycle. This shall not be at the same meeting at which the UTN finding is made. StanCOG may conduct a second public hearing, following staff analysis, before making its final determinations with respect to UTNs and Reasonable to Meet. (Potential UTNs heard for the first time at the second public hearing need not be analyzed or acted upon the same year, though, if not acted upon, they shall be acted upon in the subsequent year.) The notice of each hearing, including the date, place, and specific purpose of the hearing shall be given at least 30 days in advance through publication in one or more newspapers of general circulation, including in Spanish. Additionally, StanCOG shall send written notification to those persons and organizations that have indicated, through the StanCOG citizen participation process or any other source of information, an interest in the subject of the hearing.

All UTN comments received either through the year or at public hearings shall be presented to the SSTAC. These comments may be submitted through the StanCOG website form, by email, in writing, in person, or by hearing testimony, as is consistent with the StanCOG Public Participation Plan.

It is important to note that StanCOG recognizes that not all transit desires can or should be met. Comments that are deemed to be operational issues rather than UTNs shall be referred to the appropriate transit operator for further investigation or action as warranted. An operational issue is defined as any transit comment, complaint, or issue which may have merit but does not rise to the level of (meet the definition of) a UTN.

The approved StanCOG Policy Board process provides specific direction for several of the required steps:

- The list of all transit issues identified at the UTN public hearing shall be presented to the SSTAC committee. As part of that presentation, staff shall identify those issues that in staff’s opinion are minor operational issues believed not to merit further review. The remaining issues shall be discussed before the SSTAC, including a brief analysis. This analysis shall be the foundation for the analysis within the draft Report. The Policy Board shall be provided recommendations of UTNs from the SSTAC and staff.
- Public testimony received at the required hearing shall be compiled and evaluated by staff, based upon recommendations received from the SSTAC.
- As written analysis of potential UTNs, which have been identified and shall then recommend to the Policy Board if each issue raised is a UTN in accordance with the adopted definition.

The Policy Board shall then determine if UTNs exist based on staff recommendations and the adopted definition and specifically identify such needs if they are determined to exist. Once StanCOG has determined that a request is a UTN, it shall determine whether it is Reasonable to Meet. For each UTN identified, staff shall recommend, based on the adopted definition and comments received, if it is Reasonable to Meet, identify reasons why it is Reasonable to Meet or not, and identify any steps that are already being taken to meet the need. The StanCOG Policy Board may make its determination regarding Reasonable to Meet at the same meeting at which the finding of specific UTNs is made or may make this determination at a subsequent meeting.

If a UTN is determined by StanCOG to be Reasonable to Meet, then the UTN shall be funded before any allocation is made for Article 8 Other Claims within the County. Accordingly, the Transit Cost Sharing Committee may recommend, as a part of the Transit Cost Sharing process, to the Policy Board which transit operator should provide the service. The operator’s TDA claim shall document how the UTN is to be funded.
Where a UTN is found to be Reasonable to Meet, the operator responsible to meet that need may track the productivity of the new service for a 6-month period after it is initiated to determine whether the identified need appears Reasonable to Meet. If the ridership during the first 6 months is too low to indicate that it is meeting a reasonable transit need, the operator may request that it begin the process of overturning the Reasonable to Meet finding. The operator shall document to the SSTAC that the service is not receiving acceptable levels of ridership and that it has acceptably marketed the service. If the SSTAC agrees with the request of the operator, the operator may request the Policy Board reverse its Reasonable to Meet findings.

As with any transit planning activity, the UTN process should evolve over time in response to changing local conditions, including growth. The StanCOG Policy Board requires that the UTN process and associated definitions be reviewed comprehensively by StanCOG, the SSTAC, and other interested parties at least once every five years.

Definition of Unmet Transit Need

A UTN is a need for transportation for an individual or group of individuals within any part of Stanislaus County, which has not been funded and implemented and which has been accurately documented. UTNs include, but are not necessarily limited to, needs for traditional fixed-route transit, curb-to-curb or door-to-door paratransit service, and “door-through-door” service (trips that originate inside a building or residence and terminate inside a destination building or residence), as long as some portion of the trip is taken via a motorized vehicle having four or more wheels and operated by a professional or volunteer driver whose primary purpose is to transport individuals or groups of individuals over public rights of way. UTNs include “specialized services” that provide transportation tailored to the unique needs of the individual being served in a manner that exceeds the level of service described in the literature published by the city or county entity that provides traditional fixed-route or paratransit service to the area in which the UTN is thought to exist. Potential transit needs may be identified by community members or through a local or regional planning process. Although some services may be restricted or give priority to traditionally transit-dependent populations (such as elderly, youths, persons with disabilities, or low-income persons), all eligible users should have equivalent access or opportunity to use the service. At a minimum, this may include requests for transportation services which are identified through the annual TDA UTN hearing, by the SSTAC, in the Regional Transportation Plan, in the Short-Range Transit Plan of any transit operator, in any study of UTNs prepared or formally accepted by the StanCOG Policy Board, or in a compliance plan for the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) as prepared by any public or private entity. UTNs are not:

1. Trips, which would duplicate transportation services.
2. A need for transportation services beyond the FY budget that is under consideration.

Definition of Reasonable to Meet

An identified UTN will be determined to be Reasonable to Meet if it is demonstrated, to the satisfaction of the StanCOG Policy Board, that the transit need can be met within the following performance and financial standards:

Any new service developed to meet a UTN shall achieve at least 50% of the systemwide performance standards, as found in the Transit Cost Sharing Procedures adopted by the StanCOG Policy Board, except in the case of an extension of service determined to be a necessary lifeline service for transit dependent population.
A lifeline service is defined as a service necessary to access community services within Stanislaus County that are needed to sustain an individual’s physical and mental health, as determined by StanCOG Policy Board.

Any new service developed to meet a UTN shall not cause the system of which it is a part to fail to meet the systemwide performance standards.

Any new service developed to meet a UTN will not require the expenditure of more LTF than available to the jurisdiction for transit.

Any new specialized service would be required to meet TDA requirements and be eligible for LTF funding under article 4 “Claims for Funds,” Article 4.5 “Claims for Community Transit Services,” or Article 8 “Other Claims for Funds.”

A UTN that requires specialized service will not reduce the amount of TDA funding needed by a City or County to continue to provide public transit services unless determined otherwise by the StanCOG Policy Board, as demonstrated by their approval of claims submitted under article 4.5 “Claims for Community Transit Services” of the TDA.

The determination of whether a UTN is Reasonable to Meet shall take into account as appropriate:

- If the time period needed to implement the required corrective action (e.g., major purchases, planning requirement) is greater than one year, a UTN may be declared not Reasonable to Meet. However, the funding must be delegated for actions necessary during the ensuing fiscal year to meet the UTN during the following fiscal year. A UTN shall not be determined unreasonable to meet more than once on these grounds.
- The fact that an identified transit need cannot be fully met based on available resources shall not be the sole reason for a finding that a transit need is not Reasonable to Meet.

StanCOG’s Policy Board determination of needs that are Reasonable to Meet shall not be made by comparing UTNs with the need for streets and roads.

**Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC)**

As previously identified, TDA regulations require StanCOG to annually consult with the SSTAC to identify the region’s transit needs prior to making any allocation of TDA funds not directly related to public transportation services or facilities provided for the exclusive use of pedestrians and bicycles. Pursuant to the TDA, Section 99238(c) 1-3 of the PUC specifically identifies the SSTAC’s responsibilities:

(c) The SSTACs shall have the following responsibilities:

1. Annually participate in the identification of transit needs in the jurisdiction, including unmet transit needs that may exist within the jurisdiction of the council and that may be reasonable to meet by establishing or contracting for new public transportation or specialized transportation services or by expanding existing services.

2. Annually review and recommend action by the transportation planning agency for the area within the jurisdiction of the council which finds, by resolution, that (A) there are no unmet transit needs, (B) there are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet, or (C) there are unmet transit needs, including needs that are reasonable to meet.

3. Advise the transportation planning agency on any other major transit issues, including the coordination and consolidation of specialized transportation services. In accordance with these
TDA requirements, StanCOG works with the SSTAC and meets with members on a monthly basis to identify and analyze any potential UTNs based upon the Policy Board’s adopted definitions of UTN and Reasonable to Meet. Upon completion of the annual UTN assessment, both staff and the SSTAC further recommend a finding to the Policy Board that:

1. There are no UTNs; or
2. There are no UTNs which are Reasonable to Meet; or
3. There are UTNs including needs which are Reasonable to Meet.

If the Policy Board determines that a UTN is Reasonable to Meet, then that transit need must be funded prior to any allocations being made for other purposes within the region. Additionally, where a UTN is found to be Reasonable to Meet, the Transit Cost Sharing Committee may recommend to the Policy Board which transit operator should provide the service. The transit operator’s TDA claim shall document how the UTN will be funded.
Existing Conditions

In accordance with California PUC 99401.5(b), the following sections provide analysis of the transit needs in the region.

Size and Location of Groups Likely to be Transit Dependent

During each year’s UTN assessment process, StanCOG must evaluate the size and location of identifiable groups likely to be transit dependent or transit disadvantaged, including, but not limited to: elderly, people with disabilities (including individuals eligible for paratransit and other special transportation services pursuant to Section 12143 of Title 42 of the United States Code ADA of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12101, et seq.)), and persons of limited means, including, but not limited to, recipients under the CalWORK’s program. Utilizing data from the 2015-2019 American Communities Survey (ACS) 5-year estimate, the following sections identify the size and location of population groups likely to be transit dependent.

For the purposes of this assessment, transit-dependent population groups consist of the following classifications:

- **Elderly** – Individuals who are age 65 years or older;
- **Disabled** – Non-institutionalized, civilian members of the population who may be unable to operate vehicles or utilize certain modes of public transportation due to physical or mental disabilities; and
- **Persons of Limited Means** – Individuals who are defined by the federal government as earning an income below the poverty threshold.
Population Estimates for Stanislaus County

According to the 2019 ACS, Stanislaus County’s current population is 543,194. There are 9 incorporated cities in Stanislaus County.

Table 1: Stanislaus County Population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Population by Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Percent of Population by Jurisdiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ceres</td>
<td>48,214</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughson</td>
<td>7,460</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modesto</td>
<td>212,616</td>
<td>39.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman</td>
<td>11,317</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakdale</td>
<td>22,936</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patterson</td>
<td>22,066</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riverbank</td>
<td>24,482</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turlock</td>
<td>72,904</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterford</td>
<td>8,877</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unincorporated Communities</td>
<td>112,322</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>543,194</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B01001)

As identified in Table 1 above, the City of Modesto is the largest incorporated city in Stanislaus County, accounting for 39.1% of the County’s total population. The City of Turlock is the second largest city, accounting for 13.4% of Stanislaus County’s total population, followed by the City of Ceres, which accounts for 8.9% of the County’s total population. Table 1 also provides a population total for Stanislaus County’s 22 unincorporated communities, which combined, account for 20.7% of the County’s total population. Table 1 and Figure 5 illustrate the current population breakdown for Stanislaus County.

Figure 5: Stanislaus County Population

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B01001)
Assessing Transit Dependency by Age (Population over 65)

The TDA identifies elderly populations to be potentially transit dependent. For the purposes of this section’s analysis, individuals considered to be elderly are people age 65 years or older. According to 2019 ACS estimates, there are 69,676 people identified as elderly in Stanislaus County, accounting for 12.8% of the County’s total population. The heaviest concentrations of elderly populations are in Stanislaus County cities with transit systems: 30,308 in Modesto, 9,584 in Turlock, and 4,628 in Ceres. Table 2 and Figure 6 break down the Stanislaus County population 65 years or older.

Table 2: Population over 65

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Population over 65 by Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Percent of Population over 65 by Jurisdiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ceres</td>
<td>48,214</td>
<td>4,628</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughson</td>
<td>7,460</td>
<td>968</td>
<td>13.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modesto</td>
<td>212,616</td>
<td>30,308</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman</td>
<td>11,317</td>
<td>1,318</td>
<td>11.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakdale</td>
<td>22,936</td>
<td>2,624</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patterson</td>
<td>22,066</td>
<td>2,035</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riverbank</td>
<td>24,482</td>
<td>2,562</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turlock</td>
<td>72,904</td>
<td>9,584</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterford</td>
<td>8,877</td>
<td>934</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unincorporated Communities</td>
<td>112,322</td>
<td>14,718</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>543,194</td>
<td>69,679</td>
<td>12.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B01001)

Figure 6: Population over 65

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B01001)
Assessing Transit Dependency by Disability (Disabled Population)

Persons defined as having a disability are considered part of the civilian non-institutionalized population. It is estimated that approximately 13.1% (71,011) of the total population within Stanislaus County are living with a disability, 31,325 of whom live in Modesto; while another 9,185 live in Turlock and 5,975 live in Ceres.

Table 3 and Figure 7 provide a breakdown of persons living with disabilities by jurisdiction in Stanislaus County.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Disabled Population by Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Percent of Disabled Population by Jurisdiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ceres</td>
<td>48,214</td>
<td>5,975</td>
<td>12.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughson</td>
<td>7,460</td>
<td>797</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modesto</td>
<td>212,616</td>
<td>31,325</td>
<td>14.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman</td>
<td>11,317</td>
<td>1,228</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakdale</td>
<td>22,936</td>
<td>2,367</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patterson</td>
<td>22,066</td>
<td>1,825</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riverbank</td>
<td>24,482</td>
<td>2,195</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turlock</td>
<td>72,904</td>
<td>9,185</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterford</td>
<td>8,877</td>
<td>1,320</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unincorporated Communities</td>
<td>112,322</td>
<td>14,794</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>543,194</strong></td>
<td><strong>71,011</strong></td>
<td><strong>13.1%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table S1810)

Figure 7: Disabled Population

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (S1810)
Assessing Transit Dependency by Income (Persons of Limited Means)

The 2019 ACS provides an estimated breakdown of individuals in Stanislaus County who are considered to be persons of limited means. The ACS data estimates that as of 2019, approximately 15.0% (81,415) of Stanislaus County’s population was identified as persons of limit means. Modesto and Turlock are the cities that have the largest populations of poverty, accounting for 31,901 and 11,218 respectively. Table 4 and Figure 8 further breakdown the estimated population by jurisdiction.

### Table 4: Persons of Limited Means

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Persons of Limited Means by Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Percent of Persons of Limited Means by Jurisdiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ceres</td>
<td>48,214</td>
<td>7,170</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughson</td>
<td>7,460</td>
<td>498</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modesto</td>
<td>212,616</td>
<td>31,901</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman</td>
<td>11,317</td>
<td>817</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakdale</td>
<td>22,936</td>
<td>2,789</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patterson</td>
<td>22,066</td>
<td>2,667</td>
<td>12.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riverbank</td>
<td>24,482</td>
<td>2,714</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turlock</td>
<td>72,904</td>
<td>11,218</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterford</td>
<td>8,877</td>
<td>1,729</td>
<td>19.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unincorporated Communities</td>
<td>112,322</td>
<td>19,912</td>
<td>23.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>543,194</td>
<td>81,415</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B17001)

### Figure 8: Persons of Limited Means

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B17001)
Transit Dependent Census Tracts

Figure 9 identifies the census tracts that have a higher probability of having populations that are transit dependent. The census tracts within the top 25 percent of any of the datasets (senior population, population of persons with a disability, and persons of limited means) were used to determine the areas that were more likely to contain transit dependent populations.

Figure 9: Transit Dependent Census Tracts (MAP)

As presented in Figure 9, census tracts that are more likely to contain the most transit-dependent populations are in the more urbanized cities of Modesto, Ceres, and Turlock. The less urbanized areas also likely to contain the most transit dependent populations such as the unincorporated areas around east and south of Hughson, south of Patterson, and areas surrounding Oakdale and Newman.

StanCOG will continue to update each year’s assessment to include all current and relevant data pertaining to the size and location of transit dependent groups within Stanislaus County.
Analysis of Transportation Services in Stanislaus County

At present, the Stanislaus Region’s public transit services are provided by four public transit operators:

- City of Modesto – Modesto Area Express (MAX) and Modesto Area Dial-A-Ride (MADAR)
- Stanislaus County – Stanislaus Regional Transit (StaRT) fixed-route, Shuttle, Dial-A-Ride, Commuter Bus, ADA Paratransit, and Medivan Services.
- City of Turlock – Turlock Transit and Dial-A-Ride
- San Joaquin Joint Powers Authority (SJJPA) – Amtrack San Joaquins

Starting July 1, 2021, MAX and StaRT will consolidate transit services to create the Stanislaus Regional Transit Authority (StanRTA). The City of Modesto and County of Stanislaus took action at their January 26, 2021, meetings to approve the Joint Powers Agency Agreement for the creation of the StanRTA. The StanRTA will assume responsibility for all transit operations and services currently provided by MAX and StaRT.

The following sections briefly describe the service area, routes, and general operations of the current public transit systems listed above.

**Modesto Area Express (MAX)**

**Figure 10: MAX Bus**

Source: City of Modesto
The City of Modesto operates the MAX, MADAR, Escalon Transit, and commuter buses. MAX currently serves the Cities of Modesto and Ceres and other areas outside the city limits with its 19 urban bus routes. MAX weekday transit services run Monday through Friday, beginning as early as 5:00 a.m. and ending generally at 11:00 p.m. MAX weekend service is provided as early as 7:00 a.m. and runs as late at 10:00 p.m. MAX provides a Sunday service that operates from 8:45 a.m. to 8:15 p.m. In addition to the urban routes, MAX provides weekday morning and evening commuter routes to and from the Dublin/Pleasanton Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) Station, Manteca/Lathrop Altamont Commuter Express (ACE) train station, and the Modesto Transit Center to the Manteca and Stockton Transit Centers.

Figure 11: CAT Merge with MAX via Route 44

On February 11, 2020, the Ceres City Council made the decision to turn transit operations over to the City of Modesto. This decision came as the city struggled to maintain and continued to see a decline in ridership. The City of Modesto absorbed the City of Ceres’ Ceres Area Transit (CAT) on July 1, 2020.

The MADAR system operates as a senior/disabled paratransit service to satisfy the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) for the City of Modesto transit system. MADAR operates from 4:45 am. to 11:00 p.m. Monday through Friday, 7:15 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. on Saturday, and 8:00 a.m. to 8:15 p.m. on Sunday.
Table 5 identifies the services provided by both the MAX and MADAR systems. Table 6 identifies MAX current fares.

### Table 5: MAX/MADAR Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Routes</th>
<th>Days</th>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Avg. Headway</th>
<th>Service Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Route</td>
<td>Route 21</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:45 AM 10:30 PM</td>
<td>15 min</td>
<td>Downtown Modesto Transit Center / Paradise &amp; Washington (Modesto HS)/ Sutter &amp; Rouse/ Paradise &amp; Carpenter/ First &amp; Sierra (Modesto HS)/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:45 AM 8:15 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:15 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 22</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 10:47 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/ McHenry &amp; Morris/ McHenry &amp; Orangeburg/ McHenry &amp; Rumble/ Standiford &amp; Tully/Vintage Faire Mall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:30 AM 9:15 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:52 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 23</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:15 AM 9:51 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/McHenry &amp; Morris/ McHenry &amp; Orangeburg/ McHenry &amp; Rumble/ McHenry &amp; Coral wood/ McHenry &amp; Kiernan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:15 AM 8:34 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:15 AM 7:10 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 24</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 6:54 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Scenic Drive &amp; Stanislaus Health Services Agency/ Wylie &amp; Oakdale/ Middleboro &amp; Eastridge/ Roselle &amp; Merle/Roselle &amp; Sylvan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No weekend route</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 25</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:15 AM 11:21 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/ La Loma &amp; Santa Barbara/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Routes</td>
<td>Days</td>
<td>Hours</td>
<td>Avg. Headway</td>
<td>Service Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Route</td>
<td>Route 26</td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:30 AM 9:31 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Miller &amp; El Vista/ Lincoln &amp; Yosemite/ Creekwood &amp; Claus (Johansen)/Amtrak Station/Orangeburg &amp; Oakdale/Orangeburg &amp; McHenry/Sisk &amp; Plaza Parkway/Vintage Faire Mall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 8:45 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 28</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 10:28 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/ Paradise &amp; Washington (Modesto HS)/Carpenter &amp; Maze (Central Catholic HS) /Maze &amp; ML King Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:30 AM 8:25 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Vintage Faire Mall/Kaiser Hospital/Gregori HS/Bacon &amp; Toomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:00 AM 6:25 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 6:53 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>No weekend route</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 29</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>5:45 AM 11:08 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Sonora &amp; Herndon/Hatch &amp; Herndon (Westbound)/Crows Landing &amp; School/7th&amp;Crows Landing/Herndon&amp; Hatch (Northbound)/Sonora &amp; Herndon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:45 AM 9:38 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:38 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 30</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 10:36 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Vintage Faire Mall/Dale &amp; Veneman/Rumble &amp; Conant/Mt. Vernon &amp; Prescott/Carver &amp; Orangeburg/College &amp; Coldwell/Downtown Transit Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:00 AM 9:25 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:40 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 31</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:15 AM 11:02 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Tully &amp; Coldwell/ Tully &amp; Orangeburg/Tully</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Routes</td>
<td>Days</td>
<td>Hours</td>
<td>Avg. Headway</td>
<td>Service Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fixed Route</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fixed Route</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:45 AM 8:37 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>&amp; Rumble (Davis HS)/Tully &amp; Standiford/Pelandale &amp; Prescott/Sisk &amp; Pelandale/Vintage Faire Mall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:15 AM 7:17 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 32</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>5:45 AM 10:35 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Scenic Drive &amp; County Health Services Agency/ Coffee &amp; Orangeburg/ Coffee &amp; Floyd/Coffee &amp; Sylvan/Mable &amp; Oakdale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:45 AM 8:39 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:39 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:15 AM 10:17 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/9th St. &amp; Coldwell/Blue Gum &amp; MJC West/ Carpenter &amp; Maze/ (Central Catholic HS)/California &amp; Panama/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:45 AM 9:47 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:30 AM 6:55 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 35 Escalon Transit (ETRANS)</td>
<td>Mon- Fri</td>
<td>8:12AM 4:45PM</td>
<td>3-5 hours</td>
<td>Paddock Mobile Home Park/California &amp; Jackson (Rite Aid Pharmacy)/ Downtown Park &amp; Ride Main &amp; Viking/Escalon Community Center/Escalon Bellota &amp; Yosemite/ McHenry &amp; Ullery/Kiernan &amp; McHenry/Kaiser Permanente (Dale &amp; Bangs)/Vintage Faire Mall (Dale &amp; Veneman)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:30 AM 10:08 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Vintage Faire Mall/Dale &amp; Veneman/Sisk &amp; Plaza Parkway/Carpenter &amp; Maze (Central Catholic HS)/ Beverly &amp; Paradise/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:30 AM 7:49 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FY 2021/22 STANCOG UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS ANALYSIS REPORT
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Routes</th>
<th>Days</th>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Avg. Headway</th>
<th>Service Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fixed Route</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 37</td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:30 AM 6:49 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Roselawn &amp; Tuolumne/ Downtown Transit Center</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:45 AM 10:35 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Vintage Faire Mall/Dale &amp; Veneman/Rumble &amp; Conant /McHenry &amp; Rumble/Sylvan &amp; Coffee/Oakdale &amp; Floyd/Oakdale &amp; Orangeburg/Oakdale &amp; Orangeburg/Oakdale &amp; Orangeburg/Oakdale &amp; Scenic/El Vista &amp; Miller/ Yosemite &amp; Santa Ana/ Downtown Transit Center</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:45 AM 8:35 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:45 AM 7:35 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 38</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 10:59 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Yosemite &amp; Santa Cruz/Empire &amp; Oregon/Yosemite &amp; Santa Ana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:30 AM 8:29 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:15 AM 6:40 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 41</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>9:15 AM 9:47 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Vintage Faire Mall/Vintage Faire Mall/Dale &amp; Veneman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>9:45 AM 9:14 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>9:45 AM 6:14 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>5:45 AM 11:08 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Crows Landing &amp; School/ CSA/Glenn &amp; Dallas/ Herndon &amp; Hatch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:15 AM 9:38 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:38 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 42</td>
<td>Formerly, Ceres Area Transit (CAT)</td>
<td>Mon - Sun</td>
<td>6:15AM 5:43 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Herndon Road &amp; Hatch Road/Hatch Road &amp; Richland Avenue/Mitchell Road &amp; Alphonse Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Routes</td>
<td>Days</td>
<td>Hours</td>
<td>Avg. Headway</td>
<td>Service Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MADAR</td>
<td>ADA Certified and Seniors</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>4:45 AM 11:00 PM</td>
<td>Varies</td>
<td>(Food-4-Less)/Sixth Street &amp; Magnolia Avenue/Blaker Road &amp; Hackett Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:15 AM 10:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td>MADAR provides paratransit services to the City of Modesto and other areas outside the city limits as shown on the MADAR service area Figure 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>7:30 AM 8:15 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commuter Service</td>
<td>MAX to Amtrak</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 10:36 PM</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/College &amp; Coldwell/Carver &amp; Orangeburg/Mt. Vernon &amp; Prescott/Rumble &amp; Conant/Vintage Faire Mall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:00 AM 9:25 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>8:45 AM 7:40 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MAX to ACE</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>3:30 AM 5:56 PM</td>
<td>Varies</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Vintage Faire Mall Park &amp; Ride/Lathrop ACE Station/Lathrop ACE Station/Vintage Faire Mall Park &amp; Ride</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MAX to BART</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>4:15AM 8:10 PM</td>
<td>Varies</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Sisk Road Orchard Supply /Dublin-Pleasanton BART Station/Dublin-Pleasanton BART Station/Sisk Road Orchard Supply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stockton Commuter</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:30 AM 7:20 PM</td>
<td>Varies</td>
<td>Downtown Transit Center/Vintage Faire Mall Park &amp; Ride/Manteca Transit Center/Stockton Transit Center</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Modesto Area Express, July 2020
### Table 6: MAX/MADAR Fares

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Rider Status</th>
<th>Single Day</th>
<th>7- Day</th>
<th>10-Ride Pass</th>
<th>31-Day Pass</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MAX</strong></td>
<td>Regular</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
<td>$15</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Age 4 and under are free only when accompanied by a parent or legal guardian.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>$1.50</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A valid ID is a school-issued photo ID card that includes current dates of enrollment or a CSU Stanislaus student ID card</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MJC Students</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Must show ID.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seniors 65+</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Driver may ask for proof of eligibility.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Disabled and Veterans</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Driver may ask for proof of eligibility.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Medicare Holders</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Driver may ask for proof of eligibility.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student Field trips</td>
<td>$.50</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|                  | Available to Preschool, Elementary, and Junior High School class field trips on a regularly scheduled fixed route bus. Trips must be prearranged and prepaid per student or accompanying adult. 
|                  | Call 209-521-1274 for details                                                |            |        |              |             |
|                  | All Day Passes                                                                | $4.00      | N/A    | N/A          | N/A         |
|                  | Half Fares – All day passes for Seniors                                        | $2.00      | N/A    | N/A          | N/A         |
| **MADAR**        | One Way                                                                       | $3.00      | N/A    | $30.00       | N/A         |

**Commuter Service**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Single</th>
<th>Round Trip</th>
<th>7- Day</th>
<th>20-Ride Pass</th>
<th>31-Day Pass</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MAX to ACE</strong></td>
<td>$3</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$42</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The majority of MAX routes connect to the Downtown Modesto Transit Center which provides a connection point to other regional and interregional transit services such as StaRT, Greyhound, taxicabs, and the Modesto Area Express Commuter Service to BART and ACE. The Center is also designed to accommodate a future ACE rail stop in Modesto. The route map for fixed route services provided by MAX is presented in Figure 12 below. The MADAR service area is illustrated in Figure 13.

**Figure 12: MAX Fixed Routes**

Source: Modesto Area Express, July 2020
Figure 13: MADAR Service Area

Source: Modesto Area Express, July 2020
Stanislaus Regional Transit System (StaRT)

Figure 14: StaRT Bus

Stanislaus County Public Works Transit Division operates StaRT, Stanislaus County’s public transit system. StaRT provides seven fixed-route transit services, ADA Complementary Paratransit Services associated with fixed routes, three intercity demand response/curb-to-curb transportation (Shuttle) services, four Dial-A-Ride Services, Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) Commuter service that travels from Patterson/Turlock to Dublin/Pleasanton, and a Medivan Service which provides transportation to Bay Area Medical Facilities. All Dial-A-Ride services are provided on a time and space availability basis. Table 7 identifies the various transit operations provided by StaRT. Table 8 identifies StaRT’s current fares.

As identified, StaRT provides regional service to the majority of Stanislaus County as well as the BART station in Dublin/Pleasanton. Connections to Interregional Rail, Bus Services, and the transit systems operated by Ceres, Modesto, Turlock, and Merced are also provided by StaRT.
Table 7: StaRT Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Routes</th>
<th>Days</th>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Average Headway</th>
<th>Service Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 10</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:15 AM 10:22 PM</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
<td>Modesto, Turlock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 15</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:25 AM 9:44 PM</td>
<td>Varies 1-2 hrs</td>
<td>Modesto, Ceres, Keyes, Turlock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>6:30 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>Varies 1-2 hrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Route</td>
<td>Route 40</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:15 AM 9:12 PM</td>
<td>Varies 40 min-1 hr</td>
<td>Modesto, Grayson, Westley, Patterson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:00 AM 7:45 PM</td>
<td>2-3 hrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 45 West</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:37 AM 9:21 PM</td>
<td>1 hr 45 min</td>
<td>Gustine, Newman, Crows Landing, Patterson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>6:20 AM 7:56 PM</td>
<td>3 hrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 45 East</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:15 AM 8:18 PM</td>
<td>1 hr 45 min</td>
<td>Patterson, Turlock,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:15 AM 6:08 PM</td>
<td>3 hrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 60</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:00 AM 9:43 PM</td>
<td>Varies 45 mins - 1 hr 45 min</td>
<td>Modesto, Riverbank, Oakdale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>6:15 AM 8:35 PM</td>
<td>2 hrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Route 61</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:15 AM 7:45 PM</td>
<td>2 hrs</td>
<td>Modesto, Empire, Waterford, Hickman, Hughson, Ceres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>7:30 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Routes</td>
<td>Days</td>
<td>Hours</td>
<td>Average Headway</td>
<td>Service Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demand Response/Shuttle</td>
<td>Turlock-Modesto Shuttle</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>7:00 AM 5:30 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Provides service during specific windows of time in Modesto, Ceres, Keyes, Turlock, Denair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:30 AM 3:45 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eastside Shuttle</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 4:30 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Provides service during specific times of the day in Modesto, Riverbank, Oakdale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:00 AM 3:45 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waterford-Modesto Shuttle</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>7:25 AM 3:25 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Provides service during specific times of the day in Waterford, Oakdale, Empire, Hickman, Hughson, Ceres, Modesto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td>Newman Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>7:00 AM 6:00 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Newman, Gustine, Crows Landing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:00 AM 4:30 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patterson Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>7:00 AM 6:00 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Patterson, Westley, Grayson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>8:00 AM 4:30 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Oakdale Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:30 AM 5:30 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Oakdale Area Only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>Service provided on the Eastside Shuttle</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Riverbank Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>6:30 AM 5:30 PM</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td>Riverbank Area Only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>Service provided on the Eastside Shuttle</td>
<td>Varies by Demand</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Routes</td>
<td>Days</td>
<td>Hours</td>
<td>Average Headway</td>
<td>Service Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commuter Service</td>
<td>Commuter to BART</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>4:15 AM - 6:45 PM Reverse Commute Available Daily Round Trips</td>
<td>Turlock, Patterson, Dublin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medivan Service</td>
<td>Bay Area Medical Facilities</td>
<td>Mon-Thu</td>
<td>Departs Modesto Transit Center at 6:30 AM</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Livermore VA Hospital, Bay Area Medical Facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA Paratransit</td>
<td>ADA Service</td>
<td>Mon-Fri</td>
<td>5:00 AM - 10:00 PM Varies by Demand</td>
<td>ADA Paratransit Service within ¾ mile each fixed route</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>6:15 AM - 9:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Stanislaus Regional Transit, August 2017

Table 8: StaRT Fares

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fare Types</th>
<th>General Public</th>
<th>Senior Disabled (Valid ID Required)</th>
<th>Student (Valid ID Required)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Route - One Ride</td>
<td>$1.80</td>
<td>$0.90</td>
<td>$1.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 - Ride Card (Fixed Route Only)</td>
<td>$32.00</td>
<td>$16.00</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 - Day Pass (Unlimited Rides, Includes StaRT Transfers on Fixed Routes Only)</td>
<td>$52.00</td>
<td>$26.00</td>
<td>$48.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - Day Pass (Unlimited Rides Includes StaRT Transfers on Fixed Routes Only)</td>
<td>$3.80</td>
<td>$1.90</td>
<td>$3.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfers to MAX, CAT &amp; CDAR, Turlock Transit and eTrans</td>
<td>$0.25</td>
<td>$0.25</td>
<td>$0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fare Types</td>
<td>General Public</td>
<td>Senior Disabled (Valid ID Required)</td>
<td>Student (Valid ID Required)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dial-A-Ride*</td>
<td>$2.00 + $1.50 Out of Area</td>
<td>$1.50 + $1.50 Out of Area</td>
<td>$1.75 + $1.50 Out of Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Reservation Required)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shuttle Service</td>
<td>$3.00 + $1.50 Out of Area</td>
<td>$2.50 + $1.50 Out of Area</td>
<td>$3.00 + $1.50 Out of Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Reservation Required)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commuter Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One way</td>
<td>Round Trip</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$13.00</td>
<td>$16.00</td>
<td>$170.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA Passenger / Companion (Personal care attendant rides free)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-Way</td>
<td>10-Ride Tickets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$3.60</td>
<td>$36.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medivan (Bay Area Medical Facilities) Reservations Required</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient One way</td>
<td>Attendant One way</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$12.50</td>
<td>$5.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Stanislaus Regional Transit, 2019
Figure 15 below shows StaRT’s current system map, which includes fixed route, Demand Response Shuttle, Dial-A-Ride, Commuter, and Non-Emergency Medical Services provided by StaRT in Stanislaus County.

Figure 15: StaRT Fixed Route

Source: Stanislaus Regional Transit, 2017
Turlock Transit

The City of Turlock operates both fixed route and Dial-A-Ride services for the local community. Turlock Transit provides six fixed-routes (Routes 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6), each with 30 to 35-minute headways. Each route departs simultaneously from the Roger K. Fall Transit Center located at 1418 N. Golden State Blvd. at the intersection of N. Golden State Blvd. and Hawkeye Ave. General weekday hours of operation are from 6:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m., and Saturday service is provided from 9:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. on all six fixed routes.

Figure 16: Turlock Transit bus at the Roger K Falls Transit Center

Turlock Transit also provides Dial-A-Ride service to both the City of Turlock and the unincorporated community of Denair. Within the fixed-route service area, Dial-A-Ride operates primarily as an elderly/disabled paratransit service. However, Dial-A-Ride service outside the primary fixed-route service area is open to the general public. The operating hours for Dial-A-Ride are identical to fixed-route service hours of operation. The Denair Amtrak Station also provides connectivity to regional rail services.

Table 9 presents the services provided by Turlock Transit. Table 10 identifies the current Turlock Transit fares.
### Table 9: Turlock Transit Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Routes</th>
<th>Days</th>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Average Headway</th>
<th>Service Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Route</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 1</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>30-35 min</td>
<td>Transit Center/Countryside &amp; Monte Vista/Monte Vista &amp; Dels/Geer &amp; Minnesota</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 2</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>30-35 min</td>
<td>Transit Center/Geer &amp; Tuolumne Monte Vista &amp; Dels/Countryside &amp; Mte Vista Crossings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 3</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>30-35 min</td>
<td>Transit Center/Christoffersen &amp; Mountain View/Chistoffersen &amp; Village Circle/Delbon at Emanuel Medical Center (EMC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 4</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>30-35 min</td>
<td>Transit Center/Colorado &amp; Lyons/Alpha &amp; Cottonwood/Colorado &amp; Canal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 5</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>30-35 min</td>
<td>Transit Center/Central Park/Linwood &amp; Lander/Golden State &amp; Minerva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 6</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>30-35 min</td>
<td>Transit Center/Tully &amp;Main/West &amp; South/Soderquist &amp; Canal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sat</td>
<td></td>
<td>9:00 AM 7:00 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dial-A-Ride</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>Mon - Fri</td>
<td>6:00 AM 9:00 PM</td>
<td>Varies</td>
<td>Dial-A-Ride covers the city of Turlock and community of Denair, with western borders at Washington Rd., Tegner Rd., and Walnut Rd., a northern border at W. Barnhart Rd. and Taylor Rd., southern borders at Greenway Ave. and Linwood Ave., and eastern borders at</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 10: Turlock Transit Fares

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fixed Route</th>
<th>Single trip</th>
<th>Day Pass</th>
<th>31-Day Pass</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regular</td>
<td>$1.50</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discounts, Seniors 65+, Persons with disabilities, Medicare cardholders, honorably discharged military veterans</td>
<td>$0.75</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>$15.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students (K-12) with a valid student ID</td>
<td>$1.20</td>
<td>$1.60</td>
<td>$24.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children (0-5) - Limit 2 per paying adult</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dial A Ride</th>
<th>Single Trip</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Seniors (65+) or persons with disabilities</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Public</td>
<td>$4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary School Students (Children under 6 ride free)</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group of 2</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group of 3</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Turlock Transit, March 2021
The Turlock Transit’s fixed route map is presented in Figure 17, below. Figure 18 identifies the service area for Turlock Dial-A-Ride.

**Figure 17: Turlock Transit Fixed Route**

Source: Turlock Transit, March 2017
Figure 18: Turlock Transit Dial-A-Ride Service Area

Source: Turlock Transit, March 2017
Amtrak – San Joaquins

Figure 19: Modesto Amtrak Station

In 2012, Assembly Bill 1779 enabled regional government agencies to form the San Joaquin Joint Powers Authority (SJJPA) to take over the administration and management of the existing San Joaquin Amtrak Rail Service (Amtrak San Joaquins). The Amtrak San Joaquins is an intercity passenger rail service connecting Stanislaus County to points north and south of the County via rail and bus connections, stopping in Modesto and Turlock.

For more information on the San Joaquins services provided in the region, please visit https://sjjpa.com/.

MOVE Stanislaus

Figure 20: MOVE Stanislaus

StanCOG designated MOVE as the CTSA for Stanislaus County and has been in operations since 2010. As assigned, the CTSA role is to coordinate with and offer support to the region’s existing public transit and social service agencies in an effort to meet the transit needs of Stanislaus County’s senior and disabled communities. MOVE currently offers three programs to the Stanislaus Region: travel training, the BRIDGES Volunteer Driver Program, and the VetsVan Volunteer Driver program. In addition, MOVE assists with the coordinating/scheduling trips for Volunteers on the Go (Vogo), a volunteers-based ride-hailing service, pilot project in the San Joaquin and Stanislaus County.

MOVE also assists other human services agencies with coordination and technical assistance and conducts ADA Paratransit Eligibility interviews throughout Stanislaus County on behalf of the four public transit agencies.
Move’s travel training program teaches participants how to independently utilize existing fixed-route transit services throughout Stanislaus County. Trainers work with program participants on a one-on-one basis or in small groups to train them on how to use multiple public transit systems. The travel training program provides individuals with the knowledge and ability to use a transit option that is less costly than paratransit and improves their independence and mobility, allowing them to participate in work and/or day programs.

The BRIDGES Volunteer Driver Program is designed to provide specialized transportation services, including door-to-door and door-through-door service, to persons who are unable to use public transit or Stanislaus County's existing volunteer driver programs. The program provides service to those individuals who require transportation assistance in accessing everyday needs, including medical appointments, grocery shopping, and social activities. Riders schedule trips with volunteer drivers at their convenience. Mileage reimbursement is provided for qualified trips as determined by the program’s policies.

The VetsVan Volunteer Driver program provides rides for homebound veterans who have no other way to get to medical appointments. Volunteers drive vans that are provided by the program and travel to VA Stockton, VA Livermore, VA Palo Alto, and other VA approved facilities in Northern California. Some rides are provided in the local area if other sources of local transportation are unavailable. VetsVan is prepared to accommodate mobility devices and try to meet the needs of disabled Veterans. Two wheelchair accessible vans have been donated and are driven by volunteers who are scheduled by MOVE.

On March 1, 2018, MOVE launched a regional ADA Paratransit Eligibility process on behalf of the four transit agencies. In-person interviews are conducted at four sites throughout Stanislaus County. This process has simplified the eligibility process for residents as they only need to apply to the paratransit service once to use any of the four systems in Stanislaus County. A key to this process is that there are no longer any paper applications required, applicants are assisted throughout the eligibility process and provided a free trip to/from their eligibility interview. Once approved, an identification card is issued, and the individual is eligible to make reservations to ride any of the four paratransit systems.

Future goals and objectives of MOVE include continued outreach to local human service agencies in order to provide more door-through-door, volunteer, and other travel assistance programs that benefit the region’s senior and disabled populations who cannot be served by public transit. To further this goal, MOVE partnered with a UC DAVIS’ research team in a California Air Resources Board sponsored pilot program to implement the Valley Flex Project.

Valley Flex improves the efficiency of existing transit services within local transit agencies through a smartphone trip planning application and by filling in transit gaps in selected communities in San Joaquin and Stanislaus County. This pilot has two components, the smartphone application, VAMOS, and the volunteer ride-hailing service, Volunteers on the Go or Vogo. VAMOS lets you plan trips in San Joaquin and Stanislaus Counties by providing turn-by-turn navigation. Vogo provides rides to those who cannot get to essential destinations by available public transit services, need access to a transit stop, or are taking a public transit trip that takes longer than one and a half hours using traditional fixed route. The Vogo pilot project includes the Riverbank area north to the Stanislaus County line and Escalon, Lathrop, and Manteca in San Joaquin County. MOVE Stanislaus provides assistance in scheduling these trips, recruiting volunteer drivers, conducting background checks, and driver training.
Adequacy of Existing Services

StanCOG staff meets with the SSTAC on a monthly basis to evaluate the adequacy of the region’s current transit operations and further identify any UTNs that may or may not be Reasonable to Meet. In addition, StanCOG staff regularly meets with MOVE to discuss issues discovered through travel training requests and comments made at the numerous public events at which MOVE represents local transit. StanCOG staff also attends transit operator’s public meetings and discusses transportation issues when meeting with various social service agencies. The region’s public transit operators and social services agencies continue to adjust their services to feasibly meet any identified UTN throughout the year.

Farmworker Vanpool Program Analysis

StanCOG entered into an agreement to become a member of the California Vanpool Joint Powers Authority (CalVans) on March 1, 2018. The CalVans Farmworker Vanpool Program is available to the public and provides qualified agricultural workers with safe, affordable vans they can use to drive themselves and others to work. Employer participation is free and employees with a valid Class C driver’s license and clean driving record are eligible as drivers. The vans are equipped for safety with a Global Positioning System to locate the van in case of an emergency, are fully insured, include roadside safety equipment, and all regular maintenance is covered by CalVans.

StanCOG staff coordinates with the region’s stakeholders, transit operators, and social service providers to identify if any future needs in the region are present and determine feasible means to address those needs. As part of the CalVans Board, StanCOG participates in Board Meetings and Technical Advisory Committee meetings to ensure the regions needs are being met. StanCOG continues to seek funding opportunities to expand the program and promote the CalVans services to the public.
Resources Used in the UTN Assessment Process

In addition to coordinating with the SSTAC’s member agencies, staff annually reviews the most recent transit/transportation documents and census data available to understand the scope and adequacy of existing transit services within the region. Table 11 provides a matrix identifying the primary documents that are reviewed as part of staff’s assessment of the region’s transit needs. A short synopsis of the information contained in these documents is also provided.

**Table 11: Resources**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Synopsis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>U.S. Census Bureau</td>
<td>The Census provides data regarding the population and demographic characteristics of the Stanislaus County Region and its nine incorporated cities. Demographic data from the Census can be used to model the location of specific age, racial, income, or other socioeconomic groups that may be dependent on transit services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016 StanCOG Public Transit – Human Services Coordination Plan</td>
<td>As required by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) to be eligible for certain funding sources, the StanCOG Public Transit – Human Services Coordination Plan was updated in 2016. Utilizing extensive stakeholder outreach, including interviews, focus groups, and workshops, the Plan provides prioritized strategies for coordinating transportation services to meet mobility needs and gaps identified within the Stanislaus Region. This information further assists staff in affirming the transportation concerns that arise through the public comments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY 2020/2021 UTN Assessment Report</td>
<td>This document provides an assessment of the previous year’s UTNs. A comparison of the current year’s report is made with the previous year’s report to better understand the region’s current transit needs and determine whether previous needs may have been addressed within the last year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018 Regional Transportation Plan and Sustainable Communities Strategy</td>
<td>This plan identifies the transportation and transit goals, policies, and objectives, established by both StanCOG and all of its member agencies, for the Stanislaus County Region. The information contained within this document is considered as part of any future transportation planning process conducted by StanCOG, including the UTN assessment process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Development Act, July 2018</td>
<td>This document establishes the requirements for StanCOG’s UTN assessment process and transit cost sharing capability. In addition, it provides information regarding the funding of regional transit projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Synopsis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local transit operator’s public brochures and websites</td>
<td>The information obtained from these resources assists StanCOG staff with analyzing the current operations and services provided by the region’s public transit operators. This information is also important when determining whether UTNs are Reasonable to Meet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly transit reports prepared by local transit operators</td>
<td>These reports are provided by transit agencies at the monthly SSTAC meetings coordinated by StanCOG staff. Meeting with the agencies on a monthly basis help staff determine the adequacy of the region’s current transit systems. With this information, staff is able to further assist transit agencies by providing them with information regarding funding for additional operations that could lead to improved services.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: StanCOG, 2021
Collection and Analysis of UTNs

During the FY 2021/22 UTN assessment, staff received a total of 17 public comments regarding potential UTNs in the region. Based on the StanCOG Policy Board’s adopted definition of UTN and Reasonable to Meet, no UTNs that are Reasonable to Meet were identified. The following sections provide an overview of the public outreach process and an analysis of the comments received.

Public Outreach

In accordance with TDA regulations, StanCOG is required to conduct at least one public hearing to receive potential UTNs. For the FY 2021/22 UTN Assessment, StanCOG conducted one public hearing. The public hearing was conducted via teleconference on Wednesday March 17, 2021, due to the COVID-19 stay at home order.

Pursuant to TDA requirements, a minimum of a 30-day public comment period commenced on Wednesday, February 17, 2021, and concluded on Monday, March 22, 2021, at 4:00 p.m. The Public Hearing notice was circulated in the local newspapers. The local newspapers include:

- Ceres Courier
- Huston Chronicle
- Modesto bee
- Oakdale leader
- Patterson Irrigator
- Riverbank News
- Turlock Journal
- Waterford News
- West Side Index

Spanish language interpretation services were available for those chose to submit comments in Spanish.

StanCOG staff conducted extensive public outreach to provide opportunities for potential transit-dependent populations to discuss their transit needs.

Below is a summary of the outreach activities conducted prior to the March 17, 2021, hearing in Modesto:

- StanCOG staff, in coordination with MAX/MADAR, StaRT, Turlock Transit, and MOVE, hosted virtual public town hall meetings that allowed for live public interactions and transit discussions.
- Staff presented for the City of Patterson Senior Board of Directors meeting to solicit comments on the UTNs.
- Public hearing announcements, with a link to the StanCOG UTN online survey, online comment form, and UTN webpage were electronically distributed to community-based organizations, community groups, local businesses, and the local transit partners. The local transit operators posted flyers on their fixed route and Dial-a-Ride vehicles.
- Staff announced the date of the public hearing and outreach workshops to the StanCOG SSTAC, CAC, TAC, MFC, and Policy Board at their October 2020 and March 2021 meetings.
• A web based SurveyMonkey was shared with StanCOG standing committees, local transit operators, partner agencies and posted on StanCOG’s FaceBook page and webpage.

• A Quick Response (QR) code for the public survey was shared with StanCOG standing committees, local transit operators, partner agencies and posted on StanCOG’s FaceBook page and webpage to permit access to the survey via smartphone in English and Spanish.

• A public comment form which is accessible through the StanCOG website year-round was shared with the StanCOG standing committees, Policy Board, partnered agencies, and with the transit agencies in the region.

As part of each year's UTN assessment process, staff coordinates with MOVE, public transit operators, and social service agencies on the SSTAC to identify and assess any potential UTNs. A dedicated webpage on StanCOG's website provides the public with general information regarding the UTN Process, and an online electronic version of the UTN Form (in both English and Spanish) is accessible on the website and can be submitted to StanCOG via regular mail service, or email. This webpage and email are regularly maintained and updated to ensure that anyone with a potential UTN can contact StanCOG staff anytime throughout the year. The StanCOG UTN online survey was also available on StanCOG’s website throughout the assessment period.

Analysis of Comments

Table 12 provides an analysis of the 17 comments received during the FY 2021/22 UTN Assessment.

Table 12: Analysis of Comments Received during the FY 2021/22 Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Requesting service from Ceres to Silgan Can Company, Saturdays at 5AM</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>Saturday Service to Silgan Can Company is provided via StaRT Route 61, from the Hatch Rd. &amp; Herndon Rd stop to the Modesto Downtown transit center and transferring to MAX Route 25. Riders depart at the Riverside Dr &amp; Miller Ave stop Head south on N Riverside Dr toward Yosemite Blvd for about .5 miles. Total trip time is between 46 min.- 1 hr. 53 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Requesting late and early service</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>This is a request for additional trips of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. This comment has been relayed to all transit operators and noted as part of the public record.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Would like to get from 1800 Oakdale Rd, Modesto to Sprouts on McHenry on just one bus. Route 24 bus route used to provide this service.</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>MAX provides a direct connection via Route 25 from Oakdale Ave. &amp; Orangeburg Rd stop to the Orangeburg Ave &amp; McHenry Ave stop. Total trip time is 27 minutes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 4 | I need to get to Fresno and Sacramento often for work. MAX has a morning commuter bus to Stockton, but that doesn’t connect to the Stockton to Sacramento commuter service. After losing Amtrak service - the connectivity to Sacramento would be very helpful. Also, it is difficult to get to the Bay Area and the coast through connecting bus services. For regional travel, my only issue is I don’t feel safe walking home from the bus stop at night when it’s dark. More often, I’ll take my car to avoid being on public transit when the sun goes down. | Not an Unmet Transit Need | The Amtrak San Joaquins provides a direct connection from Modesto to:  
- Sacramento via San Joaquins Route 703 towards Sacramento. Total trip time is 1 hr 38 minutes.  
- Fresno via San Joaquins Route 702 towards Fresno. Total trip time is 1 hr. 49 min.  
- The Bay Area via San Joaquins Route 711 and depart in Emeryville. Rider will have arrived in in San Francisco Area. Total trip time is 2hrs. 27 min. |
<p>| 5 | Requesting more ADA certified bus stops. “I'm a handicap person in a wheelchair. Most of the bus stops in the city aren't ADA certified.” | Not an Unmet Transit Need | This comment pertains to a facility improvement request and is not an unmet transit need pursuant to the StanCOG Policy Board’s definitions. Each of the transit systems has a program to improve bus stops as access and funds allow. This comment has been relayed to all transit operators and is noted as part of the public record. Riders with requests for ADA improvements of specific stops may also contact their transit system directly. |
| 6 | Request for stops on StaRT bus Route 15 on Service Rd &amp; Mitchell Rd (both sides) | Not an Unmet Transit Need | This is a request for additional bus stops of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. This comment has been relayed to the StaRT transit operator and noted as part of the public record. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In addition, StaRT and MAX have consolidated transit services and will</td>
<td></td>
<td>In addition, StaRT and MAX have consolidated transit services and will be conducting an operational analysis of the route network to provide short- and long-term efficiency improvements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Request for stops on StaRT bus Route 61 on Yosemite Blvd &amp; Santa Cruz Ave</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>This is a request for additional bus stop of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. This comment has been relayed to the transit operators and noted as part of the public record. In addition, MAX Routes 37 and 38 make a stop at Yosemite Blvd &amp; Santa Cruz Ave.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Request for stops on StaRT bus Route 61 on Mitchell Rd &amp; Whitmore Ave</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>This is a request for additional bus stops of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. This comment has been relayed to the StaRT transit operator and noted as part of the public record. In addition, StaRT and MAX have consolidated transit services and will be conducting an operational analysis of the route network to provide short- and long-term efficiency improvements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Requesting time adjustment to the following StaRT routes:</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>This is a request for route modification of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. This comment has been relayed to the StaRT transit operator and noted as part of the public record. In addition, StaRT and MAX have consolidated transit services and will be conducting an operational analysis of the route network to provide short- and long-term efficiency improvements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Route 10 needs to leave Central Park at :02 past the hour instead of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|    | on time for :45 past the hour buses.  
- Route 15 needs to leave 5 minutes earlier from the Modesto Transit Center from 7:35am to 4:35pm times (for example, it would leave at 7:30am and 4:30pm instead) so it can show up 5 minutes earlier for :00 or :30 past the hour buses.  
On Monday-Friday, have Route 61 leave at :10 past the hour instead of :15 past the hour from 8:15am to 6:15pm times (for example, it would leave at 8:10am and 6:10pm instead). | | operator and noted as part of the public record. Service requests for this area will be considered in the anticipated consolidation of the MAX and StaRT service. In addition, StaRT and MAX have consolidated transit services and will be conducting an operational analysis of the route network to provide short- and long-term efficiency improvements. |
| 10 | Requesting changes to StaRT Route 60.  
- Have Route 60 go on Orangeburg Ave instead of Briggsmore Ave to McHenry Ave (includes Saturday).  
- Route 60 needs bus stops on College & Orangeburg going to Riverbank and Oakdale (College & Granger bus stop gets taken out) and on McHenry Ave & Orangeburg Ave both ways (on McHenry Ave going to Riverbank and Oakdale and on Orangeburg Avenue going to the Modesto Transit Center). | | This is a request for route modification of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. This comment has been relayed to the StaRT transit operator and noted as part of the public record. Service requests for this area will be considered in the anticipated consolidation of the MAX and StaRT service. In addition, StaRT and MAX have consolidated transit services and will be conducting an operational analysis of the route network to provide short- and long-term efficiency improvements. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Requesting a bus stop on Hawkeye &amp; Geer for Turlock Transit Route 15.</td>
<td><strong>Not an Unmet Transit Need</strong></td>
<td>This is a request for additional bus stop of an existing route. As such, it does not meet the Policy Board’s approved definition of an unmet need which specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service. Currently, Turlock Transit’s Route 2 currently stops on Geer Rd &amp; Hawkeye Ave by Crowell Elementary (on Geer Rd.). Turlock Transit’s Routes 1, 3, and 4 currently stop on Hawkeye Ave &amp; Geer Rd across the street from Walgreens (on Hawkeye Ave.). This comment has been relayed to the Turlock Transit operator and noted as part of the public record.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 12 | Requesting DAR service in Empire. “Catholic Charities type service would be better serving both these folks but at the time their services were fairly limited. Hopefully for those outside DAR area Catholic Charities or reduced fee/voucher for Taxi is available ?” | **Not an Unmet Transit Need** | Pursuant to the StanCOG Policy Board’s adopted definition for Reasonable to Meet, any new service developed to meet a UTN shall not cause the system of which it is a part of to fail to meet the systemwide performance standards. Previous fixed route service in the Empire area did not meet farebox recovery ration performance standards. Therefore, this is not Reasonable to Meet per the StanCOG Policy Board's adopted definitions as it would cause failure of the system to meet performance criteria. Currently,  
- StaRT Route 61 and Demand Response Shuttle serves the Empire area.  
- MOVE’s BRIDGES volunteer driver program offers a service to assist qualified individuals when public transit cannot fill their needs.  
- Catholic Charities received Measure L funds to expand transportation services for all residents within Stanislaus County, this includes Empire. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The expansion includes transportation services for medical appointments and grocery shopping Monday-Saturday until 5:30 pm. In Addition, MOVE will begin a Fare Assistance program for low-income seniors, individuals with disabilities, and veterans. This pilot program funded through Measure L will provide bus tickets to those who are able to ride public transit but are unable to afford the tickets. This program may be able to assist some riders with Dial-A-Ride as well. Service requests for this area will be considered in the anticipated consolidation of the MAX and StaRT service. This comment has been relayed to all transit operator and noted as part of the public record.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Requesting DAR service in Salida</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>MAX Route 28 serves Modesto to Salida Monday through Friday. As such, complementary Dial-a-ride service is available to its residents. This comment has been relayed to the Modesto transit operator and noted as part of the public record. In addition, MOVE’s BRIDGES volunteer driver program offers a service to assist qualified individuals when public transit cannot fill their needs. MOVE will begin a Fare Assistance program for low-income seniors, individuals with disabilities, and veterans. This pilot program funded through Measure L will provide bus tickets to those who are able to ride public transit but are unable to afford the tickets. This program may be able to assist some riders with Dial-A-Ride as well. This comment has been relayed to all transit operator and noted as part of the public record.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Comment from Area Agency on Aging &amp; Veterans Affairs</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>MOVE’s BRIDGES volunteer driver program offers a service to assist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>staff – the most common comment we receive is the need for grocery shopping transportation – seniors that no longer drive want a ride to the store for grocery shopping. Public transit and DAR don’t meet this need well, as there are often restrictions on grocery push carts and otherwise it is difficult for seniors to carry the groceries to a fixed route stop etc. The DAR system shared ride system often results in long waits periods due to unpredictability of other rider demands. So, there is definitely a need for more grocery shopping rides similar to Catholic Charities service. They pick up small group on regular basis (scheduled day/specific store) and wait for them while they shop then return them home. Many seniors rely on family or friends, neighbors, and at times have to pay people to take them or shop for them and can be vulnerable to be taken advantage of. Many seniors would also pick up commodities as well, if not limited by transportation/difficulty and cost of DAR for such rides.</td>
<td>qualified individuals when public transit cannot fill their needs. Catholic Charities received Measure L funds to expand transportation services for all residents within Stanislaus County, this includes Empire. The expansion includes transportation services for medical appointments and grocery shopping Monday-Saturday until 5:30 pm. In addition, MOVE will begin a Fare Assistance program for low-income seniors, individuals with disabilities and veterans. This pilot program funded through Measure L will provide bus tickets to those who are able to ride public transit but are unable to afford the tickets. This program may be able to assist some riders with Dial-A-Ride as well. This comment has been relayed to all transit operator and noted as part of the public record.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Comment from Area Agency on Aging &amp; Veterans Affairs staff – “although DAR can work fairly well for medical appointments there is no flexibility to add on a stop to a nearby lab or pharmacy and that flexibility of course can make all the difference for a senior who may otherwise be faced with another long day of</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>This comment pertains to services provided outside of the public transportation system. This comment will be relayed to the appropriate agency and noted as part of the public record. Catholic Charities received Measure L funds to expand transportation services for all residents within Stanislaus County, this includes Empire. The expansion includes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>DAR drop off and then long wait for return ride. If Catholic Charities type door-to-door service were more readily available, and advertised, I’m confident use and demand for the service would skyrocket. Expansion of that service or addition of additional door-to-door provider, in my option would greatly enhance the transportation services for older adults in our county.”</td>
<td></td>
<td>transportation services for medical appointments and grocery shopping Monday-Saturday until 5:30 pm. In addition, MOVE’s BRIDGES volunteer driver program offers a service to assist qualified individuals when public transit cannot fill their needs. Furthermore, MOVE will begin a Fare Assistance program for low-income seniors, individuals with disabilities, and veterans. This pilot program funded through Measure L will provide bus tickets to those who are able to ride public transit but are unable to afford the tickets. This program may be able to assist some riders with Dial-A-Ride as well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>The Program Coordinator at Day Out ADHC Merced reported that her clients are experiencing long wait times for ADA paratransit services for medical appointments.</td>
<td>Not an Unmet Transit Need</td>
<td>Although the Day Program is located outside of the Stanislaus service area, the clients live with in Stanislaus County. The MOVE Program Manager was available to provide information about the programs available that could assist individuals who had a service need.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>The letter submitted by the California Rural Legal Assistance, Inc. can be found as part of Appendix B including the analysis and explanation of the comments.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: StanCOG, 2021

**UTN Findings**

As shown in Table 12, no comments were identified as UTNs. Many of the comments were related to issues that were operational in nature (as any transit comment, complaint, or issue which may have merit but does not rise to the level of (meet the definition of a UTN). All comments are shared with the transit operators and are taken into consideration by each of the agencies as part of their daily route planning. All of the region’s operators regularly monitor services and adjust routes and schedules to improve quality of service and to accommodate requests, where feasible. Any future changes to the policies or schedules to accommodate these service requests will be made at the sole discretion of the transit operators.

In other cases, commenters were unaware of existing transit services that are available in the region to meet their needs. StanCOG will continue to work with the local transit operators and MOVE to promote a greater awareness of the existing transit services.

While these comments do not meet the definition of an unmet transit need per the Policy Board’s adopted definitions, these comments have been provided to the transit operators for their consideration in future service planning.
Concluding Remarks

It is important to note that the UTN assessment process is an on-going effort throughout the year. StanCOG staff will continue to coordinate with the SSTAC, MOVE, and the region’s public transit and social service providers to improve the mobility and meet the transit needs of residents in the Stanislaus Region. There are and will continue to be challenges with achieving improved mobility throughout the region. Financial conditions and higher operating costs, paired with a lack of volunteer drivers, makes it difficult for some social service agencies to provide transit services that cannot already be accommodated by the region’s public transit systems. Farebox ratio requirements established by the TDA have also led to fare increases and service reductions for some of the region’s public transit agencies.

Improving mobility is one of StanCOG’s goals as a regional transportation planning agency. StanCOG encourages an on-going and open dialogue between all of region’s transit agencies in order to address these mobility challenges cooperatively. Additionally, the SSTAC and MOVE Stanislaus provide StanCOG with valuable resources when conducting public outreach and increasing awareness of the existing transit services available in the region. Staff will continue to support these efforts and provide all available assistance to the region’s transit and social service agencies with the goal of achieving greater mobility for all residents in the Stanislaus Region.

Comments Received Prior to the April 2021 Policy Board Meeting

This report is being circulated to the SSTAC and MFC for a recommended motion and to the TAC and CAC for discussion prior to the StanCOG Policy Board’s review and adoption of the report’s findings on April 21, 2021. The section below summarizes the comments provided by and actions taken by these committees.

Social Services Transportation Advisory Council Comments (SSTAC)

The Draft FY 2021/22 UTN Analysis and findings were circulated to and discussed by the SSTAC at their April 6, 2021 meeting. No issues were identified and the SSTAC unanimously approved the Draft FY 2021/22 Unmet Transit Needs Identification and Analysis Report and finding that there are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet for FY 2021/22.

Citizens Advisory Committee Comments (CAC)

The Draft FY 2021/22 UTN Analysis and findings were circulated to and discussed by the CAC at their April 7, 2021 meeting. No issues were identified and there were no objections to the finding that there are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet for FY 2021/22.

Technical Advisory Committee Comments (TAC)

The Draft FY 2021/22 UTN Analysis and findings were circulated for discussed by the TAC at their April 6, 2021 meeting. There were no objections to the finding that there are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet for FY 2021/22.

Management and Finance Committee Comments (MFC)

The Draft FY 2021/22 UTN Analysis and findings were circulated to and discussed by the MFC at their April 7, 2021 meeting. No issues were identified and the MFC unanimously approved the Draft FY 2021/22 Unmet Transit Needs Identification and Analysis Report and finding that there are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet for FY 2021/22.
Appendices
Population Density by Census Tract

Figure 21: Population Density by Census Tract

Figure 21 presents population density per square mile in Stanislaus County by census tract using the American Community Survey (ACS) 5-year estimate for the years 2015-2019.

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B01001)
Map of Population Over 65 by Census Tract

Figure 22: Population Over 65 by Census Tract

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table S0103)

Figure 22 presents the percentage of the population over 65 in Stanislaus County by census tract using the ACS 5-year estimate for the years 2015-2019.
Map of Persons Living with a Disability by Census Tract

Figure 23: Persons Living with a Disability

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table S18101)

Figure 23 presents the percentage of persons living with a disability in Stanislaus County by census tract using the ACS 5-year estimate for the years 2015-2019.
Map of Persons of Limited Means by Census Tract

Figure 24: Persons of Limited Means

Figure 24 presents the percentage of persons of limited means in Stanislaus County by census tract using the ACS 5-year estimate for the years 2015-2019.

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2015-2019 ACS (Table B17001)
Q1
Do you currently use public transit?  
Yes

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3.

Q2
Walk

Q3
How often do you ride transit?

Q3
1-4 times a month

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently?

Q4
Free or reduced fares

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g. just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination?

Q5
Yes- I have to transfer to another bus system for my regular trips (on most systems this would mean a rider is charged an additional 25 cents for an intersystem transfer)

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can't get there using transit?

Q6
No

Q7
If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:

Q7
Respondent skipped this question
Q8

If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:

Respondent skipped this question

Q9

If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:

Respondent skipped this question
Q1
Do you currently use public transit? Yes

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3.

Q3
How often do you ride transit? 4-7 times a week

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently? Other (please specify): I already ride the Max to BART transit bus as frequent as possible

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g. just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination?

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can't get there using transit? No
Q7
If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:

Q8
If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:

Q9
If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:
Q1
Do you currently use public transit? No

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3.

Personal Vehicle

Q3
How often do you ride transit?

1-6 times a year

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently?

Other (please specify): Late and early service

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g., just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination?

No - I use just one bus system for my regular trips

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can’t get there using transit?

Yes
Q7
If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:

I would like to travel to/from:
Ceres / Silgan can company

On the following day(s) of the week:
Saturdays

At the following time(s):
5am

Q8
If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:
N/A

Q9
If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:

First and Last Name
Age
City/Town
Email Address
Phone Number
Q1
Do you currently use public transit?

Yes

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3.

Respondent skipped this question

Q3
How often do you ride transit?

1-3 times a week

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently?

More frequent service,
More coverage area / more destination points,
Free or reduced fares ,
Increased routes in more neighborhoods,
More benches and shelters at bus stops

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g. just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination?

Yes- I have to transfer to another bus system for my regular trips (on most systems this would mean a rider is charged an additional 25 cents for an intersystem transfer)

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can't get there using transit?

Yes
Q7

If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:

I would like to travel to/from:

On the following day(s) of the week:
At the following time(s):
Please provide any additional comments:

1800 Oakdale Road to Sprouts on McHenry on just one bus.
Any or all days of the week.
Any or all times.
The 24 bus route used to provide this service.

Q8

If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:
For the most part, MAX is serving my needs.

Q9

If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:
First and Last Name
Age
City/Town
Email Address
Phone Number
Q1
Do you currently use public transit? Yes

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3. Personal Vehicle

Q3
How often do you ride transit? 1-4 times a month

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently? More frequent service, More coverage area / more destination points, Increased routes in more neighborhoods

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g. just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination? Yes- I have to transfer to another bus system for my regular trips (on most systems this would mean a rider is charged an additional 25 cents for an intersystem transfer)

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can't get there using transit? No
Q7

If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:

Q8

If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:

I need to get to Fresno and Sacramento often for work. Max has a morning commuter bus to Stockton, but that doesn't connect to the Stockton to Sacramento commuter. After losing that Amtrak service - the connectivity to Sacramento would be very helpful. Also, it is difficult to get to the Bay Area and the coast through connecting bus services. For regional travel, my only issue is I don't feel safe walking home from the bus stop at night when it's dark. More often, I'll take my car to avoid being on public transit when the sun goes down. Thank you all for your work.

Q9

If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:

First and Last Name

Age

City/Town

Email Address
Q1
Do you currently use public transit?
Yes

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3.
Respondent skipped this question

Q3
How often do you ride transit?
1-3 times a week

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently?
Other (please specify):
ADA certified bus stops

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g. just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination?
No

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can't get there using transit?
Respondent skipped this question

Q7
If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:
Q8
If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:
I'm a handicap person in a wheelchair. Most of the bus stops in the city aren't ADA certified.

Q9
If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:
First and Last Name
Age
City/Town
Email Address
Phone Number
Q1
Do you currently use public transit?

No

Q2
If the answer to question #1 was No, please answer the following question then skip to question 9. What is your primary mode of travel? If your answer to question #1 was Yes, please continue to question 3.

Personal Vehicle

Q3
How often do you ride transit?

Respondent skipped this question

Q4
What would make you ride transit more frequently?

Respondent skipped this question

Q5
Some riders can complete their trips using a single bus service (e.g. just MAX, StaRT, Ceres, or Turlock Transit) while other riders have to transfer to another system to complete their trip. Do the trips you regularly take require you to use more than one bus system to get to your destination?

Respondent skipped this question

Q6
Are there places you need to access in Stanislaus County but you can't get there using transit?

Respondent skipped this question

Q7
If your answer to question #6 was Yes, please tell us about the places you need to go in Stanislaus County, but cannot reach by public transit:
Q8
If you would like, please provide additional information about your transit needs below:

Q9
If you would like a follow up on this survey, please provide your contact information below:

Respondent skipped this question

Respondent skipped this question
Just some feedback —

DAR service Area:
We don’t often get calls but as you probably recall we had a senior from Empire share her frustration that DAR no longer could pick her up for regular bowling activity in the past, and a woman in Salida that was a customer was shut off my DAR when routes changed. Seems that Catholic Charities type service would be better serving both these folks but at the time their services were fairly limited. Hopefully for those outside DAR area Catholic Charities or reduced fee/voucher for Taxi is available?

Shopping – the most common comment we receive is the need for grocery shopping transportation – seniors that no longer drive want a ride to the store for grocery shopping. Public transit and DAR don’t meet this need well, as there are often restrictions on grocery push carts and otherwise it is difficult for seniors to carry the groceries to a fixed route stop etc. The DAR system shared ride system often results in long waits periods due to unpredictability of other rider demands. So there is definitely a need for more grocery shopping rides similar to Catholic Charity service. They pick up small group on regular basis (scheduled day/specific store) and wait for them while they shop then return them home. I was last told however they were limiting to existing clients? Many seniors rely of family or friends, neighbors and at times have to pay people to take them or shop for them and can be vulnerable to be taken advantage of...Many seniors would also pick up commodities as well, if not limited by transportation/difficulty and cost of DAR for such rides.

Lab work/pharmacy etc... I also have had feedback that although DAR can work fairly well for medical appointments there is no flexibility to add on a stop to a nearby lab or pharmacy and that flexibility of course can make all the difference for a senior who may otherwise be faced with another long day of DAR drop off and then long wait for return ride. If Catholic Charities type door to door service were more readily available, and advertised, I’m confident use and demand for the service would skyrocket. Expansion of that service or addition of additional door to door provider, in my option would greatly enhance the transportation services for older adults in our county.
1) Route 10 needs to leave Central Park at :02 past the hour instead of :05 past the hour so it can show up to the Transit Center on time for :45 past the hour buses.
2) Route 15 needs to leave 5 minutes earlier from the Modesto Transit Center from 7:35am to 4:35pm times (for example, it would leave at 7:30am and 4:30pm instead) so it can show up 5 minutes earlier for :00 or :30 past the hour buses.
3) On Monday-Friday, have Route 61 leave at :10 past the hour instead of :15 past the hour from 8:15am to 6:15pm times (for example, it would leave at 8:10am and 6:10pm instead).

Slight map change and bus stop changes for Route 60:
1) Have Route 60 go on Orangeburg Ave instead of Briggsmore Ave to McHenry Ave (includes Saturday).
2) Route 60 needs bus stops on College & Orangeburg going to Riverbank and Oakdale (College & Granger bus stop gets taken out) and on McHenry Ave & Orangeburg Ave both ways (on McHenry Ave going to Riverbank and Oakdale and on Orangeburg Avenue going to the Modesto Transit Center).
There also needs to be a bus stop on Hawkeye & Geer for Route 15.

There's bus stops that need to be added to StaRT buses:
1) Route 15 needs bus stops on Service Rd & Mitchell Rd (both sides). I've seen people get on there even without a bus stop present.
2) Route 61 needs a bus stop on Yosemite Blvd & Santa Cruz Ave and another bus stop on Mitchell Rd & Whitmore Ave.

Time changes for StaRT buses:
Hi Edith,

We would like to reach out to you regarding a Unmet Needs transit meeting held on 2/25/2021:

On 2/25/2021 at approximately 10:00am, [redacted] and [redacted] met with [redacted] Program Coordinator from Day Out Merced US SS.1 Merced.

- [redacted] shared she works with individuals with cognitive delay and seniors with dementia diagnosis in Merced and Stanislaus Counties.
- [redacted] advised she has approx. 6 clients currently in Stanislaus county which are having a delay in pick up time with ADA Paratransit. [redacted] reported long wait time returning home from medical appts.
- [redacted] was able to provide some insight into the turnaround window time (before and after trip) and also offered some education on ADA / public transit.
- [redacted] reviewed current Transportation programs currently available in Stanislaus County.
  - Shared interested in referrals to Travel Training for higher functioning individuals.
  - Has MOVE's contact information to explore any further transportation questions in future.
- Please note:

May we add this to the StanCOG Unmet Transit needs 2021?

Please let me know if you have any further questions.

Thank you.
March 22, 2021

Via electronic mail to: unmettransitneeds@stancog.org
Edith Robles, Assistant Planner
Stanislaus Council of Governments
1111 I Street, Suite 308
Modesto, CA 95354

Re: FY 2021/2022 Stanislaus County Unmet Transit Needs Assessment

Dear Ms. Robles,

California Rural Legal Assistance, Inc. (CRLA) is a non-profit law firm that has served disadvantaged rural communities throughout California for over fifty years. CRLA submits the following comments in response to Stanislaus Council of Government’s (StanCOG) request for public comments on the FY 2021/2022 Unmet Transit Needs Assessment.

Addressing the needs of low-income minority communities is mandated by state and federal laws that prohibit recipients of federal and state funding from implementing policies, practices or activities that disproportionately burden these communities, deny them equitable access to services, or uphold pre-existing conditions that are inequitable.

We provide comments on the Unmet Transit Needs Assessment in an effort to ensure all residents have equal access to the benefits of public transit and transportation funding.

I. The Definition of “Unmet Transit Needs” is Too Restrictive to Adequately Identify and Address Transit Needs in Stanislaus County

The Unmet Transit Needs Assessment (UTN) process occurs annually and allows a jurisdiction to shift funding from transit projects into road projects if it finds no unmet transit needs exist within the jurisdiction. StanCOG’s current definition of “Unmet Transit Needs” is too restrictive to adequately identify and address transit needs in Stanislaus County. For example, StanCOG’s definition requires that the need be one “which has not either been programmed to receive [California Transportation Development Act (TDA)] funds or implemented under existing programs that currently receive TDA funds.”1 Further, StanCOG’s UTN definition states that “adding more frequent transit stops to a specific location” would not count as an unmet transit need. This definition effectively restricts TDA funds from being used for improvements or expansions of existing programs, rendering it ineffective at addressing transit needs.2

The unworkability of StanCOG’s UTN definition is evidenced by the FY 2020/21 UTN assessment findings.3 Of the total 71 comments provided during the assessment period, only four of the comments received met the StanCOG Policy Board’s adopted definition of a UTN. And even those four comments

---

2 Except for the narrow exception of “lifeline services” as explained at p. 6-7.
were ultimately denied because they were determined not reasonable to meet. Therefore, of the 71 comments received, none were able to meet StanCOG’s analysis.

Specifically, many commented on the need for increased routes of existing services due to excessive wait times, increased transit operations during peak commute hours, insufficient seating and services to accommodate the needs of people with limited mobility, and the high cost of Dial-A-Ride services. StanCOG denied nearly half of the 71 comments on grounds that it was either “an operational issue” regarding existing transit facilities or services, that the unmet need definition “specifically excludes additional trips of an existing service,” or that the comment involved “minor operational improvements or changes.”

Clearly, the current UTN analysis is too inflexible for StanCOG to make necessary adjustments or improvements to existing services and should be amended. TDA funds must be made flexible to allow for improvements and expansions of existing programs to ensure existing programs can adapt to cover unmet transit needs. Even if a UTN request does not meet StanCOG’s definition, transportation agencies should provide alternative options to meet the needs of these communities.

Furthermore, the current definition of “reasonable to meet” also serves as an impediment for residents. The definition states that “any service developed to meet a UTN shall not cause the system of which it is part of to fail to meet the system-wide farebox recovery ratio performance standards.” Funding allocation, farebox recovery requirements, and geographic dispersion disproportionately limit transit options for rural communities into the Modesto area. Funding allocations need to be more flexible, multimodal, and equitable to low-income, minority, and rural needs communities. As such, StanCOG should reconsider its definitions and analyze whether they are barriers to StanCOG adequately identifying and addressing unmet transit needs.

Alternative transportation options need to be considered for these communities, especially small communities that simply cannot meet the traditional ridership requirements to meet the farebox recovery targets. “The fact that an identified transit need cannot be fully met based on available resources shall not be the sole reason for finding that a transit need is not reasonable to meet.” StanCOG must think outside traditional bus route services for non-traditional, small communities.

II. Low-Income Rural Communities in Stanislaus County Continue to Experience Unmet Transit Needs

Low-income working families, particularly racial minority communities, rely on public transportation not only to get to work, but to access critical resources required to maintain employment, childcare providers, medical care facilities, school, and job training sites. The cost-preventative nature of cars and their associated costs including insurance, registration, gas, maintenance, and the like, increases reliance on public transportation for low-income communities.

5 2020/21 UTN Report at 3.
6 PUC § 99401.5(c).
The 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy established the goal to “promote equitable access to opportunities by ensuring all populations share in the benefits of transportation improvements and are provided a range of transportation and housing choices.” However, at present, public transit in Stanislaus is not accessible or reliable for low-income communities and rural communities located on the far outskirts of resource-rich centers like Modesto and Turlock. Current transit services are time-consuming and too infrequent to serve the demand. The County’s skyrocketing housing costs, lack of affordable housing, and rapidly increasing population are forcing many low-income families to move further out to remote areas of the County where housing is slightly more affordable. StanCOG must recognize and get ahead of these trends and address the growing needs of these communities.

Failure to address these needs raises serious civil rights and equal protection concerns since minority residents are disproportionately burdened by both the need for transit services and access to reliable transportation services. Communities without access to quality and reliable public transit are prevented from reaching economic opportunities and essential services, thereby further entrenching concentrated poverty and segregation.

A. The 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy identifies significant rural unmet transit needs and those needs should be identified in the UTN report.

During the 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy planning process, StanCOG solicited public participation by way of workshops, advisory committee presentations, community-based outreach events, online surveys, and public hearings. A variety of stakeholders that work directly with low-income and rural communities in Stanislaus County participated. The public comments received identified many of the transit and transportation deficiencies of Stanislaus County residents. These unmet transit needs should be identified in the UTN report and analyzed accordingly, unless they have already been addressed, since StanCOG has been given notice of their existence.

The following comments and excerpts provided by stakeholders and community members accurately reflect some of the conditions in rural communities in Stanislaus County.

- the need to prioritize planning collaboration between all agencies to address the need for active transportation infrastructure including sidewalks, bike paths, and lighting in unincorporated areas.
- “the transit system does not reach enough low income or minority areas of the county”
- “West Main [Street] from Turlock to Patterson continues to be impacted due to commute traffic to Patterson’s industrial parks.”

B. CRLA’s Client Communities Experience Ongoing Unmet Transit Needs

---

8 2018 RTP Appendix B, at pp. 10, 12, 20, 22, 48, and 49.
9 2018 RTP Appendix B, Letter 15 at p. 60.
10 2018 RTP Appendix B, Letter 9 at p. 33.
CRLA works with several communities in Stanislaus County, including the unincorporated communities. The needs of these communities remain unaddressed and insufficiently served by public transit. The comments provided below include several unmet transit needs recently raised to us by our client communities.

i. **The Community of Parklawn**

Parklawn is an unincorporated island off East Hatch Road in south Modesto. It has historically been underserved by public transit. For years, residents have voiced the need for sidewalks as a critical unmet transit need throughout the Parklawn neighborhood. There are many children that everyday must walk to school or to the school bus stop in the road due to the lack of sidewalks. Residents with limited mobility, such as those who rely on wheelchairs, are also forced to use the streets due to the lack of sidewalks.

Not only do sidewalks provide safe access to school for children and people with limited mobility, they create opportunities for people to exercise, reduce reliance on single-occupancy vehicles, and reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Active transportation options, such as sidewalks are critically important in low-income, minority communities and immigrant communities where car ownership rates may be lower and unsafe streets deter the use of active transportation. StanCOG should make a plan to fund this long-standing need and work with Parklawn residents to help identify high pedestrian traffic areas to prioritize.

ii. **The Communities of Empire and Hughson**

Empire and Hughson are unincorporated communities located east of the City of Modesto. Many residents rely on public transportation to access employment and services in Modesto. At present, StaRT Route 61 is the only public transportation option for communities traveling between Modesto, Empire, Waterford, Hickman, Hughson, and Ceres. Despite this, Route 61 is assigned only one bus, resulting in very limited scheduling and passengers must often wait over two hours to catch the next bus. Worse, Modesto Junior College students that rely on Route 61 for transportation to classes are unable to take any evening courses because the final bus from Modesto leaves at 6:15pm on weekdays. This is particularly challenging for students that work during the day and must take classes at night.

These challenges create significant strain on those riders commuting for work, school, medical appointments, and other needs. Such disadvantages make using Route 61 impracticable, which in turn leads to low ridership despite the great need for usable transit options. StanCOG should consider these issues and ensure that low ridership of fixed route services does not serve as a singular basis for finding that an unmet transit need is not reasonable to meet as it would cause failure of the system to meet performance criteria.\(^1\)

For example, in the FY 2020/2021 UTN Assessment, three of the four public comments determined to meet the standard of an unmet need were related to Ceres Area Transit bringing service back to the Whitmore Oaks Senior Apartments.\(^2\) StanCOG determined that the three comments were not reasonable to meet because “previous fixed route services in these areas resulted in low ridership and were eliminated in an

---

\(^1\) 2020/21 UTN Report at 3.
effort to preserve Ceres Transit” and therefore, to bring service back would “cause the system of which it is a part of to fail to meet the system-wide farebox recovery ratio performance standards.”\(^\text{13}\)

As explained above, low ridership may indicate the need for increased service and StanCOG should work with transit agencies and the affected communities to assess and fill these gaps rather than eliminate service. If a request does not meet the farebox recovery ratio, StanCOG should offer alternative options, such as MOVE’s BRIDGES volunteer driver program, ride share, and on-demand alternatives among others.

In addition, Spanish-language service is insufficient to meet the communities’ needs. Many residents along Route 61 are monolingual Spanish speakers who disproportionately bear the burden of poor transit services. In Empire, approximately 40% of the population speak Spanish. Most StaRT bus drivers do not speak Spanish, making travel very difficult for those with limited English proficiency.

Dial-A-Ride services are also very difficult to access for non-English speakers because the service is not well advertised, and often one only learns of the service by way of referral from a social services provider. This is an unmet transit need that StanCOG must address. Recipients of federal dollars must ensure that language is not a barrier to those seeking to access services. StanCOG should make a plan to advertise Dial-A-Ride services to non-English speaking communities to ensure that all residents are able to benefit from the service.

CRLA’s client communities also raised concerns about the StaRT Route 61 bus stop at the intersection of Yosemite Boulevard and Claus Road. Specifically, residents are concerned with the dangerous proximity of the bus stop to the train tracks; that there is no wheelchair accessible sidewalk ramp; and that the bus stop sign lacks necessary information including route direction, time schedule, or informational phone number. Additional concerns include the need for bus stop shelters at every stop for protection from inclement weather and an insufficient number of seats available for people with disabilities on StaRT buses.

StanCOG should identify these concerns as unmet transit needs and allocate funds to increase seat accommodations for riders with limited mobility and construct bus stop shelters at each stop, and improve the conditions and accessibility of the Yosemite Boulevard and Claus Road bus stop by installing a wheelchair sidewalk ramp and including linguistically appropriate and necessary travel information.

### iii. Unincorporated Communities Along StaRT Route 45E Between Patterson and Turlock

Another UTN is additional transit stops at Mountain View and other unincorporated communities that are passed by along StaRT Route 45E between Patterson and Turlock. These small communities have no available public transportation options. StaRT Route 45E is the only public transit that passes through the communities but does not have any bus stops on the 14 mile stretch along West Main Avenue.

The UTN report should acknowledge the need for transit services in areas that exist on the periphery of existing transit options. The strict service boundaries followed by StaRT result in peripheral communities

\(^{13}\) 2020/21 UTN Report at 3.
being unserved. StanCOG should work with agencies to expand service boundaries or offer flexibility in coverage to fill service gaps without requiring new routes to be developed.

CRLA appreciates the opportunity to provide these comments. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to reach out to one of the contacts listed below.
We are in receipt of your letter dated March 22, 2021. Thank you for taking an active interest in the Fiscal Year 2020/21 Unmet Transit Needs (“UTN”) Assessment and submitting comments to the Stanislaus Council of Governments (StanCOG). Each of the comments contained in the letter are addressed below.

I. Comment: “The Definition of “Unmet Transit Needs” is Too Restrictive to Adequately Identify and Address Transit Needs in Stanislaus County.

Analysis of the unmet transit needs is a yearly process required by the Transportation Development Act (TDA) to identify unmet transit needs that may exist within the region and determine if the needs are, or are not, reasonable to meet before StanCOG, as the transportation planning agency, funds any allocation for other non-transit projects, such as streets and roads within the region. Although no funds are being re-directed or allocated for other non-transit purposes in the region, StanCOG continues to conduct extensive public outreach to allow for public comments and feedback throughout the year.

The StanCOG Policy Board last adopted definitions for “unmet transit needs” and “reasonable to meet” via Resolution 19-14 at its October 23, 2019 meeting. The StanCOG Policy Board requires that these definitions be updated, at a minimum, every 5 years. Given your comments and the changes to the transit services in the region since the definitions were last adopted, the Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (“SSTAC”) will be asked to provide input and make a recommendation on the current unmet transit needs criteria. The SSTAC meets monthly at 10:00 a.m. on the first Tuesday of every month and meetings are open to the public.

While the current definition of “Unmet Transit Need” excludes some aspects of a transit operator’s day to day operations, there is recognition the comments and requests received are valid and important. All comments received through the unmet transit needs analysis are provided to the transit operators and are taken into consideration by each of the transit agencies. The region’s transit operators regularly monitor services and adjust routes and schedules to improve quality of service and to accommodate requests, where feasible.
April 13, 2021

As the regional transportation planning agency, StanCOG does not have jurisdiction over the day-to-day transit operations, which includes routine schedule changes, increases in the transit route services, new transit amenities, etc. However, the transit operators have an active role in the UTN outreach that is conducted and take the comments into consideration during their transit route planning process.

II. Comment: Low-Income Rural Communities in Stanislaus County Continue to Experience Unmet Transit Needs

StanCOG works closely with the transit agencies to help address the needs of all communities in the region, especially those unincorporated areas in the region.

A. Comment: The 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy Identifies Significant Unmet Transit Needs and Those Needs Should Be Identified in the UTN Report.

During the Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy ("RTP/SCS") process, a number of outreach activities were conducted, and comments were received from the public. The comment contained in your letter states the “public comments received identified many of the transit and transportation deficiencies of Stanislaus County residents. These unmet transit needs should be identified in the UTN report and analyzed accordingly, unless they have already been addressed, since StanCOG has been given notice of their existence.” The RTP/SCS serves as the region’s blueprint for future transportation improvements and investments; the UTN process focuses on current transit services.

While the RTP, similar to the UTN, includes public input gathered through outreach efforts, which is critical as it helps the region prioritize the needs and requests of the region, such comments are not incorporated in the UTN as the UTN is updated on a yearly basis and does not consider any previous comments or outreach conducted. However, any comments received by StanCOG, at any time, which pertain to public transit are relayed to the transit operators. Based on comments received as part of the RTP/SCS outreach efforts, funding was prioritized to assist in facilitating the expansion of the Altamont Commuter Express (“ACE”) through Stanislaus County down to Ceres, and for the improvements to the Downtown Modesto Transit Center which include expanding the lobby, relocating and remodeling public restrooms, installation of an electronic LED Board showing real-time route information and other notifications, exterior paint and repair, and additional exterior lighting.

B. CRLA’s Client Communities Experience Ongoing Unmet Transit Needs

i. The Community at Parklawn.

The need to improve pedestrian pathways is one that StanCOG recognizes and continues to work with each of the jurisdictions to seek federal and state funding that may help address this concern. StanCOG supported the passage of Measure L in 2016. Measure L provides the ½ cent sales tax that provides additional funding for transportation...
improvement projects including, but not limited to: fixing potholes and maintaining streets; improving emergency response; providing safe routes to schools; providing seniors, veterans and disabled shuttle services; and improving safety and reducing traffic congestion. Over the course of the 25-year life of Measure L, it is anticipated that approximately $480,150,000 will be used to repair and refurbish local streets and roads.

**ii. The Communities of Empire and Hughson**

Throughout the last few years, the unincorporated community of Empire has experienced several changes in the level of transit services provided and voiced concerns about the lack of transit services. StanCOG staff was able to seek state funding to conduct a Community Needs Assessment to better understand the needs of rural communities in the region. The Community Transportation Needs Assessment will be a community-driven study supported by robust public engagement that will assess transportation needs in two select areas of Stanislaus County’s unincorporated Disadvantaged Communities, which includes Empire. The needs assessment project will begin in Summer 2021 and StanCOG staff will continue to seek additional funding, as it becomes available, to further analyze other communities in the region.

**iii. Unincorporated Communities along StaRT Route 45E Between Patterson and Turlock**

The comment regarding no available public transportation options between Patterson and Turlock has been relayed to the transit operator. While operational comments are not considered an unmet transit need under StanCOG’s adopted definitions, StanCOG does work closely with the transit operators to improve the transit system and fill service gaps, where feasible. For example:

1. In FY 2018/19 comments were received that transit is too costly and that bus passes should be cheaper. While this was not considered a UTN reasonable to meet under StanCOG’s definitions, the comment was recognized as a concern in the community. As such, the transit operators were able to seek additional state funding through the Low Carbon Transit Operations Program (“LCTOP”) to implement Regional Free Fares during certain times of the year. LCTOP has been a steady funding source and has provided a series of free fare days throughout the last three fiscal years. To continue the project and provide residents with free fares for FY 2021/22, StanCOG has taken the lead on the project this year. StanCOG staff is working with the transit operators in the region to continue the project for FY 2021/22. Funding through this program is limited and varies from year to year, which limits the days that free fares are available. For fiscal year 2021/2021, it has been proposed that LCTOP funding be used to provide free fares for the month of July 2021, Holiday Rides from December 12-22, 2021, Go Green Week from March 13-19, 2022 and Earth Day on April 22, 2022.

2. Comments that request transit amenities such as shelters, shade, benches etc., provide
the transit operators with valuable information about some of the challenges riders are facing. The transit operators can further analyze these requests and meet some of these needs, if feasible, during the next fiscal years capital planning process. For example, in 2019 the City of Modesto added bus stop shelters on 7th street and Crowns Landing for Route 29, 9th Street and River Road for Route 29, Coffee Rd & Fairmont Ave for Route 32, amongst several other improvements. Turlock transit will also be adding an additional 20 bus stop shelters along its routes in FY 2021/22.

3. During the FY 2020/21 UTN process, a rider commented the Modesto Area Express (MAX) Transit Center is not open at 6:00AM when the Medivan service leaves. While this was not a UTN under StanCOG’s definition, the MAX Transit Operator was able to address the concern. The Transit center now opens the doors at 5:45AM to allow riders to use the restroom before the Medivan service leaves at 6:00AM.

4. During the FY 2020/21 UTN process, a rider suggested 2020 Census Data Volunteers should be granted free rides on all transit services in the county. The transit operators were able to incorporate this into the Regional Free Fares Day for all residents in the County. Given the national pandemic, voting was mostly conducted by mail for the year 2020 but this idea will be considered by the transit operators for future funding projects.

StanCOG understands the challenges the transit operators face in meeting the state-wide mandate for the farebox-recovery ratio and the impact that has on the communities and the transit services that are available. In 2018, StanCOG, with support from its state lobbyist, Gus Khouri, took Senate Bill (SB) 903 to the California Legislature for consideration of a reduction to the required farebox-recovery ratio for the Stanislaus Region. The bill was approved by the Governor on July 16, 2018.

While SB 903 provides temporary relief, StanCOG recognizes the challenges of transit operators will extend beyond SB 903. A statewide TDA reform effort began in 2018 and StanCOG is part of the state-wide task force created to evaluate the TDA law to better serve the needs of the region moving forward. More information on this reform effort can be found by visiting: https://caltransit.org/news-publications/publications/transit-california/transit-california-archives/2019-editions/march/tda-revisited/.

As a result of SB 903, StanCOG also initiated a Transit Efficiency and Innovations Study in 2018. The study recommended full transit consolidation and the creation of a new transit authority. The City of Modesto and County of Stanislaus acted in January 2020, to consolidate services to create the Stanislaus Regional Transit Authority (“StanRTA”). StanRTA will take over operations starting July 1, 2021 and will conduct a region-wide study to examine how to improve transit services.

This study will examine current services being provided and will outline suggested transit service and operational improvements.
April 13, 2021

As identified herein, StanCOG is charged with federal and state mandates, some of which are unfunded, to help identify and prioritize future transportation improvements and investments as well as assessing if current transit needs are being addressed. While StanCOG conducts outreach and distributes funding to facilitate these processes, it does not have the authority to make decisions over day-to-day transit operations. However, StanCOG staff does work cooperatively with the transit operators in identifying solutions and alternative funding sources to address comments received.

Thank you for providing these comments and allowing us the opportunity to respond. Should you wish to discuss further, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Monica Streeter
General Counsel
Stanislaus Council of Governments
mstreeter@stancog.org

Rosa De León Park
Executive Director
Stanislaus Council of Governments
rpark@stancog.org